For the Enrichment of Jewish Thought

Recent Research on Women in Israel: Politics, Academic and Motherhood

Gendering Politics: Women in Israel by Hanna Herzog Lanham, MD: Lexington Books

Hurdles in the Halls of Science: The Israel Case by Nina Toren Lanham, MD: Lexington Books


A Review Essay by Esther Fuchs

These books explore the social status of Jewish women in Israel. Hanna Herzog's book is a study of the patterns of female leadership in local politics. It offers a convincing analysis of the obstacles and pitfalls encountered by women who enter local politics in Israel. I devote much greater space for this work not only because of the detailed and thorough research work that informs it but also because of the qualitative scope of the book. Toren finds that academic women lag behind their male counterparts despite their greater visibility in the 1990s. Finally, Susan Martha Kahn studies groups of women who seek reproductive technologies in Israel.

Hanna Herzog’s Gendering Politics: Women in Israel examines the role of women in Israeli politics. In principle, it confirms what other studies on Israeli women’s participation in political life have found: that women continue to play a marginal role in the nation’s political life. Despite women’s successful struggle for the vote in the 1920s, during the Yishuv period under the British Mandate, formal equality has not necessarily produced pragmatic results. Israel’s multiparty system has not induced a larger representation of women. In spite of the well-known exception of Golda Meir, women’s representation in the Knesset has remained between 7 and 9 percent. Local government is often perceived as the political arena most suited for women and yet, Herzog finds that women’s participation in this framework does not differ much from other political frameworks.

In her introduction, Herzog presents the following questions as central to her research: What makes the structure of local government politically distinctive? To what extent does this create possibilities for women to enter local government? What difficulties confront them? She also emphasizes here the gendered division of the public and private spheres as the main reason women are kept in the margins of Israel’s political life.

Chapter One, “Women in Local Politics,” demonstrates that women’s representation in local governments is lower than in the Knesset and in political parties. The situation of women in Israel is unfavorable when compared with local governments elsewhere. Compared to Sweden’s 38.4 percent, in Israel only 8.5 percent of local representatives are women. The social profile of the woman who is successfully elected to discharge public office on the local level suggests that she is, on average, better educated than her male colleagues on the local council. Her family’s economic situation is kept in the margins of Israel’s political life.

Chapter Two, “Women and Politics: The Private/Public Split,” argues that the division between private and public, which is usually taken for granted, is an ideological political distinction that serves as a basic cultural mechanism to exclude women from politics. The gulf in the private and the public becomes a basic organizing principle of everyday life and a central shaping force of gender identity. This Western middle class division isolates women, consigning a woman to her home-and-castle and rendering her incapable of taking part in shaping the political world according to her own needs and priorities.

Chapter Three, “Role Conflict as an Ideology,” contends that most women who enter politics tend to postpone their careers until they feel they are released from their maternal duties. Most women in local politics tend to conform to the Israeli norms that encourage families and emphasize the mother’s importance in the children’s upbringing and education. Single women are discouraged from entering politics, based on the perception that it is better to have the more conformist women in the male bastions of power (p. 65). This chapter argues that for men the family role is not perceived as central, while women who enter local politics take the family into consideration and will organize their political schedules accordingly. “The ideology of role divisions according to gender does not permit them to say what women can say: that domestic duties take precedence” (p. 77). Yet, the notion that women enter politics only after completing their “private” obligations is fallacious. Most women devote many years to volunteer activities or to party politics much before formally entering the public arena. This period of quiet preparation is not usually taken into account and it usually becomes absorbed into the realm of private activities.

Chapter Four, “Have Your Cake and
Eat It: Women Entering the Public Sphere," demonstrates that most women entering politics tend to join women’s organizations and find activity in traditionally feminine areas. In the labor force, the feminine professions are considered extensions of the private sphere: education, services, relief, social welfare. Similarly, women’s organizations supposedly play by different rules; they are less prestigious. Women were able to move from the private to the public organizational sphere by becoming volunteers or philanthropists. Though voluntary organizations are hierarchical and marked by competition, the fact that they encourage work without pay reinforces traditional images of women and their social roles. The result is that the dichotomy between male-public-political and female-public-apolitical is preserved by the continued devaluation of women’s volunteering and women’s voluntary organizations.

Chapter Five, “Exchange Rate for Women: Converting Resources Into Political Power,” discusses women’s resources and their ability to translate these resources into political gain. The major personal capital of women in Israeli local politics is education and usually their level of education is higher than that of their male counterparts. Other resources include one’s military service, socio-economic status and profession. Ethnic background serves as a resource for Afro-Asian and Mizrahi councilwomen who are explicit about their attempt to increase women’s and Mizrahi representation in local politics. As for organizational affiliation and activity, women invest time and energy in various types of organizations but do not necessarily advance through them and, therefore, are not inclined to view organizational activity as a form of political activity, in contrast to their male counterparts. Only recently has affiliation with feminist networks been cited as a serious political resource with the potential to advance one’s career goals. The party remains the most important mechanism for deciding a woman’s place on the list, and her political prospects. Yet, just as a woman’s personal capital does not guarantee her one of the top slots, neither does a serious commitment to the party. As an organization, the party does not encourage women, though some parties are more congenial to women than others.

Chapter Six, “Women and the Political Map,” Herzog analyses the various parties in terms of their attitudes to women’s representation. On the whole, she argues that the Left in Israel has been the dominant factor in introducing women into politics. Most councilwomen have been elected on behalf of the Labor Party in its various incarnations. Yet, though women from Labor enjoy greater representation, they are relegated to less influential positions. Second to Labor, independent lists are the optimal channel for women seeking political advancement and a career in local government. The women elected on independent lists focused more on the need to advance a specific cause than those from the big parties. The largest right-wing party, Likud, brings fewer women into politics and leaves them to struggle for positions of power. A conspicuous feature of the religious parties is their rejection of women and the obstacles placed in their way.

Chapter Seven, “Local Community and Local Politics,” provides us with an insight into the life of Arab councilwomen. In 1989, the Arab sector consisted of three municipalities and 55 local councils. Only three women were elected to local councils. Herzog explains the small number of women as a result of the emphatically patriarchal structure of the Arab hamulah, which is based on male authority. In the last decade, Palestinian women have been caught between two forces driving them in opposite directions: either to effect a breakthrough into the public realm and gain equality as Palestinians and as women or to get back into the home, in line with a conservative national-religious identity. Each of the three councilwomen has found ways to mitigate the tension between traditional patterns and their aspirations to become involved in public life.

Chapter Eight, “Politics of Women or by Women?,” addresses the question of female political style: Will the women who made the decision to enter the male world of politics adopt the dominant definitions and rules of the political game, or will they join the feminists’ belief in a women’s different voice and style? Herzog points out that the demands made on women in politics are contradictory and entrapping. The same traits that make a male a successful politician are sought in a female but if she behaves accordingly she is considered excessively “masculine,” too ambitious and too aggressive. While the most coveted positions on the average council are the council head and deputy council head, 70 percent of councilwomen staffed relatively low prestige committees such as education, health, the elderly and youth. These women, although involved in the public sphere, insist on defining it in terms of what is expected of them as women.

Despite the various disciplinary perspectives of these three books and the different foci of their research, all three authors seem to suggest that women in Israel are currently facing serious challenges, both in the public and private domains.

Like the female Knesset members, women in local government are not usually found on committees that are perceived as dealing with “masculine” areas, such as management, finance and security. Most councilwomen do not stay in politics; 90 percent do not run for a second term. The reasons they cite are disappointment, lack of achievement, rotation and protest. Some indicate personal reasons, others pin the blame on discrimination and male pressure.

Chapter Nine, “Women on the Top,” states that five out of six councilwomen who reached the top—that is, who headed a council—hail from small villages and towns. The social profiles of the women reveal married women and mothers who are members of voluntary organizations. Herzog presents the life stories of the five Jewish, and the single Palestinian, women who made it to the top, pointing out that “a woman in public life is judged by far harsher criteria than a man; a woman must truly excel in order to make people abandon stereotypical thinking about women” (pp. 221-222). The women interviewed by Herzog stressed the importance of entering public consciousness to accomplish this they had to educate, get people to sign petitions, hold rallies and meet in supporters’ homes, shake hands on street corners, and receive media exposure.

Chapter Ten, “More Than a Looking Glass: Women in Politics and the Media,” focuses precisely on the question of media coverage to women in local politics. Based on articles dealing with women candidates, Herzog found several techniques of representation that reinforced the stereotype of the “feminine” candidate. Only 5 percent of the relevant articles in the general press removed women from the narrow confines of women’s “special” interests, placing them in the sections that cover politics and election campaigns. Most representations emphasize the women’s biological gender, highlighting her as an aesthetic and sexual object; the press tends to flatter the candidates for their physical appearance. Most women candidates tend to cooperate with journalists and provide information that presents them as women first and politicians second. Another way to nullify women in politics is to present them as exceptions, implying that most women are not fit for politics. Thus, media coverage of local women politicians reinforces traditional stereotypes of femininity and helps to keep women in their “appropriate” place.

In her last chapter, “Conclusion: Entrapped in a Gendered World,” Herzog argues that her analysis of a woman’s place in Israeli politics demonstrates that, as in other Western societies, the central mechanism to exclude women from politics is the binary opposition of the private and public spheres as well as the association of women with the
former and men with the latter. This social construction leads women candidates and electees to create a "social veil" that permits them to enter the public arena without challenging the social myth of women's natural preference for the private sphere. By working in and through voluntary organizations women avoid direct competition with male politicians. Women tend to present themselves as public servants rather than politicians. Yet, argues Herzog, women in local politics who claim they are engaged in service activities are depoliticizing the realm of local government (p. 209). "What is needed then," Herzog concludes, "is a change not only in the approach of women but in that of the entire society" (p. 271).

This thoroughly researched book is a must for anyone interested in the status of women in Israeli society and politics, as well as scholars and advanced students of modern Israel. Its comparative perspective makes this book valuable to scholars of political sciences in other fields and regions of the world.

_Hurdles in the Halls of Science: The Israel Case_, by Nina Toren, focuses on the status of women in Israel's academic institutions. Her main thesis is that despite the growing numbers of women entering academic life, women have lower levels of participation, position, productivity and recognition. In this regard, they share the predicament of academic women in other countries, notably the United States. To varying degrees, women experience stereotyping, exclusion, segregation and isolation usually associated with discrimination against subordinate minorities. In most countries, women comprised less than one-third of total faculty in the 1990s. At the same time, they constituted between 7 and 10 percent highest academic rank of full professors. What distinguishes the Israeli case is the consistent attempt to deny that any problem of disparity or discrimination exists altogether.

Toren argues that the overall small number of women in academia affects their chances for promotion and retention. Nevertheless, she finds that in the Sciences, where women are represented in smaller numbers than in the Humanities and Social Sciences, women are likely to enjoy greater equality and benefits. Her interviews with women scientists indicate that despite the sexual stereotyping of the Sciences, in general, as a "masculine" field, most of the female respondents denied any discrimination or problems in their professional careers. Most of the senior women faculty took full responsibility for their lower productivity, pace of promotion and achievement in recognition. These respondents emphasized their accomplishments rather than the obstacles they encountered and agreed that they ought to simply try harder to satisfy the requirements and expectations of their fields. Toren finds that gender-based discrimination of women in Israeli universities has become less crude in the last decade or so but it nevertheless persists. Differential treatment may change its appearance but as long as men continue to control promotion and tenure committees as well as departments, colleges, they will find new forms and ways to restrict women's progress and influence.

Chapter Six, "Marriage and Motherhood: The Big Hurdle," focuses on a frequent theme in Toren's interviews: family obligations and motherhood. Among the senior faculty women, 40 percent maintained that family and marriage did not represent an obstacle in their academic career; 43 percent did feel that being a mother of young children early in their career did impede their career development. Toren's analysis of statistical data, however, suggests that marriage and motherhood do not reduce the scientific and scholarly output of women faculty. Her findings imply that family obligations should not be regarded as the major hurdle obstructing professional success of women in academia. Nevertheless, Toren's study shows that gender inequalities and hurdles persist throughout women's academic careers. In her conclusion, she argues that "at the root of gender inequality in academia is the 'culture of science' that defines women as less worthy than men in general and less competent to do science in particular" (p. 129). The differential treatment of women, according to Toren, stems from gender stereotypes and imagery to which high-ranking female decision-makers are highly susceptible, despite formal institutional reforms.

In _Reproducing Jews: A Cultural Account of Assisted Conception_ Susan Martha Kahn considers the change in the social status of unmarried mothers in the context of Israeli pronatalism. This pronatalist policy stems from the demographic threat, or the competition with Palestinian birth rates both inside and outside Israel, and from the need to create future soldiers. Yet, most of Kahn's interviewees do not reveal an awareness of being pressured into maternal or reproductive roles. Most of them perceive their decision to avail themselves of artificial insemination and other reproductive technologies as an individual choice. These prospective mothers' attempt to give birth is seen as understandable, if desperate, desire for children. In spite of the challenges assisted reproduction may pose to the institution of marriage, the cultural importance of motherhood becomes reinforced through women's use of reproductive technology. Yet, these technologies' separation between the woman's egg and the woman's womb as the locus or crux of the reproductive moment challenges the very definition of motherhood. What is a mother? The woman who contributes her egg to an infertile woman, or the one whose womb grows the donated sperm? To be sure, "the conceptual fragmentation of women's bodies into eggs and wombs is clearly problematic" as it threatens to "dehumanize women and to promote an attitude that views their bodies as detachable parts that can be combined and recombined in order to create legitimate maternity" (p. 113). Another complicating factor, in the future, may be posed by surrogacy, which has recently been legalized in Israel.

In her conclusion, Kahn suggests that the "same technology that presents unmarried women with an unprecedented degree of reproductive autonomy, at the same time, exposes them to a host of arguably exploitative reproductive practices, from surrogacy to paid egg donation to the implicit coercion to motherhood (p. 174).

Despite the various disciplinary perspectives of these three books and despite the different foci of their research, all three authors seem to suggest that women in Israel are currently facing serious challenges, both in the public and private domains. In spite of substantive legislative and formal institutional gains as well as the technological advantages and progressive tolerance they seem to enjoy, Israeli women continue to suffer from subtle forms of discrimination and manipulation. Those who choose public careers, as politicians or academicians, find themselves lagging behind their male peers in terms of recognition and power. In the private sphere, on the other hand, women are supported by both state subsidies and sophisticated technologies. Yet, even as they enter and complete the process of becoming a mother, they are made aware of the meaningless of the very term and definition of motherhood as male technologists manipulate their bodies.
ful such study might be when studying an ethnic, religious and artistic culture such as the one that surrounds Judaism. Despite its mundane name, *Representations of Jews in Popular Culture* is anything but. The collection, collated from a conference held at Creighton University in 1995, is an interdisciplinary marvel.

The work is diverse both in its choice of medium and critical perspectives. *Representations of Jews in Popular Culture*’s essays cover art, literature, television, movies, photographs, race relations, music, theater, cartooning and journalism in both specific and general ways. While the individual papers are not histories of individual topics, all of them provide a broader perspective of the individual topic they examine.

All the essays have their merit, and I suspect readers will have their own favorites based on their particular expertise. My own favorite essay is David Porush’s “Jews Don’t Hitch: The American Religion in Northern Exposure.” Porush does a wonderful job showing how the American Jew’s conflict between loyalty to religion and to the assimilating tendency in the United States plays out in an episode of *Northern Exposure*. In this particular episode, the townspeople of Cicely try to find a suitable mourning group for Dr. Joel Fleischman, their New York-Jewish doctor, whose uncle has died. The essay complicates the struggle American Jews often face even in the 20th century (and the 21st) as they address an age-old problem; it also addresses, more specifically, the difficulties the entertainment industry has in representing modern American Jews in movies and television.

My least favorite are the three literary essays, in particular the two essays that trace the image of the Jew in the 19th and 20th centuries. Much of their material has been covered to some extent by Louis Harap’s exhaustive studies of the Jewish image in American literature. At least Regine Rosenthal addresses Harap’s work in “Inventing the Other: Ambivalent Constructions of the Wandering Jew…in the Nineteenth Century American Literature,” and adds two elements to Harap’s work: a focus on a particular type of Jewish character as well as a fashionable use of Michael Foucault. S. Lillian Kremer’s work on the “Shifting Perspectives of the Jew in Twentieth Century American Literature” does not even cite Harap, whose interpretations are certainly not the last word in Jewish-American literary studies, but his interpretations, particularly regarding images of Jews, need to be addressed in essays like Kremer’s. Also, I think Greg Zacharias in “The Idea of Jew in Henry James’ Novels” reads James’s “idea” too generously toward James, although I do like his comparison of James to the Anglo-Jewish writer Amy Levy, whose work I had not known. But those whose field is not Jewish literary studies (as is mine) many not feel the same way.

It may be true, in fact, that the book’s central value is to educate those of us who study one aspect of Jewish culture to the thematic connections in other disciplines. As someone who focuses particularly on the Jewish literary and cultural experience in 20th-century America, I found Yoram Lubling’s essay on Woody Allen very useful, but Russel Lemmons’s essay on Hans Schewitzer’s anti-Semitic cartoons in Weima, Germany, and John Calvert’s work on the radical Islamic cartoons of Jews in the Middle East gave me a broader perspective on my own work. I also enjoyed Richard S. Levy’s work on the Protocols of the Elders of Zion, Kerri Steinberg’s analysis of the stereotypes and archetypes in the photographic campaigns of the United Jewish Appeal, and Pamela A. Cohen’s work on “George Segal’s Holocaust Memorial”; they gave me ideas on how to approach the notion of representation in my own work in the classroom and in my research. Too often we worry about whether studying popular culture seems trivial. The essays in *Representations of American Jewish Culture* are a good indication that studying popular culture is crucial work that can expand the ways we think about culture and perhaps ourselves.

*Jonathan Silverman is a professor of English, Virginia Commonwealth University, and a contributing editor.*

---

**Biblical Scholarship of Grace and Insight**

**Songs of the Heart: An Introduction to the Book of Psalms**

by Nahum M. Sarna

New York: Schocken Books

**Studies in Biblical Interpretation**

by Nahum Sarna

Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society

*A Review Essay by Kristin Swenson-Mendez*

When I took my first stumbling steps of Biblical scholarship at a small Norwegian college in the midst of southern Minnesota fields, Nahum Sarna was a gentle guide. My teachers at St. Olaf advised that the Jewish Publication Society commentary series was indispensable to exegesis. Sarna and Chaim Potok initiated the series with Sarna writing the Genesis and Exodus volumes. So, at the long oak desks of the library reference room, I first witnessed Sarna’s elegant synthesis of faith and learning.

Recently, as I tried to wrest a blessing from my dissertation concerning the Judah and Joseph poems in Genesis 49, I not only returned to Sarna’s *Genesis* commentary but also found help in Sarna’s article on a particularly knotty divine title in Gen. 49:24. So it is an honor to reflect here on two books by a scholar of particular insight and grace. *Songs of the Heart: An Introduction to the Book of Psalms* was published several years ago but the poems it studies are timeless and Sarna’s presentation shows “that in this age of spiritual and moral chaos they still have something to teach us.” *Studies in Biblical Interpretation* is new but, as a collection of Sarna’s previously published articles, its content reflects a lifetime of work.

In *Songs of the Heart* Sarna does not attempt to discuss each psalm or to provide an overview of the whole book of Psalms. Instead, he treats 10 psalms in detail. Nevertheles, Sarna introduces *Songs of the Heart* with a brief discussion of the historical context of Psalms and some general matters such as musicality and authorship. In writing also about the “survival” of the Psalms in his introduction, Sarna returns to a point made on the first page, a point that is sustained throughout *Songs of the Heart*. That is, “In the Psalms, the human soul extends itself beyond its confining, sheltering, impermanent house of clay…” The biblical psalms are essentially a record of the human quest for God” (p. 3).

The 10 psalms, which Sarna makes the focus of nine chapters are Psalms 1, 8, 19, 24 (taken together), 30, 48, 82, 93, and 94. In his discussions of these psalms, Sarna treats several themes that inform not only the composition of Biblical literature(s) but also the posture of a human being seeking the right way in life. These themes include the role of Torah in human happiness and prosperity, and the inscrutability of a God who is responsible for marvels of the universe, king of the heavens and earth, yet interested in individuals. They include questions concerning both proper worship on the part of people and proper judgment on the part of God. And they include, on the one hand, thanksgiving for healing help; and, on the other hand, bitter complaint for the continued success of wrongdoers.

That *Songs of the Heart* grew out of Sarna’s teaching experiences and is the product of a passionate teacher is clear on every page. This is not a book that reads like an attempt to impress a small group of experts; rather, it is an intelligent and intelligible discussion of some of the most intriguing, and frequently most difficult, matters in Psalms study. Within the context of his discussion of individual psalms, Sarna presents a sophisticated discussion of philology and historical context in a forthright and unpretentious manner. As a result, readers...
are invited to learn about the literatures and theologies of ancient Israel’s neighbors and encouraged to ask how the psalmists adapted and adopted such texts, images and ideas into Israel’s Psalms. Indeed, in his afterword, Sarna explains:

“I have tried to lay before the reader something of the thought-world of the authors and worshipers. I have endeavored to present their animating ideas and concepts, the values they held dear, the truths they adhered to, the ideals that stirred them, the convictions they firmly and passionately cherished. My purpose has been, not to sate the reader’s appetite for knowledge about these matters, but to sharpen it” (p. 207).

Some of the essays reproduced in Studies in Biblical Interpretation reflect Sarna’s study of Psalms. But where Songs of the Heart stops short of technical matters concerning the history of Psalms scholarship and superscription in the Psalms, essays in Studies in Biblical Interpretation take up and develop these topics. There are also a few essays on specific psalms, including Psalms 19 (a very different essay than that in Songs of the Heart), 89 and 92.

Studies in Biblical Interpretation is organized in four sections, three of which reflect the three parts of a TaNaK. The fourth section, which is actually first in this volume, concerns more general avenues of inquiry in Hebrew Bible scholarship. The first section of Studies in Biblical Interpretation comprises a collection of different “Essays on Biblical and Related Topics.” These essays include “The Divine Title,” “Paganism and Biblical Judaism,” “The Biblical Sources for the History of the Monarchy,” “Ancient Libraries and the Ordering of the Biblical Books,” “The Authority and Interpretation of Scripture in Jewish Tradition,” “Rashi the Commentator,” “Abraham Ibn Ezra as an Exegete,” “Abraham Geiger and Biblical Scholarship,” and “Jewish Bible Scholarship and Translations in the United States.”


The third section has four articles concerning the “Prophets.” They are “Naboth’s Vineyard Revisited (1 Kings 21),” “The Aborted Insurrection in Zedekiah’s Day (Jeremiah 27-29),” “Zedekiah’s Emancipation of Slaves and the Sabbatical Year,” and “Ezekiel 8:17: A Fresh Examination.”


The articles vary considerably in both length and focus, reflecting the wide range of Sarna’s inquiry and scholarship. Because Protestant Christianity has shaped much of my background, both personal and academic, I especially enjoyed learning more about the history of and great figures in Jewish Biblical study, from the Spanish Middle Ages to modern Jewish scholarship in the United States. Much of the first section of Sarna’s Studies in Biblical Interpretation concerns this rich tradition of Jewish study.

Another prominent feature of Sarna’s essays reflects his interest in the societies and literatures of ancient Israel’s neighbors as they inform our understanding of Biblical texts. This comparative study is evident in both historical and literary critical investigations. Examples of the former include Sarna’s essays on the Decalogue, Naboth’s Vineyard and Psalm 19. Essays concerning “The Anticipatory Use of Information,” Ezekiel 8:17 and Psalm 89 provide examples of the latter.

Sarna’s illustrious history is evident in the lengthy bibliography of his publications, listed at the end of the book. Jeffrey Tigay’s Foreword fills in some of the blanks behind the bibliographic list with a brief biography of Sarna, the scholar…and the teacher. Tigay writes, “His classes were characterized by pedagogically sophisticated syllabi as well as the qualities one finds in his publications: lucidity, careful organization, breadth of knowledge and insights based on newly recognized evidence or new angles of vision” (p. xvii). Studies in Biblical Interpretation provides a window onto Sarna’s richly furnished house of study and, with these essays, he invites us in.

Kristin Swenson-Mendez is a professor of religious studies, Virginia Commonwealth University and a contributing editor.

Outsider As Insider As Outsider

Synagogue Life: A Study in Symbolic Interpretation
by Samuel C. Heilman
New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers

A Review Essay
by Peter J. Haas

Sociological studies of Jews are hardly rare, or even new. In fact, studies of the social structure of Jewish communities in North America go back to the very beginnings of the 20th century. Hutchins Hapgood’s classical study of the New York Jewish community, The Spirit of the Ghetto, for example, was published in 1902. Since then numerous investigations have been conducted on a variety of Jewish communities and such analyses continue to constitute a significant subfield in Jewish studies. But, within this arena of scholarly activity, Samuel Heilman’s study of synagogue life, which first appeared in 1976, continues to occupy a special place. What makes this book different is its approach. Unlike other books dealing with the religious world of North American Jewry, Heilman’s work deals hardly at all with such obvious topics as the history and nature of the synagogue, the structure of the traditional liturgy, the classical Jewish concept of the divine, the role of the rabbi, and the like. Rather it is first and foremost an ethnographic study, looking primarily at how Orthodox Jews interact with each other in a religious setting. It examines not how things ought to be theologically but rather how in fact things are in Orthodox Jewish community as an anthropologist would look at an exotic tribe. Only, in this case, the tribe consists of the members of
“Kehillat Kodesh” in the “Dudley Meadows” section of “Sprawl City.” What emerges is not a pattern of belief or a description of a cultic ritual but a system of social interactions.

This book, as I noted above, was published a quarter of a century ago and so has already had its fair share of reviews and commentary. The occasion of its republication now does not necessarily require a new review but it does give us the chance to look back at the book from the perspective afforded by 25 years. In this regard, it should be noted that the new edition before us is not precisely the same book that was originally published. Although the text itself is unchanged, the new edition includes an Introduction and Afterword, both of which have a story to tell about the effects of the book as seen from the distance of nearly a generation since its first appearance. The Samuel Heilman of today is the Harold Proshansky Professor of Jewish Studies and Sociology at the Graduate School and University Center of the City University of New York. When the book was first written, however, he was a new Ph.D. just beginning his career. We now learn that the very experience of writing this book had a permanent effect on Heilman the scholar, as both his new Introduction and his new Afterword (reprinted from an article that originally appeared in The American Sociologist in May 1980) indicate. These additions document the effect of reading this book and Heilman’s thoughts about the experience of writing the book. Those years themselves contain some interesting lessons and it is on these lessons that I want to focus my remarks.

Let me begin by saying a little about the book itself. The clearest exposition is the one Heilman himself gives at the very beginning. He states that in the book before us, he has “attempted to describe from the perspective of the participant observer, both with a minimum of sociological jargon, the interaction generated within and by the members of a small modern Orthodox Jewish synagogue located in a large northeastern American city... This is not a book about the religion of Orthodox Jews, for it explains neither their religion nor the essence of the Orthodoxy... If the book succeeds in its purpose, the reader will finally know little if anything about the meaning that the Orthodox synagogue has for the faithful; he will see only how Orthodox Jews, as social beings, [italics in the original] act in their congregation” (pp. xxiii-xxiv). On the surface, then, the book is little more than a series of close observations about how the people in this small synagogue interact with each other accompanied by scholarly reflection on what these interactions mean. But this description hardly catches the breathtaking insights and connections that emerge. We discover that the way the synagogue is laid out provides a whole array of syntactic and grammatical rules for symbolic communication of social meaning and that how people use this space is analogous to the creation of phrases and sentences in a conversation. Accordingly, Heilman pays attention to how congregants arrange themselves (i.e., who sits next to whom, where you walk to when you walk around, who talks to whom, what they talk about and how they talk about it—news, gossip about oneself, gossip about others or jokes). From each such encounter one can derive some insight into social organization. And, as in any language, a similar sentence can have different meanings in different contexts. Thus we see over and over again that how men relate to women is highly structured. But this structure changes, and so the relationship between the genders changes, as the context shifts, depending on a variety of factors such as the day of the week, the time of day, the location within the synagogue and so forth. Another wonderful example is his discussion of how one is to deal with the various types of fundraisers who visit the synagogue. Interactions are coded according to when and where they occur and in accordance with the status given the fundraiser, who are carefully and systematically divided into diverse classes: beggars, schnorrers or meshulachim. Another good example is the distribution of kibbudim (“honors”), which sounds in Heilman’s analysis remarkably like a sort of Jewish Potlatch in which various status symbols are distributed in accordance with their perceived value at various times and in accordance with the regnant hierarchy of social organization. In short, no encounter, regardless of how seemingly casual and ad hoc, is without its embedded structure as well as meaning.

It is, of course, because of the very nature of the study that Heilman’s book affords us not a picture of a static and essential Orthodoxy but rather a snapshot of his “tribe” at a particular time in its history. This turns out to be, in 1976, just when the community was making its transition from a community of Eastern European immigrants to a community of native-born Americans. Thus the book can serve, in our day, as a kind of social history as well. This is so because we can find woven into the encounters the book documents numerous messages about self-definition, an area then in some flux as the immigrant generation was giving way to a native born one. We learn, for example, through careful listening and observation, what members of Kehillat Kodesh think about other Jews from whom they want to differentiate themselves—not only non-Orthodox Jews but also other types of Orthodox Jews (such as those who are less observant than they are, on the one hand, and those who are more “frum” or observant, on the other). Heilman shows, through their stories, gossip, jokes, etc., how these particular modern Orthodox Jews attempt to position themselves among the various options out there and, so in the process, define themselves as Orthodox, but of a certain type, and as Americans, but of a certain type. There is in all this, then, an interesting insight into the state of Orthodoxy a quarter of a century ago. In this regard, I was struck by one reviewer, William Helmreich in Present Tense of Autumn 1977, who begins by noting that “it is no longer a secret that thousands of young Jewish men and women adhere strictly to an Orthodox way of life while working as attorneys, doctors, businessmen, accountants, professors and other worldly occupations.” He ends by wondering whether such a community can survive into the next generation. In our day of resurgent Orthodoxy and even Ultra-Orthodoxy, it is interesting to see how tenuous matters looked from within and without a generation ago.

It is Heilman’s ability to see the subterranean connections between these encounters that results in the curious sensation again and again of reading about a faraway and exotic tribe that is somehow also awfully familiar. Orthodox Judaism as a system of life given at Sinai dissolves into the quotidian encounters of people engaged in social bonding and self-definition, albeit in the confines of the synagogue. At one level, one is reading about Orthodox Jews but, at another, one could just as well be reading about some alien clan like the imaginary Bonga-Bonga that I use as illustrations in my classes. Judaism disintegrates into ethnic bonding and social negotiation. This rather disconcerting character of the book was recognized even in the first reviews. Jacob Chinitz, writing in the Reconstructionist of January 1977, begins his review by recalling debates in his traditional yeshiva training about which subjects were most corrosive to faith—science, philosophy, to name a few. After reading this book, he notes, he realizes the most threatening discipline is sociology because it de-
Scribed the reality of everyday life without reference to the divine. He then, curiously, ends his review with a paragraph detailing the finer aspects of the halachah as regards the proper use of keys on Shabbat. In short, Chinitz takes us back to familiar ground for a discussion of Orthodox Judaism. I take this to mean that Chinitz found the book's description of Orthodoxy so detached and secular that he felt compelled to revert to traditional discourse to protect his (and Orthodoxy's?) identity.

In this regard, maybe one of the most interesting aspects of the book 25 years later is how Heilman was changed by it. In his new Introduction and Afterword, he shares anecdotes about his reception in the Orthodox community after the book appeared. He also talks about the deconstructing effect of the analysis on his own sense of identity and belonging as regards the community. There were even some who were no longer sure he came out of the writing of the book as still Orthodox. He had, after all, lifted the curtain of Orthodoxy's own sense of sacrality only to find normal humans at work behind the controls. One of the moving aspects of the reflective materials added to the book in this reprinted edition is the admission on the part of Heilman that, after 23 years, one of the doubters about the survival of his Orthodox purity is Heilman himself. I suppose one can never walk through the looking glass (or into the pardes) and come from the experience the same. As Heilman himself put matters, he began as a stranger in Kehillat Kodesh "going native" and ended in some sense becoming a native who "went strange" (p. 278). In reading this book, even 25 years later, we share some element of that journey as well.

Peter J. Haas holds the Abba Hillel Silver Chair of Jewish Studies at Case Western Reserve University and is a contributing editor.

The Feminist Corner

A Review Essay
by Sarah Barbara Watsstein

Fiction
Collected Stories. By Lily Brett. Queensland, Australia: University of Queensland Press. Lily Brett is an award-winning novelist and poet as well as a brilliant short-story writer. This collection brings together her two sequences of stories, published as Things Could Be Worse and What God Wants, following the lives of a company of Melbourne friends who survived the Holocaust, and the complex lives of the children they raised. Always under the shadow of their history, the close-knit Jewish community portrayed in these stories tackles life with exuberance, passion and extraordinary humor. Themes explored include guilt, fear and the need for belonging—to the family, to the community and to the faith. Black and white drawings accompany the stories and are presumably the work of Brett's husband, David Rankin, a prominent Australian painter.

********

Letters
Selected Letters of Mary Antin. By Evelyn Salz. Syracuse University Press. Many readers are no doubt familiar with the much-celebrated Promised Land (1912) and From Plotzk to Boston (1899), both written by Mary Antin (1881-1949), the noted American autobiographer, political activist and public figure. Antin's strong Jewish background has its roots in poverty and the anti-Semitism of the Pale of Settlement in Russia. These forces made the Antins, along with more than 2 million European Jews, emigrate to the United States. In 1894, the 13-year-old Antin arrived in Boston with her mother and siblings to be reunited with her father who had preceded them three years earlier. Her youth and adolescence were spent in Chelsea and Boston, Massachusetts. The correspondence in this volume (1899-1949) follows Antin's life from a precocious adolescence through her years of fame and public involvement as well as her slow descent into mental illness and eventual obscurity. A must for readers interested in how the Jewish writer in America has faced the dual challenges of assimilation and the crisis of identity...and for readers interested in how the Jewish woman writer in America has faced these very same challenges. Also a must-read for those interested in immigrant women's autobiographies and the female identity in cross-cultural perspectives. Thanks to Ms. Salz for restoring Ms. Antin to a prominent place in American literature.

********

Niddah
From the root nidd, which means separation. Since ancient times, Jewish law has designated women as impure during their menstrual flow and for several days thereafter. During this time, a Jewish woman is considered Niddah—unable to have sexual relations with her husband and excluded from the synagogue, unable to practice the sacred rituals of Judaism. Purification in a mikveh following her period restores full status as a wife and as a member of the Jewish community. Nowadays, most of the separation concerns husband-wife relations and is sexually loaded. The level of separation varies from parting the beds and not passing any object to the husband to only refraining from sexual penetration.

Today, debates about the meaning and practice of Niddah continue. Niddah is the subject of the two books reviewed next. Both fascinating and immensely scholarly works affirm one central fact—traditions are not static.

Menstrual Purity: Rabbinic and Christian Reconstructions of Biblical Gender. By Charlotte Elisheva Fonrobert. Stanford University Press. This book presents first a study of the classical rabbinic discourse on menstruation and of the range of meanings that talmudic literature accords to women's bodies in its discourse of Niddah, or the regulations pertaining to menstruation that are derived from Biblical law. Texts produced between the period from the redaction of the earliest rabbinic text, the Mishnah, to the end of the redaction of the Babylonian Talmud, form the basis of the author's study. What do you think...is the designated impurity of menstruation sexist? Or does ritual absence from sex during menstruation encourage a rhythmic reaffirmation of conjugal intimacy? How did gender work, and how was it made to work, in rabbinic literature? How did that literature dictate the place of women in Jewish culture? If your interest is piqued, join Charlotte Elisheva Fonrobert, Assistant Professor of Talmudic Studies at the Ziegler School of Rabbinic Studies at the University of Judaism in Los Angeles in this scholarly journey in search of answers to these questions. Along the way, the author analyzes the architectural metaphors deployed to describe female anatomy, arguing that this discursive construction operated culturally to associate women with the home and exclude them from rabbinic study halls. She also shows that rabbinic discourse is not completely controlled by rabbinic theology; she analyzes talmudic discussions that allow alternative gender perspectives to emerge, indicating that women and their bodies were not completely objectified. The book concludes with a study of early Christian texts that relate to the same Biblical laws on menstrual impurity as rabbinic text.

Women and Water: Menstruation in Jewish Life and Law. Edited by Rahel R. Wasserfall. Hanover, NH: Brandeis University Press, published by the University Press of New England. Women and Water opens a window onto centuries of debate about a ritual that evokes strong feelings in both its advocates and its critics. Essays from historians and ethnographers examine Niddah across time and place, and show how Jewish women's interpretations of the cleansing bath were often at odds with the views of husbands, doctors and rabbis. As a group, these essays also speak to contemporary feminist concerns with the shaping of
women’s identity, power relations between women and men, and the role of women in the sacred. Readers will find first-class summaries and analyses of Biblical and rabbinic sources side-by-side with contemporary ethnographic participant observations and interviews with ethnically and socio-economically diverse Jewish populations.

* * * * *

Narratives
More than perhaps any other genre, narratives remind us that the past is real and does not die. Its memory will be served. Several narratives in The Feminist’s Corner admirably serve the memory of the past.

Uncertain Travelers: Conversations with Jewish Women Immigrants to America. By Marjorie Agosin. Hanover, NH: Brandeis University Press, published by the University Press of New England. In a remarkable exploration of the experience of exile, poet and human rights activist Marjorie Agosin offers the thoughtful, often poignant testimony of 10 Jewish women who left their homelands and came to the United States. They came variously from Europe and Latin America—at different periods in their lives, in different decades of the century and in differing economic circumstances—fleeing the Holocaust or political oppression, or simply seeking opportunity. Herself a Chilean emigrant to the United States, the author opens the book with a meditation on her own heritage and history. The conversations with the other nine women are arranged chronologically, with the older women speaking first with each preceded by a short introduction that provides a context for the woman’s life. This is a richly woven tapestry of recollections.

Lala’s Story: A Memoir of the Holocaust. By Lala Fishman and Steven Weintraub. Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press. What if you were Jewish and your family was cursed to live in a time and place when it was a capital crime to be a Jew? Born into a middle-class Jewish family in 1922, Lala Weirntraub grew up in Lvov, Poland. Her parents were assimilated Jews, and the family lived in a religiously and ethnically mixed neighborhood. When the Nazis came, Lala survived by convincing them she was a Christian—a Polish Gentile girl named Urszula Krzyanowska. This narrative of survival is her story. Also, it is the story of a young girl’s calculated and resolute struggle to defy, resist and ultimately defeat the forces that sought her demise. It begins with the 1945 liberation of Katowice, the Polish town where she was living. Fishman traverses much ground in this narrative—her Ukrainian origins, her Lvov childhood, war, occupation by the Russians, invasion by the German forces, arrest in Sambor, journey to Krakow and the end of the war. The book ends by bringing her story to the present day. Indeed, its lengthy afterward and epilogue are particularly powerful reflections on the fate of those lucky to have survived the Holocaust, such as the narrator and her brother as well as that of those who disappeared—including the narrator’s parents and sister.

Sarah Barbara Watstein is assistant director of Academic User Services, Virginia Commonwealth University, and a contributing editor.
NOTEWORTHY BOOKS

Editor's Note: The following is a list of books received from publishers but, as of this printing, have not been reviewed for Menorah Review.

And Switzerland's Finest Hour. By David Kranzler. New York: University of Syracuse Press.


Noteworthy Books, continued from page 9


A Room of His Own: In Search of the Feminine in the Novels of Saul Bellow. By Gloria L. Cronin. New York: Syracuse University Press.


The Presidents of the United States and the Jews. By David G. Dalin and Alfred J. Kolatch. Middle Village, NY: Jonathan David Publishers Inc.


The Wisdom of Love. By Alain Finkielkraut. Lincoln: The University of Nebraska Press.
