ISSN 0736-904X

EXPLORATIONS IN ETHNIC STUDIES



Vol. 12, No. 2

July, 1989

Explorations in Ethnic Studies is a multidisciplinary journal devoted to the study of ethnicity, ethnic groups, intergroup relations, and the cultural life of ethnic minorities. The editorial staff welcomes manuscripts that are in concert with the objectives and goals of the National Association for Ethnic Studies. Contributors should demonstrate the integration of theory and practice.

Opinions expressed in articles and critiques are those of the authors and not necessarily of the editors or the publisher.

Articles appearing in this journal are annotated and indexed in *America*: *History and Life* and *MLA International Bibliography*.

The subscription list for this journal may on occasion be released to responsible scholarly and academic organizations; any member objecting to this practice should notify the treasurer.

EDITOR Gretchen M. Bataille Arizona State University ASSOCIATE EDITOR Barbara L. Hiura University of California, Berkeley ASSOCIATE EDITOR Phillips G. Davies Iowa State University EDITORIAL ASSISTANT Catherine Udall Arizona State University

> NAES logo "The Source" designed by Jo Myers COPYRIGHT by NAES, Inc., 1989

Copies of articles from this publication are now available from the UMI Article Clearinghouse. Mail to: University Microfilms International 300 North Zeeb Road, Box 91 Ann Arbor, MI 48106

July, 1989

EXPLORATIONS IN ETHNIC STUDIES

The Journal of the National Association for Ethnic Studies

Published by NAES

General Editorial Board

Wolfgang Binder, Americanistik Universitat Erlangen, West Germany

Lucia Birnbaum, Italian American Historical Society Berkeley, California

Russell Endo, University of Colorado Boulder, Colorado

Manuel deOrtega, California State University Los Angeles, California

David Gradwohl, Iowa State University Ames, Iowa

Jack Forbes, University of California Davis, California

Lee Hadley, Iowa State University Ames, Iowa

Clifton H. Johnson, Amistad Research Center New Orleans, Louisiana

Paul Lauter, Trinity College Hartford, Connecticut

William Oandasan, University of New Orleans New Orleans, Louisiana

Alan Spector, Purdue University Calumet Hammond, Indiana

Ronald Takaki, University of California Berkeley, California

Darwin Turner, University of Iowa Iowa City, Iowa

John C. Walter, University of Washington Seattle, Washington

Table of Contents

American Medical and Intellectual Reaction to African Health Issues, 1850-1960: From Racialism to Cross-Cultural Medicine by David McBride
Critiques Celia J. Wintz
Equity and Excellence in Education-Compatible Concepts or Hostile Abstractions? by Theresa E. McCormick
Critique Margaret A. Laughlin
National Newspaper Analysis of the Press Coverage of Jesse Jackson's 1984 Presidential Campaign: The Confirmation of the Candidate by J. Gregory Payne, Scott C. Ratzan, and Robert A. Baukus 35
Critiques Roberta J. Astroff
Abstracts from the Seventeenth Annual NAES Conference 53
Contributors

ł. V

American Medical and Intellectual Reaction to African Health Issues, 1850-1960: From Racialism to Cross-Cultural Medicine

David McBride

During recent decades, social scientists, particularly anthropologists, sociologists and medical historians, have looked increasingly at how social and cultural factors inform a society's medical community and vice-versa. As Roger Cooter recently stated, "... medicine is a social phenomenon capable of being properly studied only when treated as a part of its social, political, economic and cultural totality."¹ In America, a steady flow of medical sociologists-most notably Henry E. Sigerist in the 1940s, Talcott Parsons in the 1950s, David Mechanic in the 1960s and 1970s, and Vern and Bonnie Bullough in the 1980s-contributed numerous empirical studies that revealed that the development of American medicine was shaped moreso by its social and cultural context than clinical discoveries.² These studies have demonstrated conclusively that the American health profession's approaches to disease (etiology and therapy), the institutional structure of medical research and care, and public health care policy all have been deeply influenced by socioeconomic and cultural factors specific to historical epochs of evolving American society.

At the same time that the socio-cultural context for medical care is gaining closer examination, social science researchers and health experts are placing greater importance on the ethnic and racial dimensions of health care. They stress that the spread of disease and illness within a society reflect not only economic barriers to medical services, but also ethnic and racial stratification. The mortality and morbidity rates of a society's minority populations, as well as the distribution of medical care and practitioners, mirror closely its ethnic and racial hierarchy. As Richard Cooper stated, "[i]n virtually every multi-racial society consistent patterns of differential mortality have been described."³

This study will present an historical overview of the connection between the social context and the collective perceptions of medical, anthropological, and social policy thinkers in the United States regard-

Explorations in Ethnic Studies, Vol. 12, No. 2 (July, 1989)

ing health and illness of the black peoples of American and Africa. It will focus on the influence of race concepts in shaping health thought of the modern United States (Africa or Europe require separate studies). This investigation will outline the initial strength and subsequent decline of racial reductionism or "racialism" within these expert communities through the early twentieth century.⁴

The first stage in the modern racial conceptualization of health emerged in the nineteenth century. During this period this race-centric outlook dominant in the United States viewed black Americans and peoples of Africa as an amorphous biological group predisposed to the same diseases and ill-health, and generally inferior in physical and mental capacity compared to other "races."

After World War I a second stage in American health thought toward Africa unfolded. A serious split occurred when a new faction of antiracialists emerged gradually among anthropologists and international philanthropists. These investigators uncovered empirical data that challenged phenotypical cataloging of "races" as well as demonstrated a complex mosaic of ethnicity and health ways and needs existed among African peoples. Through academic publications as well as the periodicals of social welfare organizations, this new medical and sociological insight into African communities challenged the health and policymaking communities of the United States.

The third phase in American health and race views developed following World War II. During this period a tremendous expansion in the flow of information regarding the variegated health conditions of African peoples occurred. This stream of empirical studies on African peoples' health gained momentum because of two other developments. First, specialized medical disciplines such as epidemiology and preventive medicine advanced throughout the medical communities of the United States and Europe. These medical fields stressed increasingly that specific unhealthy living conditions as well as lack of medical resources to manage infectious diseases were at the heart of health problems confronting typical African societies. Second, cultural relativism became a dominant theoretical focus in anthropology and social science generally. Last, there was a tremendous upsurge in United States political involvement in and direct aid to nations of Africa. In striving to gain greater political and military influence with post-colonial African countries, the United States for the first time initiated direct publichealth assistance programs as part of this new foreign policy. These new medical, intellectual, and political movements of the 1940s and 1950s obliterated the static racialist thought toward the health situation of Africans common among medical and sociology circles prior to World War I.

The background to modern American thought on African health is rooted in the slavery period and the social doctrine of white supremacy that solidified during and immediately after the overthrow of Reconstruction. During this period United States intellectuals and medical professionals had only sparse contact and direct knowledge of the ethnic and regional communities of African peoples. Studies of the African people of the slave South relating to a variety of subjects such as malaria and childbearing "established" that the physique of blacks was so obviously different from that of whites, treatment approaches had to be completely separate for the two groups.⁵ The study by white antebellum southern physicians that epitomized the projection of racial categories (or pseudoscientific ideas) into medical classifications of disease was conducted in 1851 under the leadership of Samuel A. Cartwright and called the "Report on the Diseases and Physical Peculiarities of the Negro Race."⁶ The Cartwright report exhorted that medical science and medical schools had been historically non-existent in Africa, hence the need for this "investigation" on "the diseases and physical peculiarities of our negro[sic]population"7 The Cartwright study pointed out that "anatomical" and "physiological" traits were at the root of black-white disease differentials. Besides the color of the skin, the Cartwright report found racial differences "in the membranes, the muscles, and tendons and in all the fluids and secretions[e]ven the negro's brain and nerves ... are tinctured with a shade of pervading darkness."⁸

The racial classification scheme of this medical group based on physical/biological traits and disease propensities allegedly unique to African populations (whether located in the Americas or the continent of Africa) was readily accepted by Charles Darwin, perhaps the most influential thinker of nineteenth century American and British scientists studying "races." One of the most important treatises on race that emerged in the late nineteenth century United States and Britain was Darwin's *The Descent of Man and Selection in Relation to Sex* (1871).⁹ In this work Darwin cites as authoritative studies of black and mulatto slaves by antebellum American scientists. Focusing on human (as opposed to animal) evolution, he expounded at length about the anatomical distinctions between blacks and whites. Darwin believed that "it would be an endless task to specify the numerous points of difference" between black Africans and whites.¹⁰ He held that these distinctions were fundamental or constitutional, stating:

There is . . . no doubt that the various races, when carefully compared and measured, differ much from each other—as in the texture of the hair, the relative proportions of all parts of the body, the capacity of the lungs, the form and capacity of the skull, and even in the convolutions of the brain The races differ also in the constitution, in acclimisation [sic] and in the liability to certain diseases. Their mental characteristics are likewise very distinct; chiefly as it would appear in their emotional, but partly in their intellectual, faculties.¹¹

The separate physical classification of whites and Africans intensified during the late nineteenth century when the stream of missionaries sent

to Africa by American church denominations grew significantly. With slavery now abolished, and American Indian communities subordinated, religious bodies throughout the nation saw the "Christianization of Africa" as a central moral cause.¹² A markedly high mortality rate occurred for black and especially white American and British missionaries to Africa. News of these missionaries' death rates coincided with the expanding popularity of social Darwinism, bolstering racial thought that Africa represented an area of physical degeneracy and ill-health. The high mortality rate of white missionaries—for example, it has been estimated that as high as fifty percent of white British missionaries to early nineteenth century Africa died¹³—reinforced the stereotype that Africa was the "White Man's Grave." The substantially lower black missionary mortality was rationalized as further proof that African people were physiologically distinct from members of the white race. Indeed, black missionaries were put in the African regions by whitecontrolled American denominations on the theory that these black evangelists fared a much better chance of surviving.¹⁴

During the early decades of the twentieth century the notion that Africans here and abroad possessed a peculiar physical commonality became, if anything, more influential. Indeed, the tremendous destruction incurred during the Great War did not lessen but, instead, strengthened the use of racial classification and the "national psyche" idea to explain political, colonial, and national conflicts. For example, even the liberal American social psychologist Herbert Adolphus Miller did not dispense of the racial stock approach. In his influential study *Races*, Nations, and Classes: The Psychology of Domination and Freedom (1924), he grouped humankind into "vertical" groups of races and nations, and "horizontal" groups such as the classes and sects within a particular nation.¹⁵ In struggles between vertical groups—such as Czechs versus Austrians, the Poles versus the Germans, the Jews versus Gentiles, the Korean versus the Japanese, and the Negro versus the white—an "oppression psychosis" resulted. These competing groups popularized "a neurotic fiction of superiority" toward their competing vertical or horizontal group. But note that this theory did not aim to eliminate the rigid classification of Africans and whites into separate races-races that possessed fundamentally different biological, physical and intellectual characteristics.¹⁶ Also, James H. Breasted, the prolific and influential American orientalist, emphasized fundamental distinctions between black Africans and whites, going so far as to "whiten" the ancient Egyptians.¹⁷

In addition to social scientific thought that was framed within a crude racial schematic in which black and white human communities were viewed as separate biological, physical, and psychic races, actual medical and anthropological information from locales in African nations was, at best, meager. In colonial Africa through the middle 1930s organized medical research projects and facilities were sparse. Instead, there emerged a discombobulated web of European colonial and missionary medical personnel unevenly spread throughout the continent. For instance, British colonial medical centers throughout the East African territories (today's Kenya, Uganda, etc.) were seriously deficient. These medical stations prior to World War II lacked funds and personnel such as trained indigenous medical experts. These conditions reflected the low priority that British policymakers assigned to comprehensive health and information resources in these regions and precluded formalized medical research.¹⁸ The neglectful British health policy was compounded by the structural weaknesses of African societies such as poor transportation and communications systems, as well undeveloped higher education, formal health institutions, and the other industrial and technological resources that were complementary requirements for medical research along the Western model.¹⁹.

The exploits and sensational writings of European medical missionaries, especially Albert Schweitzer, also had a substantial impact on sustaining American academic and popular thought toward Africa as a continent filled with a distinctly needy and unhealthy people. His book On The Edge of the Primeval Forest gave extensive accounts of his work as a physician among "the natives of Equatorial Africa."²⁰ The romantic image of the "jungle doctor" was frequently seized upon by Americans who addressed African affairs both in the popular press and black social welfare tabloids. A 1925 issue of Opportunity, the publication of the National Urban League, contained a review of On the Edge of the Primeval Forest that quoted Dr. Schweitzer's comments regarding his encounters with hapless African patients:

The operation is finished, and in the hardly lighted dormitory I watch for the sick man's awakening. Scarcely has he recovered consciousness when he stares about him and ejaculates, again and again: "I've no more pain! I've no more pain." His hand feels for mine and will not let it go. Then I begin to tell him and the others who are in the room that it is the Lord Jesus who has told the doctor and his [nurse]wife to come to the Ogowe, and that white people in Europe give them the money to live here and cure the sick Negroes.²¹

While most early twentieth century American biologists, anthropologists, and health philanthropists envisioned Africa as overriden with diseases and psychological fatalism—due to its peoples' racial traits or widespread social degeneracy—after World War I a dissenting view on African health also began to emerge. A small but substantial community of scholars disputed the blanket generalizations that black Africans tended to have greater illness than whites. One leading voice of this dissent was Franz Boas, a Columbia University professor of anthropology who since the early 1910s challenged the concept of phenotypically distinct races both in his academic research and public commentary.²² During 1925, for instance, Boas co-authored an article in the popular periodical *American Mercury* with Ales Hrdlicka, a Smithsonian Institute anthropologist, urging that there was no conclusive proof of people of African descent possessed an inherent "racial" weakness.²³

Also during the mid-1920s, the American anthropologist and leading scholar of African cultures Melville J. Herskovitz pointed out that racialism was on the rise in both intellectual and political circles. In a paper he read before the Association for the Study of Negro Life and History (ASNLH) in Philadelphia on April 3, 1924, Herskovitz stated that "It lhe subject of race itself has taken on a significance that is much greater than it was a short time past, as we find claims and counterclaims, not only as to the physical, but even the psychical characteristics of 'races."²⁴ In this study, Herskovitz examined skin tone, head-form, and other physical features of 1,000 black boys of a Manhattan public school. He suggested that if criteria for pure race (physical) traits could be established and applied methodically, racial crossing would perhaps be verified. That Herskovitz aimed to develop anthrometric criteria which could, in turn, verify that pure races no longer existed was considered a strident attack against the rising popularity and intellectual proponents of racial classification of all blacks as racially distinct during these times. Hence, it is not surprising that both the ASNLH and the Urban League provided a forum for Herskovitz's early findings.

At the 1925 meeting of the American Association for the Advancement of Science, George Draper of Columbia University responded against the growing opinion that race was not a strong determinant of health. Draper represented the majority "new" racialist arguments. He conceded that it was impossible to delineate specific boundaries between black and white races solely on the basis of external appearance. But he set forth the idea that racial groupings could be based on disease susceptibility or, that is, hereditary genotypical traits instead of "color."²⁵

The dissenting minority school within the still newly developing fields of anthropology, anthrometry, modern human biology, and sociology was represented by scholars like Boas, Hrdlicka, Herskovitz, W. Montague Cobb, and W.E.B. Du Bois. But most other skeptical black and white social scientists of the interwar period lacked a substantial body of technical academic literature that could be the intellectual basis for challenging the "scientific" explanation of racial distinctions between whites and black Africans. These liberal intellectuals felt compelled to take a middle ground on the race-health controversy. While cautious about refuting the idea that Africans and black Americans were racially prone to greater illness than whites, these philanthropists focused on immediate inhumane social processes (such as caste systems and poverty) as strong influences on racial distinctions in intelligence tests and health status. In turn, these social reformists championed educational and other humanitarian reform measures for African communities to lessen the impact of these negative sociological or "environmental" factors.

One of the most influential theorists of this "accommodative" racial policy was Thomas Jesse Jones, the educational director of the Phelps-Stokes Fund. Around 1922 the Fund, along with leading missionary organizations of Canada, Great Britain, and the United States, issued a report, "Education and Africa," which called for extensive exportation of the Hampton-Tuskegee model to central and west Africa.²⁶ In 1924 Jones, in connection with the International Education Board (a subsidary of the General Education Board of the Rockefeller Foundation), published another report, "Education in East Africa." It too aimed at uplifting black Africans, not examining the politics of racial thought or "scientific" arguments for racial distinctions. As one reviewer of "Education in East Africa" wrote, Jones's survey centered on the educational facilities "for the two great groups of Negro stock"-namely Afro-Americans and black Africans.²⁷ Jones' chief ideas about African education did not stress "formal pedagogy," but the total welfare of the black African such as "personal hygiene and communal sanitation, infant mortality and malnutrition, the production, preservation and preparation of food, and related subjects."28

In 1926, James A. Tobey, a distinguished American biologist and public health planner also emphasized that a wretched environment for members of the black race here in America, and not racial determinism, should be stressed in attacking the problems of health that faced black Americans. Tobey did not discount the idea that racial factors had the dominant influence on black health, but insisted that "[i]n the case of the negro [sic]...the evidence seems fairly conclusive that environment is at present a tremendous factor in his well-being."²⁹ He also stressed that a question which should be pursued related to the effect that "admixture of white and negro blood has upon the health and longevity of the [black] race."³⁰ Thus, Tobey's ideas, along with those of other popular scholars like the sociologist Edward B. Reuter, did not signal an elimination of scientific racism, but only a reformulation of it.

The split in the racial interpretation of black American and black African health intensified during the 1930s. With the United States still fundamentally not involved in political and economic affairs of nations on the African continent, knowledge of the health status and epidemiology of African peoples remained largely blocked by race-centric idea now focusing on more subtle genotypical factors. Samuel J. Holmes, the influential biologist and eugenisist of the 1920s and 1930s, epitomized this reaffirmation of conceptualizing black health problems through the racial lens.³¹ Writing in 1937, Holmes admitted that the "subject of differential mortality is full of pitfalls," yet still maintained that "different diseases affect the two races in different ways."³² Unlike previous biologists and medical thinkers who deduced sweeping generalizations about the cause of black mortality from death rates calculated for a few diseases, Holmes proceeded to review the medical studies of racial incidence and mortality in dozens of specific disease catagories. He concluded that blacks were more susceptible to certain diseases like tuberculosis and pneumonia, whites moreso to measles and diseases of the skin.

To Holmes, the basis for the discrepancy in mortality rates between blacks and whites was partially environmental but also genetic. He stated that "the important role of genetic factors in disease resistance, which has been demonstrated in different races of plants and animals, makes it very likely a priori [sic] that races so different as the Negro and the Caucasian may differ in their reactions to pathogenic agencies."33 As Holmes surveyed disease mortality among black and white Americans, he developed the conclusion that the subject of the evolution of the races should not be discharged as a central biological issue merely because medical studies point to a need for specificity in describing interracial health distinctions. To the contrary, Holmes viewed that with the increase in black American population "competition for the means of subsistence is bound to go on [between blacks and whites]. Even though they may interbreed and eventually fuse into a single hybrid stock, the two groups will, in the meantime, inevitably engage in a struggle for numerical supremacy."³⁴ The apparent meticulous quality of Holmes' investigation, its meld between orthodox evolutionism and new epidemiological data, won the study the full endorsement of Robert E. Park, a leading figure among pre-World War II American sociologists of race relations.³⁵ But others, like the prominent anatomist and medical anthropologist W. Montague Cobb, criticized Holmes for failing to address the full implications of his own (i.e. Holmes's) biological race-war scenerio. Cobb wondered, for instance, why Holmes did not discuss the potential that all Americans could become some sort of "black" racial nation given the healthy population growth black Americans were experiencing.36

In the late 1940s and 1950s the medical thought on disease susceptibility of black Africans shifted substantially away from evolutionism and anatomy as the basis for explaining differing disease susceptibility between blacks and whites. Instead, American-based medical and biological thinkers focused on the impact of urbanization, industrialization and the availability of health services to explain mortality differentials between black and whites. This new socio-medical perspective explained that epidemics of tuberculosis in Africa, for instance, resulted from numerous immediate environmental factors such as the unsanitary living conditions, absence of public education regarding health matters and lack of prior exposure among many African populations to tuberculosis which tends to trigger natural immunity within later generations.³⁷ The new socio-medical view also posited a strong association between the incidence of tuberculosis and industrialization.

Rene Dubos, one of the nation's and world's leading biologists and anthropologists, emphasized in 1952 that black African populations suffered tuberculosis rarely until placed in contact with a carrier peoplesuch as in 1803 and 1810, when the British Government imported 4,000 blacks from Mozambique into Ceylon to form new regiments. Over 90 percent of these Mozambiquans died from tuberculosis by December of 1820. Another example highlighted by Dubos concerned World War I when tuberculosis also spread rampantly among France's Sengalese troops and the so-called "Capetown boys" when these soldiers entered France.³⁸

But the most convincing evidence Dubos cited that pointed to material conditions and not racial traits of African people as the foundation for the seemingly high susceptibility of black Africans to tuberculosis were the studies of this disease's impact on Bantu populations of South Africa. Those Bantu people working in urban Johannesburg and other urban centers exhibited some of the highest mortality rates from tuberculosis in the modern world. But contrary to the prediction based on race traits, when these urban Bantu returned to their largely agrarian homesites where they retained their ancestral way of life based on family associations, tuberculosis mortality did not rise significantly. Thus, Dubos stressed that the disease was most prevalent among the reputedly "pure" Africans because of conditions of urban poverty.³⁹

During the late 1940s and 1950s other developments fed the increasing knowledge of the limits of biological and genetic definitions of races, and refinements in specialized medical fields such as preventive medicine, and medical sociology changed radically the study of African health subjects. Also, as anthropology came of age as a discipline, the notion of cultural relativism spread in the post-World War II United States and the West.⁴⁰

This author surveyed the number and specialties of medical articles on illnesses and medical care issues affecting American blacks and peoples of African societies that appeared in American and other Englishlanguage medical journals from 1925 to 1945.⁴¹ During 1925 fifteen articles dealing with blacks were published in the nation's medical journals, but only two of these articles pertained to African blacks. By 1940 the number of articles on blacks generally had climbed to 44 and more than one-quarter (13) of them covered black African medical matters. The flow of studies on blacks generally and African peoples in particular increased still further over the next five years. In 1945 there were 24 articles published on African medical cases and 36 others relating to American blacks. These 1945 studies spanned some fifteen different medical specialities including pediatrics, hematology, infectious diseases, cardiology, and public health medicine.

This trend away from the idea that African health was predetermined by the racial make-up of the African population did not stem solely from intellectual growth and exchange within American academic medicine. The defeat of reductionist racial views of African health also derived from the expansion of the United Nations as a major force in international social science and public health campaigns. In 1950, 1951, and 1956 Unesco issued statements authored by many of the world's leading biologists and social scientists against racism and racial discrimination and denouncing the alleged scientific validity of racial categories. These scholars' studies appeared in an historic publication, *The Race Question in Modern Science* (1956) which aimed to undercut racialism "at the level of information and ideas, but [also] in the broader context of United Nations action to combat racism."⁴²

Finally, political and military contacts by the United States with African nations greatly accelerated at the end of World War II. In order to solidify this new foreign policy linkage, the United States developed and implemented numerous public health assistance programs to specific African nations. The uneven, lackadaisical approach to African affairs that characterized much of United States foreign policy prior to the 1940s came to an abrupt halt as the period of African Independence sped forward. The political quandary that the United States found itself in regarding African affairs during the 1950s and early 1960s was described by one of the leading scholars of American-African policy, Rupert Emerson. Writing in 1967, Emerson stated: "The independence of almost all African colonies has brought with it an immense increase and diversification of American relations with Africa, but the task of accomplishing even a minimum of what remains to be done has barely been started. The potential centers of trouble are legion, [especially] in the vast southern end of the continent which clings to white domination."43 By 1960 the United States had to wrestle with quickly developing concrete assistance programs for each of these forty or so new African nations. Medical aid and technical assistance began to flow from the United States to African countries because such charity would expand America's leverage over other super powers vying for the political, military, and economic benefits that the independent African nations offered.44

In summary, American medical and social thought regarding black Americans and Africans underwent a fundamental shift from 1850 to 1960. The shift was from an approach to African health that posited blacks in both the United States and Africa had common phenotypical "racial traits," to one that particularized the medical status and needs of African people according to their specific ethnicity, living conditions, and preventive medicine resources. This study suggests that ethnic chauvinism blunted understanding of health and medical conditions of a non-white racial groups both domestically and abroad. Such chauvinism eroded only under the pressure of countervailing scientific, crosscultural, and interdisciplinary knowledge.

Indeed, this pre-1960 transformation from racial reductionism to cultural relativism and scientific humanism was just the formative period of what is now a vibrant field of education and research centered on cross-cultural health concepts and ethnomedicine. Anthropologists, social historians and medical and nursing practitioners specializing in preventive medicine have shown increasingly that while diseases are most effectively defined in biomedical terms, typical social populations interpret illness culturally.⁴⁵ Moreover, as medical anthropologist Michael Laguerre points out, culture provides "on the one hand, a grammar to interpret and understand an array of physiological and psychological symptoms and, on the other hand, both healers and remedies to cure real or perceived illnesses."⁴⁶ In the future, then, as both environmental and microbiological threats to humankind push their way to the top of the nation's public agenda, ethnic studies educators and researchers should intensify their focus on comparing cross-national medical thought and systems, as well as divergent cultural reactions to disease.

Notes

¹R. Cooter. "Anticontagionism and History's Medical Record." *The Problem of Medical Knowledge: Examining The Social Construction of Medicine*. Peter Wright and Andrew Treacher, eds. (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1982), 87.

²Representative writings of these scholars include: Henry E. Sigerist On The Sociology of Medicine. Milton I. Roemer and James M. MacIntosh, eds. (New York: MD Publications, 1960); T. Parsons and Renee C. Fox. "Illness, Therapy, and the Modern Urban American Family." Journal of Social Issues. Vol. 8 (1952) 31-44; D. Mechanic. "Social Psychologic Factors in Presentation of Bodily Complaints." New England Journal of Medicine. Vol. 286 (1972) 1132-1139; V.L. and B. Bullough. Health Care For The Other Americans. (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1982).

³Richard Cooper. "Race, Disease and Health." *Health, Race & Ethnicity*. Thomas Rathwell and David Phillps, eds. (London: Croom Helm, 1986) 21.

⁴By "racialism" this author is referring to a belief in the concept of race as scientifically valid. This concept emerged with the turn of the century and was widely accepted in modern American biological and social sciences prior to the 1950s. Its definition was enunciated succinctly by a leading American anthropologist, Earnest A. Hooten (1887-1954): "A race is a great division of mankind, the members of which, though individually varying, are characterized as a group by a certain combination of morphological and metrical features, principally nonadaptive, which have been derived from their common descent." Cited by Louis L. Snyder, *The Idea of Racialism*. (Princeton, NJ: Van Nostrand, 1962) 10.

⁵James H. Jones. Bad Blood: The Tuskegee Syphilis Experiment. (New York: Free Press, 1981) 18-19; Winthrop D. Jordan. White Over Black: American Attitudes Towrd the Negro, 1550-1812. (Baltimore: Penguin, 1968) 257-265, 532 ff.

⁶S. A. Cartwright. "Report on the Diseases." The New Orleans Medical and Surgical Journals. Vol. 7 (May 1851). Reprinted in *Concepts of*

Health and Disease: Interdisciplinary Perspectives. Arthur L. Caplan, et al, eds. (Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley, 1981) 305-325.

7**Ibid.**, 305.

⁸Ibid.

⁹Excerpts of *The Descent* appear in Marston Bates and Philip S. Humphrey, eds. *The Darwin Reader*. (New York: Scribner's, 1956)263ff. ¹⁰**Ibid**. 288.

¹¹Ibid.

¹²Walter L. Williams. Black Americans and the Evangelization of Africa: 1877-1900. (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1982) 5.
¹³Dennis G. Carlson. African Fever: A Study of British Science, Technology, and Politics in West Africa, 1787-1864. (Canton, MA: Science History Publications, 1984) xvi, 10; K. David Patterson. "The Disease Factor: An Introductory Overview." Disease in African History: An Introductory Survey and Case Studies. G.W. Hartwig and K.D. Patterson, eds. (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1978) 3-24.

¹⁴Williams, 6-10. No systematic study of black American missionary mortality has been done. However, disparate evidence so far suggests that their death rates also were, like whites, extremely high; a refutation of the original presumption that blacks sent to Africa sustained better health. See, David McBride. "Africa's Elevation and Changing Racial Thought at Lincoln University, 1854-1886." *Journal of Negro History*. Vol. 62, No. 4 (October, 1977) 363-377.

¹⁵H. A. Miller. *Races, Nations, and Classes.* (Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott Co., 1924).

¹⁶On Miller's conservative view of race assimilation, see R. F. Wacker. Ethnicity, Pluralism, and Race: Race Relations Theory in America Before Myrdal. (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1983) 24-26, 29, 50-51.

¹⁷James H. Breasted. *The Conquest of Civilization*. (New York: Harper & Bros., 1926). In later decades, leading black African scholars excoriated Breasted for his distortion of Egyptian racial features. See Chikh Anta Diop. *The African Origin of Civilization: Myth or Reality*. (Westport, CT: Lawrence Hill, 1974) 132-33.

¹⁸Ann Beck. A History of the British Medical Administration of East Africa, 1900-1950. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1970) 194-197.

¹⁹**Ibid.**; National Academy of Sciences—National Research Council, Division of Medical Sciences. *Tropical Health: A Report on a Study of Needs and Resources.* (Washington, DC: 1962), Albert B. Sabin, "Preface," viii.

²⁰Elizabeth Walton, rev. of On The Edge of the Primeval Forest, by Albert Schweitzer, Opportunity. Vol. 3, No. 34 (October, 1925) 315.
 ²¹Ibid.

²²Wacker, 15-19.

²³"Social Progress." Opportunity. Vol. 3, No. 25 (January, 1925) 63.

²⁴M. Herskovitz. "Preliminary Observations in a Study of Negro-White Crossing." *Opportunity*. Vol. 3, No. 27 (March, 1925) 69.

²⁵"Social Progress."

²⁶William H. Baldwin. "A School System For Africa." *Opportunity*. Vol. 3, No. 31 (July, 1925) 201-204.

²⁷Ibid., 201.

²⁸Ibid.

²⁹J. A. Tobey. "The Death Rate Among American Negroes." *Current History.* Vol. 25, No. 2 (November, 1926) 220.

³⁰Ibid.

³¹Samuel J. Holmes, *The Negro's Struggle For Survival*. (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1937).

³²**Ibid.**, 47.

³³**Ibid.**, 48.

³⁴**Ibid.**, 1.

³⁵On Robert Park's support of Holmes' ideas, see R. E. Park. "The Nature of Race Relations." [1939] *Race and Culture: Essays in the Sociology of Contemporary Man.* (New York: Free Press, 1950) 105-106.

³⁶W. M. Cobb. "Negro Survival." *Journal of Negro Education*. Vol. 7, No. 4 (October, 1938) 564-565.

³⁷World Health Organization. The Medical Research Programme of the World Health Organization, 1964-1969—Report by the Director General. (Geneva: World Health Organization, 1969) 60-61; National Research Council. Tropical Health. 36-38. Also see Harry F. Dowling. Fighting Infection: Conquests of the Twentieth Century. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1977) 80-81; R. Cooper. "Race, Disease and Health." 58-59.

³⁸Rene Dubos and Jean Dubos. The White Plague: Tuberculosis, Man and Society. (Boston: Little, Brown, 1952) 192.
³⁹Ibid., 194.

⁴⁰Frances Herskovitz (ed.). *Cultural Relativism*. (New York: Random House, 1972); Susan S. Hunter. "Historical Perspectives on the Development of Health Systems Modeling in Medical Anthropology." *Social Science and Medicine*. Vol. 21, No. 12 (1985) 1297-1307.

⁴¹This author surveyed the bibliographic entries related to Negroes or Blacks in the National Library of Medicine (Bethesda, Md.) publication, *Cumulated Index Medicus*, volumes for 1925, 1940, and 1945.

⁴²Unesco, ed. *The Race Question in Modern Science* (1956), Rpt. Leo Kuper, ed. *Race, Science, and Society.* (Paris/New York: Unesco and Columbia University Press, 1975) 3.

⁴³Rupert Emerson. Africa and United States Policy. (englewood Cliffs,

N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1967) 7.

⁴⁴A key document that illustrates the new emphasis on health aid in U.S. and African foreign policy ties is Willard L. Thorp [Assistant Secretary of Economic Affairs]. "A Common Responsibility for Achieving Health Security." *The Department of State Bulletin*. Vol. 26, No. 667 (April 7, 1952) 541-544.

⁴⁵Ann McElroy and P. K. Townsend. *Medical Anthropology in Ecological Perspective*. (Boulder, CO: Westview, 1985) 49.

⁴⁶Michel S. Laguerre. *Afro-Caribbean Folk Medicine*. (South Hadley, MA: Bergin & Garvey, 1987) 86.

Critique

Theories about inherent racial characteristics, both those purporting to be scientifically (empirically) based and those emanating from the "soft" sciences, have changed dramatically over the past century and a half. As David McBride notes, the basis for research about the etiology of disease and the provision of health care in the United States has been and continues to be empirically questionable. McBridefurther argues that the American health care approach has been significantly influenced by cultural, social, and economic factors which had little or no relation to scientific truth.

This article progresses in a clear and easily understood fashion through three distinct and identifiable historical periods. McBride notes that the mid-nineteenth century was typified by the view that blacks were a specific racial group predisposed to certain illnesses and general poor health. In The Red and the Black, Hoover supports the view that American blacks were believed to be inferior because they were descendants of Africans, who, it was claimed, lacked civilization.¹ Black inferiority was substantiated in various ways. The Bible was frequently cited as the historical source for proof of the black race's baseness; the prevailing notion here was that blacks had been created prior to Adam, and therefore, were not of human origin, but rather were cousins, albeit higher functioning, of apes.² This notion, if believed, formed the basis for contending that blacks lacked a soul and was virulently racist. As McBride notes, the other commonly cited argument used to prove black inferiority was based on the works of Charles Darwin. Charles Brace, a reformer, employed Darwin's research which held that man had originated in one place, but had then migrated to various climatic areas which caused the evolution, through natural selection, of permanent, differing racial types. That these racial types were not equal was confirmed by Brace's argument that intermarriage between different

races would result in inferior offspring. In fact, one of the most common beliefs of that time was that the black race would eventually become extinct because blacks suffered inherent physical, intellectual, and cultural deficiencies.

By the time the First World War ended, it was clear that blacks had not become extinct. If anything, the racial issues became more problematic; blacks were more visible because of their service in the army and the post-war riots, and also because of the black migration that increased their number in northern cities.

At the turn of the century, anthropologist Franz Boas argued persuasively for cultural relativism at a time when native Americans, feeling threatened by the immense wave of European immigration, did not view blacks to be quite as equal as the other ethnic groups he studied. While he contended that blacks, specifically Africans, did indeed have a culture worthy of study, he nevertheless felt that blacks had primitive traits which he ascribed to random genetic inheritance. Thus, he left the door open to improvement of the racial group, primarily through intermarriage with southern European immigrants.³ Others, however, believed that racial mixing would be bad for both races. The members of the Eugenics Movement, who were primarily biological scientists, subscribed to the theory that inferior races should be limited in their ability to reproduce and insisted that selective mating should occur. They were unabashedly opposed to racial mixing. In any case, as McBride points out, such ideas did nothing to encourage research aimed at preventing disease or alleviating public health problems in the black community since it was still believed that blacks were genetically and constitutionally inferior.

Post World War II was the final era discussed. McBride argues persuasively that changes in the political climate of the world, together with significantly more contact between Americans and Africans altered much of the racially biased thinking which had characterized the previous one hundred years. Political necessity, combined with a positive regard for cultural pluralism, has indeed encouraged the conduct of research and clinical practice relevant to non-whites. While McBride's historical analysis vividly and accurately chronicles the changing tide of scientific opinion, the conclusions that he draws raise questions of concern. His assertion that culture and environment should receive overwhelming precedence in the search for knowledge about illness and how best to approach its manifestations, ignores current empirical evidence. In his urgency to finally put racialism to rest, his philosophical beliefs raise the spectre of ignoring real racial differences because it is politically and socially expedient to do so. Such an approach would have us deny the existence of a genetic disorder such as sickle cell disease. It would a priori direct research in black health issues (such as their increased rates of diabetes and heart disease, higher mortality from cancer, and high incidence of hypertension) toward conclusions that environment, culture, and economic deprivation, rather than possible genetic and biochemical factors, are the prime cause of black illness. It is more than likely that predisposition to illness and illness itself result from a combination of genetic, biochemical, and environmental factors. What we must guard against is a swing of the philosophical pendulum that causes those concerned with public health and, specifically, the health of minorities to ignore relevant evidence because it is not fashionable: such behavior would only constitute a new form of racism.

> -Celia J. Wintz Houston Community College

Notes

¹Dwight W. Hoover. *The Red and The Black*. (Chicago: Rand McNally, 1976) 173.

²*Ibid.*, 175.

²Ibid., 233. See also Cary D. Wintz. Black Culture and The Harlem Renaissance. (Houston: Rice University Press, 1988) 10-11.

Critique

David McBride unravels an informative set of historical events linking blacks and the prevailing health care beliefs and practices during the 110 years between 1850 and 1960. That true and empirical medico-sociological research was unavailable in the late 1800s and early 1900s is well recognized, and one need only to review these dates and the literature available on this topic to find these major research limitations.

McBride also makes a case for the lack of holistic health care provided to blacks and the biased, misinformed approach used during this time frame. Mechanic (1975) and Bullough (1982) place clinical discoveries in the socio-cultural context so long deserved. Blacks are identified by McBride as being selected out of this context and victims of subsequent and sometimes erroneous research findings used to generalize inaccurately from these early pseudo-research studies. While this premise holds true for blacks, it also applies to other ethnic populations. These early research efforts have remained negative reminders of the research patchwork which has affected health care practices throughout the years. The unfortunate situation is that these same early mis-studies continue to surface and to be used as evidence by those who continue to misperceive the health care needs of blacks.

McBride uses an effective walk-through approach to three major time periods of racialism, anti-racialism and cultural relativism. One needs to note that this study focuses on medical practitioners and does not address health care views and practices of other healthcare practitioners. Using the term "medical" tends to group all health care providers as one and the same in the public's eye.

The literature review is appropriately cited and nicely completed for reader update. However, one is left with the impression that other documentation may be available though not included here. The depiction of the hapless, black patient in Africa (Walton, 1925) and the dissenters' views of Boas and Herskovitz added reading interest. The influence of environment and genetics on the occurrence of disease in blacks was discussed openly and objectively.

Of particular importance to the reader as a learner is the author's inclusion of a broader, international perspective of black health. That is, through the United Nations and UNESCO's efforts in public health and informational campaigns, America's changing health perspectives are discussed. Following the period of medical radicalism, the author discusses the evolutionary 1950-1960s as a period when the United States provided medical assistance to African nations. This aid, carried out under the guise of altruism, was actually carried out with a self-promoting interest according to McBride. The motive, to expand America's "leverage over other super powers vying for political, military and economic benefits that the independent African nations offered," was openly stated by Thorp (1952).

Of greatest importance to readers is the author's evidence for the need to provide a sound socio-cultural context and framework for black studies in medicine. Socio-cultural and cross cultural approaches are suggested. However, one hopes that the term "culture" is further defined to include ethnicity, socio-economic status, and geography. The stages of acculturation/assimilation of the individuals into the majority culture also need to be considered as influences. These considerations can make significant differences in the research studies conducted, their findings, and in the quality of medical care provided to individuals of various ethnic backgrounds. These major influences affect the level of care and manner in which care is given by nurses, social workers and others.

Health care professionals today are becoming more aware and sensitive to the multi-cultural diveristy, ethnic values, and beliefs which contribute to the health and wellness of black patients as well as other clients. Providing quality care is a priority. Incorporating these values into a holistic approach to care is also becoming a high priority for caregivers. Hospitals, clinics and other health care agencies are devoting resources to conduct sound clinical research and to provide reliable continuing education for their personnel to provide quality health care to their patients. And, quality defined as a whole package of technical care in a bio-psycho-social context is now the expected norm. Schools of medicine, nursing and allied health are also emphasizing these issues for their students. The need continues, however, to communicate these educational needs to health care providers who interpret research findings for their clinical practice settings.

The author needs to make a stronger summation and pleafor continued research efforts that truly make a difference in the health care of blacks and other ethnic groups. Future implications for research in ethnic health care are significant especially when one considers that blacks and other minorities are becoming majorities in parts of this country. These ethnic minorities are settling in major cities and communities. Additionally, future health care resarch of ethnic groups needs to be conducted by interdisciplinary teams of qualified researchers to identify specific and relevant needs in medicine, nursing, pharmacy, psychiatry, rehabilitation and prevention beyond the traditional illness model. This focus needs to be on a holistic view of the ethnic group's particular needs. Although researchers need to identify ethnic-specific needs, health care providers also need to be careful *not* to stereotype patients and the needs of those who may be members of an ethnic group. The bottom line must be that the professional focus be on the *individual*, the assessment of that individual, and the appropriate treatment and care modality appropriate to that client/patient, regardless of ethnicity.

> -Helen M. Castillo Vanderbilt University

Equity and Excellence in Education— Compatible Concepts or Hostile Abstractions?

Theresa E. McCormick

Education is the regulation of the process of coming to share in the social consciousness; and the adjustment of the individual activity on the basis of this social consciousness is the only sure method of social reconstruction.¹ — John Dewey

Equity, Excellence and Trends of the 1980s

Since 1983, with the publication of five well-known national reports calling for reform in education,² the later release of other reports by prestigious groups (such as the Carnegie Task Force on Teaching as a Profession and the Holmes Group), and the enactment of approximately 700 state statutes focused on school reform,³ the push for excellence has overshadowed earlier commitments to equity in schools. As Orlich writes, "In at least one instance, implementing the proposals of these two groups [Carnegie and Holmes] would have the same undesirable effect: reducing the number of minority teachers from few to virtually none."4 This movement for excellence has had a narrowing effect on the level of social consciousness concerning sex and race equity in schools and in society. Any movement which restricts the growth of equity should be examined critically; for it, both as a topic of study and as a fact in practice, is a necessary component of an excellent and complete preparation of teachers in a pluralistic society. By providing programs that both "preach and practice" equity principles, today's teacher educators assist the next generation of teachers to develop a contextual understanding of the field of teaching and a heightened social consciousness of their role in education.

The need for educators to address the interrelated issues of equity and excellence is made clear by recent national events and trends. Not only has the Executive branch of government abandoned equity issues but also the Judicial branch has made decisions in recent years which adversely affect educational equity for females and minorities. For example, the impact of Title IX (1972, P.L. 92-318)—which prohibits discrimination on the basis of sex against students and any employee of a school receiving federal assistance—was severely curtailed by the *Grove* City College v. Bell Supreme Court case in 1984. While the Court's ruling narrowed Title IX's coverage and threatened the effectiveness of other civil rights statutes, efforts to pass the Civil Rights Restoration Act floundered in the U.S. Congress for nearly four years before it was finally enacted on March 22, 1988, with a rider tacked on to appease antiabortion constituents. The Act requires that all universities and colleges which receive federal funding must provide coverage in their health plans for gynecological services, pregnancy and pregnancy-related conditions. The rider allows religiously controlled schools to request an exemption from these requirements if compliance would infringe on a religious belief.⁵

Immedially following the 1988 presidential election, the U.S. Department of Justice requested the Supreme Court to review the 1973 *Roe v. Wade* decision that legalized abortion. This move to dismantle *Roe v. Wade* is a strong indicator of the Bush administration's direction on civil rights for women.⁶ In its July 3, 1989, decision in the Missouri case, Webster v. Reproductive Health Services, the Supreme Court significantly curtailed women's constitutional right to abortion by giving states much more power to limit abortions.⁷

In addition, the disappearance of the Equal Rights Amendment from our national agenda of concerns and the Supreme Court's anti-civil rights decisions of 1989, indicate the comfortable complacency of our patriarchal leaders as well as their retreat from activism for civil rights for females, minorities, and the poor.⁸ For example, the Supreme Court's January, 1989, decision in the *City of Richmond v. J.A. Croson Co.* case ruled against the affirmative action "set aside" program for hiring of minorities in Richmond, Virginia.⁹ This decision bans racial quotas in awarding public work projects by state and local governments and allows white workers to legally challenge court-approved affirmative action plans.

Not only has the Reagan legacy undermined the legal underpinnings of civil rights but also its negative effect has "trickled down" to schools. The Reagan administration blamed the lack of excellence in the schools in the pursuit of equity. As Charol Shakeshaft reflects:

In retrospect, it appears that the release of A Nation At Risk was the event that those who are ideologically opposed to equality of education were awaiting to launch their attack. President Reagan... claimed that one reason that the schools were failing was the attention that had been focused on female, minority, and handicapped students... what the President failed to note is that, if these three groups of students are eliminated, only about 15% of the school population remains.¹⁰

These comments reflect a growing concern that the national reports calling for reform in education strongly link excellence with elitism to the

detriment of a significant portion of our school population. In a discussion of causes of conflict in schooling, Joel Spring says that an argument could be made "... that the best way to maintain political control is to deny schooling to all children except those of the elite."¹¹ Since this is untenable due to industry's need for an educated work force, Spring contends:

Consequently, a major conflict in modern educational systems arises between elites, who want to use schooling to control the population, and the dispossessed who want to use it to advance their social, political, and economic rights.¹²

The recurrence of conflict between the "haves" and the "have nots" in education is as American as the proverbial apple pie. While it is distressing that support and funding for civil rights and equity concerns have lost momentum at the national and state levels of government, of equal concern is that other elected officials, legal officers, the public and many educators fail to see the interdependence between equity and excellence. This is due, I think, to the still deeply ingrained and dysfunctional white male perspective that rejects the realities of cultural pluralism in the U.S. and to the view that equates excellence with measurable academic achievement. These views reflect remnants of social Darwinism (the academically fit will survive) and result from the logic of post-industrial U.S. society, a meritocracy, wherein, as Daniel Bell says, "Differential status and differential income are based on technical skills and higher education."13 A meritocracy is based on credentials and certification of achievement and the gatekeepers for these credentials are still white males who maintain power and arbitrate what is "excellent" and what is "equitable," both in society and in education, to perpetuate business as usual in their favor.

Perhaps these current events and trends concerning equity in education should come as no surprise and should be viewed cynically as part of the debris resulting from the historic neglect of the education of females and minorities and the persistence of the "genetic deficit" model of thinking.¹⁴ However, this stance not being tenable, educators must persist in efforts to unite excellence and equity, both in theory and in practice. The two ideas are compatible concepts, not hostile abstractions; however, the prevailing myth based on dualistic, either/or thinking is that one is attained only at the expense of the other. As Glen Harvey asserts, "... there are sound arguments for the view that labeling as 'excellent' an education that is inequitable is an abuse of the term... The choice is not between an excellent and an equal education, but between demanding that education be both excellent and equitable and agreeing to accept less."¹⁵ Ira Shore affirms, "Equality is excellence and inequality leads to alienation. Excellence without equality produces only more inequality. Inequality leads to learning deficits and resistance in the great mass of students."¹⁶

This paper will review some of the myths of equality, address the

necessity of incorporating equity concepts and practices into teacher educations programs and into the ongoing education reform debate, explore some implications for future leadership, and make recommendations for attaining both excellence and equity in education. The goal is to bring a new "voice" to the reform debate, a voice that draws on feminist pedagogy to help transform education so that the education of all students is taken seriously.¹⁷

Myths of Economic and Occupational Equality

As indicated in the previous discussion, one explanation for the decline of emphasis on equity in education is that the administrations in Washington since 1980 have not been ideologically attuned to such concerns due to the prevailing philosophy supporting a powerful white patriarchal system that controls resources and excludes women and minorities for the most part. As Shakeshaft says, "The logic behind the attack on equity goes something like this: excellence and equity are different; equity threatens to take resources away from excellence; therefore, let's abandon equity as a national concern so as to pursue excellence exclusively."¹⁸

However, another ironic explanation for the decline of emphasis on equity in education lies in the perceived "successes" of the civil rights and women's movements of the 1960s and 1970s. Because of the so-called advancements made during those years, it is commonly heard that sex inequity in education is a relic of the past, like hoop skirts. Advancements usually cited to support this belief are the increasing numbers of women enrolling in postsecondary education and graduating with advanced degrees. Also cited are examples of women entering non-traditional fields of work and climbing the corporate ladder.

That we have a continuing problem concerning educational and economic equity is denied or ignored by a significant portion of our population who only look at "surface" advancements and accept many of the popular myths about the progress women and minorities have made during the last twenty years. While the political winds may be "kinder and gentler" under the Bush administration, they are still gusting strongly to the right, with every new gust indicating that we are moving beyond a luke-warm climate to a pre-equity freeze-zone for women and minorities. When major segments of our society are denied equity, the delicate fabric of civil rights for all of society is weakened. It cannot be stated too strongly that inequity in education feeds inequity in the home and in the workplace.¹⁹

This is a prime time to challenge the myths of equality that still persist. One such myth is the notion that because of the Women's Movement, which rendered greater access to education and other opportunities, women are now better off financially than in the past. The fact is that even with the same education as a man, a woman still earns much less. As Ivan Illich states unequivocally, economic discrimination against women has clearly been established by fifteen years of feminist research.²⁰ He, and others such as Gollnick and Chinn²¹ challenge the myth that with more education, earnings are increased for women. Illich says, "The current median lifetime income of a female graduate, even if she has an advanced degree, is still only comparable to that of male dropouts."²²

While more and more women are entering the workforce, with a small percentage in high-status, high-paying positions, over-all, they still earn from 60 to 69 cents for each dollar earned by men. Succinctly, Illich states, "The wage gap is larger in the States now than it was twenty years ago,"²³ Clearly, Margaret Mead's observations made forty years ago are sustained today,

Men may cook or weave, or dress dolls or hunt humming birds, but if such activities are appropriate occupations of men, then the whole society, men and women alike, votes them as important. When the same occupations are performed by women, they are regarded as less important.²⁴

Another noteworthy and worrisome example that challenges the myth that women have overcome financial inequality is the growing poverty of women, "the feminization of poverty" in the United States. The pauperization of children goes hand-in-hand with that of women. Marian Wright Edelman states, "Many children are poor in the U.S. because of the growth of single parent families, too often headed by a teen-aged mother. Many of these single parents want to work but lack skills or work experience."²⁵

About half of all poor families in the United States are headed by females. Referring to 1984 Bureau of the Censes data, Sleeter and Grant note the following:

... while the average married-couple family earned \$29,612 and the average unmarried male earned \$23,325, the average unmarried female earned only \$12,803 . . . This situation heavily affects children: ... about 21% of American children in 1985 were living in poverty, a proportion that had risen over time. ... 26

Helping to explain the rise in poverty among children and women, in spite of the increase in the number of women working outside the home, is the fact that they are still predominantly employeed in low-paying occupations. Sleeter and Grant observe that ". . . over 85% of female workers in 1982 were concentrated in low-paying 'pink-collar' ghettos, such as clerical work, nursing, teaching, daycare, health services, and domestic service.... And even in 1984, the jobs paying the most were still dominated by men."²⁷ These Census data included both African-American and Anglo-American women and men.

In a 1985 study of 100 female-headed black families in the Boston area, the data revealed that they did *not* fit into the mold of the stereotypic large family dependent upon welfare; rather, most of the families in the study were composed of a single mother working at a low-paying job to

23

support one child and herself.28

Black women still suffer a wage disparity with all other groups of wage earners; yet, as George Jackson attests, the myth persists that blacks have reached parity in the labor force and are too persistent and aggressive in their demands for education, jobs and justice.²⁹ These misperceptions are maintained because of the myopia of a majority of citizens whose vision is still clouded by the ethnocentric sense of Anglo superiority and by a related blindness to the very real institutional racism that keeps African-Americans from advancing.

The issues of racism and sexism are inextricably linked when one is examining equity and education in the United States. One issue cannot be considered without the other intruding, especially when discussing the concerns of African-American women. It has been said that they are in double jeopardy in our society because of their race and sex. They have had dual obstacles to overcome in attaining their aspirations.

The well-known and marked differences in the historical experiences, socialization patterns, and status between African-American women and Anglo-American women suggest some of the complexities of achieving sex equity in a white male-dominated educational system. That so many African-American women have made significant contributions to education (Mary McLeod Bethune, Charlotte Forten Grimkel, Nannie Helen Burroughs) and to fields as varied as medicine (Rebecca Lee); law (Charlott Ray); and the arts (Edmonia Lewis) is testimony to their strength and tenacity.³⁰

A clue to the achievements (in spite of the odds) of African-American women lies in their history. They experienced the economic necessity of earning a living to help support their families long before Anglo-American women entered the work force in comparable numbers. This long history of work outside the home fostered the African-American woman's independence and equalitarian position in the family. Out of their struggle for human dignity, they developed a tradition of self reliance.³¹ Undoubtedly, Anglo-American working women could learn a lot about coping skills from these women who have been working outside of their own home for so many years. For example, African-American women have developed networks of supportive family members (including other children) and friends to help with child care.³²

Running parallel with the data on the poverty of women and their low-paying jobs is this correlate: Women continue to be underrepresented in high-status managerial, administrative positions in government, business and education. Illustrating this phenomenon in schools, Gollnick and Chinn comment, "... 67% of all public school teachers are women, whereas over 82% of the principals are men."³³ Harvey also highlights the disparities between male and female educators in leadership positions by making some historical comparisons. She indicates that presently, at the *secondary education level*, the percentage of women who are principals (about 10%) is less than in the 1950s.³⁴ This bleak picture of few female administrators in public schools is mirrored in higher education. Metha reports that, "Eighty-six percent of the administrators in higher education are men."³⁵ Taking stock of departments and colleges of education across the country, the same skewed pattern of male administrators is noted.

Lack of role models for female college students is a serious issue, not only in relation to administrators, but also in having women faculty available. This is especially significant for minority females because there are so few minority women faculty on campuses today.³⁶ These examples should help nullify the myth that female students and educators now have the same access to leadership opportunities as males. **Myths of Classroom Equality**

In addition to the myths of economic and occupational equality that future teachers need to understand are some persistent misconceptions about classroom equality. Adhering to such myths can influence teacher decision making about the education of females and disguise the reality of differential treatment of males and females in schools. Differential educational opportunity and treatment result in self-esteem problems among females and in differential outcomes, both in educational achievement and eventually in occupational and economic achievement.

A whole set of myths has developed around the school environment in which students learn. Shared by many parents and teachers is the myth that elementary schools are more hospitable to girls than to boys. Countering this myth about school climate Harvey says:

...it is typically the academic and behavioral problems of boys, not those of girls, that are the primary focus of the school's energy and resources. Thus what is perceived to be a supportive environment for girls is in reality one that ignores female learning deficits. What is perceived to be hostile to boys is really an emphasis on early identification and attention to male learning deficits.³⁷

Another myth, that all students receive equal instructional treatment in classrooms, has gained credence as a result of efforts over the past twenty years to raise awareness concerning equity in education. However, this notion has been shown to be wishful thinking by a recent research report compiled by the Organization for Economic Co-Operation and Development³⁸ and by Myra and David Sadkers' studies. In summary, the Sadkers' research (which included both minority and white teachers and students of both sexes) indicates that: (1) Boys receive more attention from instructors than girls do. (2) Boys are given more time to talk in the classroom. (3) Boys receive more precise teacher feedback than girls do. (4) Boys get more detailed instructions about how to do things for themselves, while girls are more likely to have the task done for them. (5) Minority girls receive the least attention from teachers. (6) Teachers are usually unaware that they interact differentially with boys and girls.³⁹

In a 1987 commentary on their research, the Sadkers state:

The student most likely to be involved in an intellectual exchange with the instructor is a white male.... Second in line for instructor time and attention are minority males. The third group is white females, while the least interactive group of students are minority females. That rank order may sound familiar because it also represents the payscale. [emphasis mine] In the workplace, a major part of value and recognition is represented by the size of the paycheck, with white males receiving the most money and minority females the least. In the classroom, the currency is teacher attention and questions, and the same pattern prevails. [emphasis mine]⁴⁰

These research findings and comments point to the significant role that the teacher plays in the socialization of female students to be passive and dependent and of male students to be more assertive and independent. Such traits contribute directly to the student's academic achievement, aspirations, and later career choices and/or options.

Differential teacher interactions with male and female students also help explain why talented girls are less likely to become committed to careers even though their overall grades are better than boys';⁴¹ why the self-esteem of college women declines as they progress through their college training;⁴² and why girls graduating from high school since 1972 have lower SAT scores both in reading and in basic computation than boys'.⁴³ The latter point is especially disturbing in view of the fact that girls start school equal to or ahead of boys in both skill areas.

In spite of the discouraging trends just noted, there are two encouraging conclusions drawn from the Sadkers' studies (which included multicultural populations of both students and teachers): That focused teacher training can reduce or eliminate bias from classroom interactions and that increasing equity in classrooms also increases the overall effectiveness of the teacher. In the Sadkers' equity programs, teachers, in a modified microteaching setting,

... practiced equitable teaching skills, received feedback on their performance, and practiced again.... The trained instructors at all levels achieved equity in verbal distributions; ... [they] had higher rates of interaction [than the control groups], more precise reactions, more academic contacts, and a great number of student-initiated comments. In short, the training resulted in more intentional and more direct teaching. Developing equity in teaching had promoted excellence as well.⁴⁴

While research indicates that teachers can learn how to change their classroom interactions and the school climate to be more supportive of female and minority students, social custom, resistance to change, and stereotypes continue to play a powerful role in maintaining a biased education system.

Leadership for the 21st Century

The fact that women are now breaking through **some** barriers of the past is due largely to the consciousness-raising and education induced by the women's movement and the civil rights movement. However, a polarity is developing between the generations, with the "post-feminist" younger generation of females expressing a sense of alienation from the movement which made possible their current advancement. The young women who deny that sexism permeates society and education say that they have never experienced discrimination and feel that the struggles and victories of the women's movement are like vague tales from by-gone days. Critics attribute this denial to apathy or to the internalization of traditional female socialization to be passive, nonconfrontive and conformist. Denial of inequality occurs for many reasons, but a prime one, according to Linda Ellerbee⁴⁵ is that feminism (the belief in equality between males and females) is seen as unattractive by younger women who believe the myth that feminism means "turning the tables on men."

A renewed dialogue between women of all ages and of all racial and ethnic groups is urgently needed to redefine our agenda for the future one which addresses our common concerns. As Florence Howe observes:

While it is necessary for women to unite around a common agenda for continued advancement, it is also imperative that the teaching aspect of the women's movement be revived and reinforced in the socialization and education of males presently in positions of leadership and power and of those who will share those positions in the future. A study of sex equity in relation to excellence in education holds relevance and the possibility of benefit to males as well as to females.

One final myth—that women do not make good leaders—needs to be exhumed and exposed before it becomes further ingrained in society and in educators' thinking and practice. Leadership skills are not sexual attributes, rather they are learned through socialization and cultural conditioning. Traditional training of Anglo-American males to be ambitious, assertive and goal-oriented provides them with an advantage for leadership roles that was not afforded to females and minorities. Functioning at a societal level, the traditional separation of males and females into provider and nurturer roles bound them into a patriarchal system in which she, to be an ideal woman, had to be selfless and he, to be ideal, had to be competitive and individualistic.⁴⁷

Growing out of the last two decades of social change, a reevaluation of traditional male and female sex roles and leadership styles has gained momentum. Referred to as the "beta" leadership style by Nickels and Ashcraft, women's leadership is characterized as integrative, people oriented, and focused on long-range goals. In contrast, the male "alpha" style is more centered on individualistic power, hierarchical relationships, and short-term goals.⁴⁸

The problem has been that only the "alpha" style has been valued and permitted to flourish in our white male-dominated institutions. Nickles and Ashcraft state that the "beta" "perspective involves a sensitivity to those who are not in power and fosters a more fertile environment for growth and learning. Within this system, women will provide a positive rather than a negative leadership force."⁴⁹ In this light, it is valid to teach all students overtly that women *do* have special strengths in the areas of communication and interpersonal skills which have been institutionally negated in the past, but which indeed, are prerequisites for effective leadership.

Shakeshaft reports that studies have found that men and women school administrators approach the job in different ways and create different school climates. She says:

In schools with female administrators, the following things tend to occur: Relationships with others become central. Women spend more time with people, communicate more, care more about individual differences, and more concerned with other teachers and with marginal students, and are better motivators than men.... Building community is an essential part of a woman administrator's style. From speech patterns to decision-making styles, women exhibit a more democratic participatory style of leadership than men, a style that encourages inclusiveness rather than exclusiveness in schools.⁵⁰

Research clearly indicates that sex discrimination which devalues women is the reason that they do not become school administrators.⁵¹ The loss to our communities and nation from not having access to a balance of leadership styles and the skills that women have to offer is inestimable. Not only at the local and national levels are women's leadership skills greatly needed, but this need prevails also in the global arena.

The fact of growing global interdependence prompts futurists to project that leadership for the 21st century must be geared toward global understanding and cooperation in order to avert conflict and possible annihilation. The infusion of the "beta" perspective into the present androcentric global system—where, as Fritjof Capra indicates, agression and dominance are equated with masculinity, and where "warfare is held to be the ultimate initiation into true manhood"—could not only aid women in fulfilling their leadership potential, but also could be a key to our global survival.⁵²

Conclusion

Emerging in the last twenty years is a truer picture of both Anglo and minority women's leadership roles in our national development. In spite of the cultural restraints on females' full participation in a patriarchal society and a biased recording of history, it is now widely known that women have been actively involved in theological thought, government and politics, abolition, social and humanitarian reform, artistic creation and performance, industrialization and labor movements, as well as in the traditional female occupations of social work, nursing and teaching. The leadership qualities and strengths of women which prompted these national contributions can and should be extended to the global community where a diversity of problem solving and decision making skills are sorely needed.

In order to bring the "voice" of women into the debate about education reform and to promote the accomplishment of both excellence *and* equity in education, the following recommendations are offered specifically for the consideration of teacher educators:

(1) Integrate accurate information about the contributions, history, values and perspectives of *both* sexes and about different racial and ethnic groups into the content of all teacher education courses. This means transforming the curriculum from one of white male dominance over the "content and substance of knowledge itself" to one that "interweaves issues of gender with ethnicity, race, and class."^{5:3}

(2) Require a course in the teacher preparation program on multicultural nonsexist education and require that it be taught on a rotating basis by all faculty, not only by a specialist in that field.

(3) Infuse equity concepts and practices into all aspects and phases of the teacher education program (e.g. advising, evaluation, academic program, pre-student teaching field experiences, student teaching, and placement).

(4) Provide students with role models who are sensitive to and knowledgeable about women's issues and concerns. This means that teacher education programs must provide staff development for faculty and administrators on equity issues and strategies and take affirmative steps to hire more women faculty and administrators (both minority and Anglo).

(5) Initiate a mentoring program for minority female students and faculty members.

(6) Incorporate a balanced use of cooperative learning and problem solving strategies into teacher education courses instead of the usual use of competitive approaches.

(7) Critique teaching materials (texts, media, computer software and evaluation instruments) for sex bias.

(8) Actively promote self-esteem among female students and encourage leadership behaviors.

(9) Take feminist teacher educators, women students and their education seriously. Because the teaching field, often called "women's true profession," is largely made up of women, isn't it time that education reformers and teacher educators listened to what women have to say about teaching?

Notes

¹John Dewey. "My Pedagogical Creed." Three Thousand Years of Educational Wisdom—Selections From Great Documents. R. Ulrich, ed. (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1959) 637.

²The five national reports published in 1983 are: (1)*A Nation at Risk* (The National Commission on Excellence in Education), (2) *Making the Grade* (Twentieth Century Fund), (3) *Academic Preparation for College* (The College Board), (4) *Educating Americans for the 21st Century* (National Science Foundation), (5) *Action for Excellence* (Education Commission of the States).

³Donald Orlich. "Education Reforms: Mistakes, Misconceptions, Miscues." *Phi Delta Kappan*. Vol. 70, No. 7 (March, 1989) 512-517. 4**Ibid.**, 514

⁵National NOW Times. "Title IX Complaints Pick Up After Passage of the CRRA." Vol. 21, No. 4 (October, November, December, 1988) 13.

⁶National NOW Times. "High Court Asked to Review Roev. Wade." Vol. 21, No. 4 (October, November, December, 1988) 1.

⁷"States Can Limit Abortions." *The Daily Tribune* [Ames, Iowa] (July 3, 1989) A1-A2.

⁸Alain Sanders. "Chipping Away At Civil Rights." *Time*. Vol. 133, No. 26 (June 26, 1989) 63, 66; James P. Gannon. "Reagan's Shadow Over Civil Rights." *Des Moines Sunday Register*. (January 29, 1989) 2C.

⁹City of Richmond v. J.A. Croson Co. U.S. Supreme Court Bulletin. Vol. 49, No. 36A (May 8, 1989) B764-B860.

¹⁰Charol Shakeshaft. "A Gender at Risk." *Phi Delta Kappan.* Vol. 67, No. 7 (March, 1986) 499.

¹¹Joel Spring. Conflict of Interests—The Politics of American Education. (New York: Longman, 1988) 25.

¹²Ibid.

¹³Daniel Bell. "On Meritocracy and Equality." *Power and Ideology in Education*. J. Karabel and A. Halsey, eds. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1977) 607-635.

¹⁴Judith Whyte. "The Development of Sex Stereotyped Attitudes Among Boys and Girls: Different Models of Their Origins and Their Educational Implications." *Girls and Women in Education—A Cross-National Study* of Sex Inequalities in Upbringing and in Schools and Colleges. (Paris: Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development, 1986) 57.

¹⁵Glen Harvey. "Finding Reality Among the Myths: Why What You Thought About Sex Equity in Education Isn't So." *Phi Delta Kappan*. Vol. 67, No. 7 (March, 1986) 511.

¹⁶Ira Shore. "Equality Is Excellence: Transforming Teacher Education and the Learning Process." *Harvard Educational Review*. Vol. 56, No. 4 (November, 1986) 411. ¹⁷Susan Laird. "Reforming 'Women's True Profession': A Case for "Feminist Pedagogy" in Teacher Education?" *Harvard Educational Review*. Vol. 58, No. 4 (November, 1988) 449-463. ¹⁸Shakeshaft, 499.

¹⁹Robert Parelius and Ann Parelius. *The Sociology of Education*. (Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, 1987) 263-307. See chapter eight, "Education and Stratification" for a full discussion of the direct connection between educational attainment and occupational and income attainment.

²⁰Ivan Illich. Gender. (New York: Pantheon Books, 1982) 22.

²¹Donna Gollnick and Philip Chinn. *Multicultural Education in A Pluralistic Society*. (Columbus: Merrill, 1986) 181.

²²Illich, 26.

²³Ibid., 25.

²⁴Margaret Mead. *Male and Female*. (New York: W. Morrow, 1949) 159.

²⁵Marian Wright Edelman. "1995: Poverty, the Underclass and the Workplace." *The World.* Vol. 2, No. 2 (March/April, 1988) 6.

²⁶Christine Sleeter and Carl Grant. *Making Choices for Multi-cultural Education: Five Approaches to Race, Class, and Gender.* (Columbus: Merrill, 1988) 10.

²⁷Ibid.

²⁸Nina McCain. "Things You Wanted to Know About Women But (Maybe) Were Afraid to Ask." *Des Moines Sunday Register*. (July 14, 1985) 7E.

²⁹George Jackson. "Racism, Affirmative Action or No Action? Black Americans from Kennedy to Reagan." *Iowa State University Daily*. (March 31, 1986) 2-3.

³⁰Charilynn Spenser and Janet Sams—Wood, eds. Catalog for Exhibit: "Black Women Achievement Against The Odds." (Washington, D.C.: The Smithsonian Institute, 1984) 1-12.

³¹Robert Staples. "The Black American Family." *Ethnic Families in America*. C. Mindel and R. Habenstein, eds. (New York: Elsevier, 1981) 221-247.

³²McCain, 7E.

³³Gollnick and Chinn, 183.

³⁴Harvey, 509-512.

³⁵Arlene Metha. "A Decade Since Title IX: Some Implications For Teacher Education." Action in Teacher Education. Vol. 5, No. 3 (Fall, 1983) 24.

³⁶Mary Gray. "Bush Must Act Quickly on Civil-Rights Issues if he is to Create a 'Kinder, Gentler Nation'". *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Vol. 35, No. 16 (December 14, 1988) B1.

³⁷Harvey, 510.

³⁸Constantina Safilios-Rothschild. "Sex Differences in Early Socialisation and Upbringing and Their Consequences for Educational Choices and Outcomes." Girls and Women in Education—A Cross-National Study of Sex Inequalities in Upbringing and in Schools and Colleges. (Paris: Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development, 1986) 38-45.

³⁹Myra Sadker and David Sadker. "Sexism in the Classroom: From Grade School to Graduate School." *Phi Delta Kappan.* Vol. 67, No. 7 (March, 1986) 512-515; Myra Sadker and David Sadker. "Sexism in the Schoolroom of the 80s." *Psychology Today.* Vol. 19, No. 3 (March, 1985) 54-57.

⁴⁰Myra Sadker and David Sadker. *The Intellectual Exchange-Excellence and Equity in College Teaching.* (Kansas City, Missouri: The Mid-Continent Regional Educational Laboratory, 1987) 32.

⁴¹Parelius and Parelius, 268-269.

⁴²Sadker and Sadker, (1986) 514.

⁴³Parelius and Parelius, 269.

⁴⁴Sadker and Sadker, 1986, 514-515.

⁴⁵Linda Ellerbee. "Rocky Progress on Road to Equality for Women." *Des Moines Sunday Register*. (February 26, 1989) 1C.

⁴⁶Florence Howe. "Sexism, Racism, and the Education of Women." *Today's Education*. Vol. 62, No. 5 (May, 1973) 48.

⁴⁷Elizabeth Nickles and Laura Ashcraft. *The Coming Matriarchy: How Women Will Gain the Balance of Power*. (New York: Berkeley Books, 1981).

⁴⁸Ibid.

⁴⁹Nichols and Ashcraft, 175.

⁵⁰Shakeshaft, 503.

⁵¹Ibid., 502.

⁵²Fritjof Capra. "National Insecurity." New Age Journal. Vol. 5, No. 2 (March/April, 1988) 41; Also see Betty Reardon. Sexism and the War System. (New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, 1985) for a full analysis of the roots of war in patriarchy and the links between sexism and militarism. For a fictional projection into the 21st century on the chilling theme of the subjugation of women in a post-nuclear war, male-dominated society, see Margaret Atwood's *The Handmaid's Tale*, 1985. Also, see Riane Eisler's *The Chalice and the Blade* (1987), in which she describes the biggest cover-up in history: The thousands of years of egalitarian peaceful living by men and women in pre-patriarchial times. ⁵³Jane R. Martin. "Excluding Women from the Educational Realm." *Harvard Educational Review*. Vol. 52, No. 2 (May, 1982) 133-148; Mary Thompson Tetreault. "Integrating Content about Women and Gender into the Curriculum." *Multicultural Education Issues and Perspectives*. J. Banks and C. McGee Banks, eds. (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1989) 124-144.

Critique

Theresa McCormick argues that equity and excellence in education should not be accepted as being on opposite ends of a continuum, but rather should be viewed as two related components of education. The twin concepts of equity and excellence are compatible and must be identified as important goals of education. Educators at all instructional levels in all subject disciplines need to include a study of and value these educational and social concepts. These concepts can be taught to young people as "fairness" and "goodness." More mature students can examine the concepts from the perspective of several academic disciplines.

The article could be examined as three shorter writings incorporated into a longer article which concludes with overall recommendations for teacher educators. The information presented should be well known to those interested in gender and minority issues; however, McCormick attempts to link gender and minority issues and asks if the achievement of equity and excellence are hostile or compatible to each other.

McCormick provides background information concerning the educational reform movement of the 1980s. She notes the major reform reports provide strong statements concerning the need to achieve educational excellence, but that these reports fail to recognize the ongoing inequities in education. The reports assume that equity has been achieved due to social and economic reforms of the 1960s and 1970s, and because of these reforms, a lack of excellence exists in our schools. What needs further examination are other variables which extend beyond the school but influence educational achievement for all students.

McCormick blames the Reagan and Bush administrations, Congressional inaction, and judicial decisions for turning back earlier equity victories for women and minorities. She notes the national attitude of retrenchment concerning opportunities for women and minorities is clearly evident in education at all levels but does not offer recommendations for the formulation of social policy which would provide equity for all citizens.

Finally, McCormick addresses equity issues related directly to the educational setting. It is well known that for many reasons male students receive greater individualized attention in the classroom and in time assume leadership positions in education and elsewhere. These inequitible practices hinder the intellectual abilities and leadership skills of female and minority students. What needs to be studied are the efforts to undo classroom inequities and injustices and the long term results of these efforts.

McCormick concludes by offering nine suggestions for teacher educators to use in designing teacher education programs. For the most part these recommendations are not new but are included in many of the state human relations requirements already in place for teacher certification or are included in program review criteria. What is important to recognize is that teacher education extends across the university and these issues need to be addressed in multiple settings. As a nation we cannot afford to lose the abilities and skills of one half or more of our population. It is estimated that within the next two decades, those who are minorities today will be majorities. At present persons or minority backgrounds already constitute the majority of students in the schools of several states.

Little, if any, research has been conducted to evaluate the impact of these requirements on individuals completing human relations coursework. Intuitive knowledge indicates these efforts seem to be effective; however, there is little data to support this knowledge as to the effectiveness of such programs. The lack of published evaluations research studies offers numerous possibilities for the development of new research models and evaluations instruments.

> -Margaret A. Laughlin University of Wisconsin Green Bay

National Newspaper Analysis of the Press Coverage of Jesse Jackson's 1984 Presidential Campaign: The Confirmation of the Candidate*

J. Gregory Payne, Scott C. Ratzan, and Robert A. Baukus

Jesse Jackson's 1984 and 1988 presidential campaigns have motivated thousands of citizens throughout America to take a more active role in politics. The 1984 campaign witnessed many previously unregistered Americans actively participating in Jackson's call to join the "Rainbow Coalition." Four years later, Jackson once again hit a responsive chord within the American electorate, broadening his support base in his second run for the White House. His vibrant campaigns presented challenges not only to the American system of government, but also to accepted journalistic traditions in campaign reporting. Specifically, the dilemma has been a difficult one for journalists responsible for campaign coverage. How much coverage should a reporter give to Jesse Jackson's campaign? Should he be treated like an Alan Cranston or Gary Hart in 1984, or a Paul Simon or Albert Gore in 1988? Or does the historical impact of his being the first black candidate to make a serious bid for the presidency warrant a different approach to press coverage? Highlighting this dilemma in the 1984 campaign, Dates and Gandy note:

Jackson's candidacy was a challenge for the press because on the one hand journalistic traditions would dictate that the ideological orientation of the media organization would constrain its coverage to be consistent with longstanding editorial practice.¹

Yet, as Gandy and Dates point out, the national press remains aware of the "persistent complaints from their critics that they openly discriminate against minorities, or systematically ignore them."² Given such journalistic constraints and Jackson's emergence as a credible national candidate in two presidential elections, interesting questions

^{*}The authors wish to thank the Emerson College community, especially the Communication Studies department and the Emerson College Political News Student Group researchers. They also wish to thank Dean Jacqueline Liebergott at Emerson for a research grant that made the study possible. They wish to extend a special thanks to the Political News Study Group - Jane Pierce, John McDaniels and Jeff Kimball for their help with this project.

remain: How much attention and focus has Jackson's racial heritage received in the coverage? Has race often shaped the coverage content? Have there been questionable descriptive references to Jackson's blackness? What has been the mediated image of Jesse Jackson as reflected in the newspaper coverage? Are there notable trends in different parts of the country? From their analysis of Jackson's first campaign, Gandy and Dates write: "Media observers felt that Jesse Jackson was treated differently from other candidates because he had no real chance of winning the nomination."³

Purpose

In the effort to shed light on these and other questions, and to gather data necessary for an eventual comparison of the journalistic practices towards Jackson in his two national campaigns, this study examines the print media's news story coverage of the 1984 Jackson presidential effort in the New York Times, Washington Post, Chicago Tribune and Los Angeles Times. Content analyses of the following areas of interest are examined: 1) number of stories that mention Jackson; 2) total column inches devoted to the stories mentioning Jackson; 3) subject matter of the story: 4) tone of coverage—degree of bias inherent in the story, i.e., a) straight news story or no discernable bias, b) evaluative connotations positive or negative—inherent in the coverage, for example, coverage reflecting an attitude or bias through value-laden word choice or a reporter's penchant to adjudicate-to offer an "enlightened opinion" rather than solely present the facts; and 5) mediated image as reflected by descriptive references to the candidate in the coverage, i.e., Jackson referred to as a "presidential candidate," "black civil rights leader"defining characteristics which potentially shape the story's impact.

Following the descriptive analysis, a paradigm is outlined and discussed to help illustrate the various phases in the campaign coverage of the Jackson campaign.

Method

In the attempt to observe possible trends on these variables within the selected sample, each newspaper's daily edition was examined from November 3, 1983, which marked the beginning of major coverage on Jackson's impending announcement, through April 11, 1984, the day after the Pennsylvania primary. In a pilot study based on a sample of stories, the researcher independently coded and cross-examined results of the stories tabulated by trained coding teams to assure consistency in categorization.

The coders were three graduate students with training in research methods and familiar with the process and techniques of content analysis. All coders attended multiple training sessions conducted by the principle investigator. This insured the coders were aware of the operational definitions of the categorical variables and the rules of classification used in the analysis. Sample stories were coded and discussed in order to assure that the coding procedures were objective and reliable.

Results

Following the discussion of the actual number of stories and column inches, and each month's topic, tone, and mediated image, overall trends are summarized.

Number of Stories and Column Inches

Of all newspapers studied during the period, the Los Angeles Times devoted more total inches and included more stories with some reference to Jackson. In comparison, Jackson's hometown paper, the Chicago Tribune, had less than half such total inches and the least number of Jackson exclusive stories. The highest number of exclusive Jackson stories (95) was found in the Washington Post. The New York Times had the highest ratio—approximately two out of three—of Jackson exclusives to general reference stories. In contrast, while the Los Angeles Times had a comparable number of exclusives, less than half of their total general reference stories was a Jackson exclusive. Out of the 600 general reference stories of the four papers for the period examined, 58.5% or 351 were Jackson exclusives.

NOVEMBER

Topic

While all papers carried stories on Jackson's announcement and the impact of his candidacy during the month of November, the Los Angeles Times, Washington Post, and Chicago Tribune highlighted Jackson's appeal among blacks and his efforts to increase this constituency's registration. Yet, inherent in all papers was the theme that Jackson had no chance of winning the nomination, with the Tribune's tone being the most negative—"Jackson gambles and dragged along the entire democratic party."

Jackson's problem with Jews was addressed in coverage by all papers except the *Post*. The *Los Angeles Times*' coverage of a speech in which the candidate attacked organized labor's racial policies included the reporter noting that Jackson had been interrupted by hecklers of the Jewish Defense League who yelled, "Racist, anti-Semite!"

In reporting the request for secret service protection, the Los Angeles Times again mentioned the Jewish issue: "supporters requested protection because of whites opposed to his candidacy and those who reject his call for a Palestinian homeland." There was no mention of the Jewish issue by the Tribune in its coverage of the story.

Tone

The tone of the coverage during November was judged overall to be objective, with the exception of the *Tribune* which described the Jackson

campaign as one of the "contradictory themes" and exhibiting a "lack of direction . . . a lack of substance to the Rainbow Coalition."

Mediated Image

The most common descriptive reference or mediated image of Jackson in newspaper coverage was "civil rights leader" or "civil rights activist." The only exception was the *Tribune* which commonly referred to the candidate as "Chicago's Jesse Jackson." With the exception of the *Post*, the newspapers also commonly described Jackson as "the only black candidate."

DECEMBER

Topic

Jackson's proposed Syrian trip was a major issue for coverage in all papers. The IRS investigation into Jackson's Operation Push received coverage in the *Post* and *Tribune*. Jewish criticism of Jackson's Middle East policy was featured in the *Los Angeles Times*, which reported that a meeting with Gary Hart had been called off "due to Jackson's PLO leanings."

Tone

The *Tribune* coverage continued to be more evaluative than straightforward news. Columnist John Margolis wrote, "Jackson's campaign is an unconventional anti-establishment campaign"; that reporters "allow him to get away with the sweeping rhetoric that is Jackson's specialty"; and that "he often displays an extraordinary ignorance of what he is talking about."

Mediated Image

Mediated image was primarily characterized by references to "civil rights leader." The *New York Times* coverage contained more descriptive references to Jackson's race, designating him as the "only black," the "lone black" or the "black civil rights leader" in over half of the stories. Other papers tended not to include a racial reference in their coverage.

JANUARY

Topic

Jackson's successful trip to Syria, the release of Lt. Goodman, and the impact of the event on the campaign dominated coverage in all newspapers. There were also stories of Jackson's presidential debate coverage throughout the studied media. Specifically, another story on the double standard or special treatment Jackson was receiving by the media occurred in the Los Angeles Times. The Los Angeles Times also noted a failure of the campaign to attract the support of national urban black leaders. The IRS investigation into Operation Push received front page coverage in the New York Times and Tribune.

Tone

The Los Angeles Times noted that "race still casts a disturbing shadow over political campaigns" and that "Jackson doesn't get measured by his merits because of the race issue." Yet, even this tone paled in comparison to what appeared to be a consistent negative tone emerging in *Tribune* coverage. The *Tribune* described the Syrian trip as "an enhancing public relations coup" and included "blacks' views" of the Jackson effort: "his campaign is on an ego trip... He tries to annoint himself as pre-eminent leader."

Mediated Image

The Jackson mediated image was broadened and legitimized by his Syrian success. In January, he was now commonly referred to as a "Democratic presidential candidate." Nonetheless, the *Tribune* wrote of Jackson being "a preacher turned activist," "self-annointed as America's pre-eminent leader," that he "had slim chances of winning," and of his efforts to "lead a movement of crusade." The *New York Times* referred to him as a "gambler" and "leader in the black civil rights movement," noting the candidate's efforts to "lead a movement or a crusade."

FEBRUARY

Topic

The major issue in all papers analyzed was the "Hymie" incident and the candidate's effort to explain the remark. Yet, there was a nine-day delay in the *New York Times* picking up the story which broke in the *Washington Post* on February 11. The *Tribune* and *Los Angeles Times* major coverage of the incident occurred two weeks later in the context of the New Hampshire debate. Jackson's tie with Islam leader Louis Farrakhan was highlighted.

In all papers except the *New York Times*, Mayor Harold Washington's support of Jackson's candidacy was noted, with the *Washington Post* also including a picture of Louis Farrakhan registering to vote for the first time in his life. The *Los Angeles Times* and the *Tribune* included stories on Jackson's plans to visit Nicaragua.

Tone

A mood change took place in the overall tone of all four papers. The *Los Angeles Times* coverage included comments by an unnamed critic who characterized Jackson as on an "ego-trip . . . it's sort of a plastic Jesus campaign, anything goes until the whistle blows." Nancy Skelton wrote that the Jackson New Hampshire campaign has caused locals to display the same "intense curiosity that the Chinese might have displayed when Marco Polo's caravan came through," quoting a resident who said, "locals aren't used to seeing that many blacks."

The *Tribune* continued in its critical style: "the controversy surrounding the anti-Semitic remark attributed to Jackson has several parallels to Watergate." In addition, the *Tribune* noted that "gone is the firebrand revivalist kind of significance of the 'Hymie' and Farrakhan incidents, which continued to receive coverage in the papers." Yet, there was a shift to other topics in all newspapers reviewed following Jackson's success in the eastern primaries late in the month. Coverage focused on the impact of Jackson's candidacy in the southern primary states where large numbers of black voters resided. On this topic, there was a tendency to include racial references in describing Jackson, particularly in the *New York Times*, which included a reference to "plantation politics."

Tone

For the first time all papers tended to be more objective in tone, with the primary impetus for the mood change to be Jackson's success in the New York primary.

Mediated Image

The mood change in mediated image was evident in the *Tribune*'s coverage. Jackson was referred to as "flamboyant" and "charismatic" and compared favorably with Martin Luther King. The *Los Angeles Times* and *Post* primarily described Jackson as a "civil rights leader." Yet, more importantly there were more references to Jackson simply as a "Democratic presidential candidate" following the primary in New York. This marked the first time in such coverage where simple reference to Jackson's role in the campaign served as the predominant descriptive term. The exception to the finding was the *New York Times* where Jackson was sometimes referred to as the "premier black leader."

APRIL

Topic

Issues included: Jackson's strength in the primaries, as a possible powerbroker at the convention, the impact of race in politics as the "Hymie-Farrakhan-Jewish" issue. The financial problem of Operation Push was also covered in the *Post* and *Los Angeles Times*.

Tone

Tone reflected a more objective reporting style in all papers. Jackson was viewed as an "equal" and serious contender. The primary evaluative remarks concerned Jackson's refusal to denounce Farrakhan which Ron Smothers of the *New York Times* characterized as "a bit inciteful and intemperate."

Mediated Image

The media image in the papers continued to reflect a legitimization of the Jackson candidacy. He was commonly referred to as a "Democratic presidential candidate," and there were fewer racial descriptive references in the coverage.

SUMMARY OF TREND ANALYSIS

Subject Matter

The analysis suggests there is little difference in topics covered in the 1984 Jackson campaign among the various newspapers during the time period studied. Yet, in particular instances, one newspaper broke a story earlier than others. For example, Operation Push's problems with the IRS were initially reported by the *Tribune* and later addressed in the other papers. Furthermore, throughout the time period analyzed, Jackson's hometown paper tended to offer more specific and critical comments about the candidate.

A major theme running throughout the analyzed coverage was the problem Jackson's candidacy had with a traditional member of the Democratic coalition—the Jewish voter. Mentioned in the context of stories of Jackson's visit to Los Angeles in November, the issue's significance grew and began to dominate coverage with the *Post's* reporting of the "Hymie" comment in February and the follow-up in the other papers. Louis Farrakhan's remarks concerning Jews, and his support of the Jackson candidacy coupled with the negative press on the Jewish issue and the candidate's attempt to deal with the controversy, replaced the Syrian diplomatic trip as a dominant theme of the Jackson campaign coverage in February and March. Only Jackson's success in the primaries in late March re-established the focus on the candidate's performance rather than speculation on the Jewish issue.

Tone

With the exception of the *Tribune*, the tone of the Jackson coverage was judged generally to be fair and straightforward. However, there was a notable mood change to a more biased and critical tone during the height of the "Hymie-Farrakhan-Jewish" issue coverage in February and March. The analysis revealed the *Tribune*'s tone to have been primarily evaluative, displaying negative bias in its coverage of Jackson's campaign efforts.

Following the candidate's success in some of the eastern primaries in late March, all papers, including the *Tribune*, tended to be more objective and straightforward in their news reporting of the Jackson effort.

Mediated Image

The most common descriptive reference to Jackson during the five months of analyzed coverage across all newspapers was "civil rights leader." The *New York Times* coverage contained more racial adjectives in its descriptive accounts. The racial references in the other papers tended to dissipate as the campaign progressed with a definite mood change occurring after Jackson's success in the New York primary. Then, in what seemed to be legitimatization of his candidacy, the papers tended to drop the racial reference and primarily referred to Jackson as a "Democratic candidate."

The Press and the Special Candidate

In their study of the 1984 Jackson campaign and the press, Gandy and Dates write:

The press therefore tended to concentrate on his style and rarely addressed Jackson's stand on important campaign issues.⁴

This descriptive analysis also suggests that the newspapers studied did devote significant attention to Jackson's style, and to his race in 1984. The mediated image throughout each of the months reflected a gradual evolution in coverage—from the initial months as a "black civil rights leader," eventually to Jackson as a "Democratic candidate for president." Yet, this legitimization was the product of a long process, and even in April one of the nation's leading voices in journalism, the *New York Times*, and particularly the articles by Howell Raines, frequently referred to Jackson's racial background as a descriptive reference to the candidate.

Study of the 1984 Jackson campaign suggests important phases in the press coverage of special candidates. The authors identify these phases within the "confirmation" paradigm of press coverage. The allocation of coverage appears to follow a series of five different orientations or approaches of the press in identifying and responding to the legitimacy or confirmation of the candidate, who is unique due to race, ethnicity or gender.

Announcement

The first phase centers on the candidate's announcement to run for office. During this period, which comprised roughly the months of November and December 1983 of Jesse Jackson's first presidential campaign, coverage is primarily concerned with investigating and exploring the identity of the candidate and focusing on the historical nature of his bid for office. Descriptive personal references, as well as the subject matter of the stories and context, reflect the race, ethnicity or gender background of the candidate. The overall tone of the coverage is generally neutral to positive. The candidate is still relatively unknown, and the press and public know little about the nature and substance of the aspirant.

Definition

The second phase is the definition period. Here, the candidate is associated with issues and particular character traits. The press strives to make generalizations and value judgments concerning the credibility and efficacy of the candidate. Coverage in this definitional period focuses on combination of factors: 1) the success of the candidate in controlling the mediated message in the effort to expand his political base, 2) the agenda-setting function of the press in associating the candidate with particular issues and images deemed important by the journalist.⁵

In the 1984 Jackson campaign, this definition period occurred roughly

in January and early February when the candidate's trip to Syria and when other foreign policy ideas were featured in the campaign coverage. Tone of coverage during this press period can be either positive or negative, depending on the performance of the candidate. In this phase, new descriptive personal references begin to further define the positions and character traits of the candidate. Nonetheless, there is still a tendency among some journalists to highlight race, ethnicity or gender in the mediated image or descriptive reference of the candidate.

Debunking

Debunking is a crucial third phase of the confirmation paradigm. A product of either a candidate's gaffe, the opposition's strategy, or investigative reporting on a controversial issue, the debunking phase is characterized by careful scrutiny in press coverage of a questionable topic, position, minority reference or character trait. There is a noted mood change in tone and mediated image, as the press takes on a more adversarial relationship in its attempt to provide the public the "facts" needed for deliberative decision making. The campaign agenda is skewed, and the candidate is put on the defensive. In the first Jackson presidential campaign, the "Hymie-Farrakhan-Jewish" issue of February and March comprised the debunking phase of the campaign.

Judgment

In the judgment phase, the candidate is: 1) legitimized and therefore matriculated into a viable candidate, or 2) stereotyped on the basis of flaws and weaknesses perceived by the press, and thereby presented no longer as a serious contender. The manner and style in which the candidate responds to the debunking phase will ultimately affect the judgment phase. Here, an overall decision is rendered, at least partially by the press, on the mediated performance of the candidate in dealing with the controversial matter. Another important part of this judgment phase is the candidate's reaction to this mediated judgment. As Jackson's first campaign for the White House demonstrated, no reaction by a candidate to an issue is presented by the press as a response in iteself, and can subsequently often increase coverage on the questionable issue. The damage inflicted to the 1984 Jackson campaign as a result of the "Hymie-Farrakhan-Jewish" issue seriously impeded the candidate's efforts to maintain the Black-Jewish coalition, a vital part of the old Democratic party structure.

Conversion

The final phase of the confirmation paradigm is conversion, characterized by a public recognition by the candidate that the judgment rendered in the mediated reality of the last phase was fair, or by a mood switch by the media. In a mood switch, there is a recognition by the media of factors which suggest that a new, more objective approach to the candidate is warranted. For example, Jackson's success in the New York primary helped deflect attention away from the debunking issue, and ultimately legitimized him as a "Democratic presidential nominee." If either of the above scenarios occur, a campaign can proceed in a judgment phase until either the candidate, the press, or the public takes appropriate measure, i.e. the candidate drops out of the race, the press realize the story is no longer salient, or the public protests such tactics as unfair and unwarranted.⁷

Dates and Gandy provide evidence on a conversion paradigm's applicability to the 1984 Jackson campaign:

Evidence suggests that quite likely coverage was transformed most noticeably after the "Hymie" incident and the related discussion of Jackson's association with the Reverend Louis Farrakhan. One could conceivably characterize that period in the campaign as a watershed, after which it became acceptable for the press to remove the "kid gloves" and treat Jackson more like the other candidates.⁸

Research from this descriptive analysis reveals that a significant mood change did occur in the mediated image of Jackson after the New York primary and in the wake of the "Rainbow Coalition," a Black-Jewish alliance that had worked together well in supporting other black candidates, such as Tom Bradley in Los Angeles.⁹ Nonetheless, while this important alliance was damaged along with Jackson's credibility, the candidate was able to shift the attention from the press to his success in the eastern primaries.

Conclusion

This study has identified differences and similarities in the manner in which four of the country's most respected newspapers covered the 1984 presidential campaign of Jesse Jackson. The analysis revealed a proclivity among some papers, particulary the *New York Times*, to highlight Mr. Jackson's racial heritage in either the subject matter or the mediated image in such coverage. Furthermore, it also noted mood changes in tone of coverage during the months studied. Specifically, the *Tribune* tended to be more critical and evaluative and less straightforward in its coverage than the other three newspapers analyzed. The *Los Angeles Times* contained the most column inches of campaign coverage, and the *Washington Post* featuring the most exclusive stories during the November-April time period.

The confirmation paradigm of press coverage was outlined and applied to the Jackson candidacy. Accordingly, in the "announcement" phase, focus was on broadening the identity of the candidate and emphasizing the historical nature of the bid for office. The "definition" phase was characterized by the candidate attempting to shape the campaign coverage compromised by the press's own ability of agenda setting. The candidate was associated with particular issues and character traits, and the press began to offer generalizations and value judgments regarding the aspirant. "Debunking" occurred as a reesult of a gaffe, the opposition's strategy, or investigative reporting on a controversial issue in which the candidate was put on the defensive. The press's or public's overall reaction to the candidate's performance in defense of his issue position, racial background, or character trait occurred in the "judgment" phase. The next step, "conversion," was characterized by the candidate's public acceptance of a judgment rendered by the press, or by a mood switch and focus by the print media to an issue highlighted by the candidate's performance in another area.

The study suggests that Jackson's 1984 campaign was characterized by an intense debunking period in which the candidate's relationship to the Jewish issue sidetracked his efforts to keep this focus on the "Rainbow Coalition." It was only after the candidate's success in the New York primary that coverage once again focused on the campaign and characterized a more objective tone.

A similar study of the 1988 presidential campaign of Jesse Jackson revealed the Jewish issue to continue to skew the candidate's campaign coverage with the overall impact and slant dependent upon the individual reporter and paper's philosophy. For example, three weeks before the June California primary, the two major dailies in Los Angeles—The Los Angeles Times and The Los Angeles Herald Examiner reported on the same event, yet packaged it from two opposite perspectives. The Times offered promise of reconciliation between Jackson and Jews, as revealed in the headlines "Signs of Peace Seen as Jews and Jackson Meet." The Herald headline judged things different: "LA Jewish Groups Decline to Join Jackson Meeting."

This interpreting/forecasting tendency of the media presents challenges to not only Jesse Jackson but to all candidates and the voting public. David Shaw of the *Los Angeles Times* identifies one of the most revolutionary changes in the American press over the past few decades to be "transition from being simple transcribers of others' words and deeds to acting as explicators and analysts of those words and deeds."¹⁰ This tendency of the media to engage in forecasting is an obvious effort to keep up with the instantaneous nature of its competitive and pervasive rival—television—which Shaw astutely describes as "little more than a headline service."¹¹ Furthermore, a 1988 study of Jesse Jackson's California campaign reveals little learned in four years. At stake is society's ability to rely on the print media for investigative, in depth, objective stories necessary for the reflective process in selecting our public officials.

Our analysis demonstrates that the candidate, viewed by the press as unique due to race, ethnicity or gender, is presented with particular challenges. An important consideration is how does such a candidate attempt to ensure that the campaign coverage focuses on issues, rather than become permeated with attention to the novelty of race, ethnicity or gender throughout the contest? From another perspective, the dilemma is equally troubling for the journalist involved in such contests. How much attention should be given to race or ethnicity in a campaign by the reporter?

Should one adopt the view of one reporter and "mention it once and then regard race or ethnicity as no longer news?"¹² Or, is a reference to ethnicity or race throughout the political campaign necessary to provide necessary depth to the campaign coverage?¹³

Such questions are not only of interest to journalists, candidates, and the public involved in the 1984 and 1988 presidential campaigns of Jesse Jackson. These are also concerns of strategists for Pat Schroeder, Wilson Goode, Andrew Young, Henry Cisneros, Tom Bradley, Federico Pena, Geraldine Ferraro and thousands of other such candidates who have opted to seek higher office. Further study of the coverage of Jackson's 1988 presidential campaign, in addition to those of other such candidates, can help shed light on such troublesome journalistic practices. At stake is not only the ethic and health of our political system but also the ability to provide the American public the quality coverage required to make cogent decisions in the electoral process.

COMPARISON OF COVERAGE

LOS ANGELES TIMES

	Nov.:	Dec. :	Jan. :	Feb. :	Mar. :	Apr. :	Total
Candidate's total inches	334	250	530	300	1665	875	3954
General Stories, total	12	14	39	26	73	28	192
Jackson Exclusive Stories	9	11	19	13	26	12	90
Jackson Exclusive Stories							
as percent of total general							
stories	75	79	49	50	36	43	47
Jackson Exclusive per							
month as percent of							
Jackson stories	10	12	21	14	29	13	-

CHICAGO TRIBUNE

	Nov. :	Dec. :	Jan. :	Feb. :	Mar. :	Apr. :	Total
Candidate's total inches	337	291	469	500	230	104	1931
General Stories, total	14	16	30	30	33	11	134
Jackson Exclusive Stories	7	14	16	16	12	4	69
Jackson Exclusive Stories							
as percent of total general							
stories	50	88	53	53	36	36	51
Jackson Exclusive per							
month as percent of							
Jackson stories	10	20	23	23	17	6	

WASHINGTON POST

	Nov. :	Dec. :	Jan. :	Feb. :	Mar. :	Apr. :	Total
Candidate's total inches	358	257	958	593	479	186	2821
General Stories, total	20	19	32	38	27	12	142
Jackson Exclusive Stories	11	9	24	27	17	7	95
Jackson Exclusive Stories							
as percent of total general							
stories	55	47	75	71	63	58	64
Jackson Exclusive per							
month as percent of							
Jackson stories	12	9	25	26	18	7	L

NEW YORK TIMES

	Nov. :	Dec. :	Jan. :	Feb. :	Mar. :	Apr. :	Total
Candidate's total inches	190	460	715	738	585	790	3458
General Stories, total	9	18	23	26	34	22	132
Jackson Exclusive Stories	8	13	18	18	19	11	97
Jackson Exclusive Stories							
as percent of total general							
stories	89	72	78	69	56	50	66
Jackson Exclusive per							
month as percent of							
Jackson stories	9	15	21	21	22	13	-

Notes

¹D.H. Gandy, Jr. and J.L. Dates. "Ideology Constraints on the Coverage of Presidential Candidates: The Jesse Jackson Campaign and the American Press." *Journalism Quarterly*. Vol. 62, No. 3 (Fall, 1985) 595-625.

²*Ibid.* Also see "Access to the Press: A New First Amendment Right." *Harvard Law Review* (1946-7) 80.

³*Ibid.*, 595-596.

⁴*Ibid.*, 596.

⁵For an example of this phenomenon, see J.G. Payne, "A Special Kind of Journalism: The 1982 California Gubernatorial Campaign." *Political Communication and Persuasion*. Vol. 5, No. 3, (Fall, 1988); also see S. Greengard. "Tom and the Times." *Los Angeles Magazine*, Vol. 30, No. 6 (June, 1985) 148-165; J.G. Payne and S.C. Ratzan. "Did the *Los Angeles Times* Cost Tom Bradley the 1982 Election?" *California Journal*, Vol. 17, No. 6 (June, 1986) 38-42; also J.G. Payne and S.C. Ratzan. *Tom Bradley*, *The Impossible Dream*. (Santa Monica: Roundtable, 1986). For material on the agenda-setting function of the press, see M.E. McCombs and L. Shaw. "The Agenda Setting Function of Mass Media." *Public Opinion* Quarterly, Vol. 36, No. 2 (Summer, 1972) 533-538.

⁶In the 1982 gubernatorial election pitting Los Angeles Mayor Tom Bradley against George Deukmejian, a statement by Deukmejian's campaign manger BillRoberts that "there was a hidden anti-black vote" skewed the campaign coverage for the final three weeks of the campaign. The *Los Angeles Times* coverage, during the final weeks of the campaign, more frequently than not included reference to the Roberts "hidden antiblack vote" allegation, thus illustrating how an opposition's strategy can contribute to the debunking phase. See Payne and Ratzan cited above, 256-272.

⁷In the 1982 gubernatorial campaign, Tom Bradley chose not to respond to the "hidden anti-black charge" that dominated the *Los Angeles Times* coverage. Nonetheless, *Times* coverage continued to be permeated with speculation on the effects of the anti-black statement on the final outcome of the election. For a different rhetorical tactic in dealing with this type of unethical campaign technique, see *Tom Bradley*, *The Impossible Dream*, 83-136.

⁸Gandy and Dates, 625.

⁹In the Bradley-Deukmejian election, the *Los Angeles Times* coverage continued to massage the hidden black allegation throughout the remainder of the campaign. The Los Angeles Mayor's campaign was unsuccessful in re-directing the *Times'* attention to other issues of the campaign.

¹⁰D. Shaw. "Television: Candidate 'Mine Field." *Los Angeles Times* (August 15, 1988) 1,5.

 $^{11}Ibid.$

¹²Personal communication with *San Diego Union* reporter Susan Jetton (March 7, 1984).

¹³Personal communication with *Los Angeles Times* reporter Dick Bergholz (September 19, 1984).

Critique

The basic tenets for this article appear to be the following: "objective" news is possible; that "solely present[ing] facts" equals objectivity; and that "colorblind" news is even a possibility in this society.

An analysis based on the ideal of an objective press assumes that "the media can and ought accurately to reflect the real world, in a fair and balanced way"¹, that in fact the news is, in the old saw, a "mirror of reality." News is no such thing. Instead, the news is a product of industrial and professional processes that define, select, produce, and sell pictures of the world while insisting to news consumers that "that's the way it is." And we must add to the mediation of journalists, journalistic training, news values, and organizational pressures, the fact that language is not a transparent medium, but rather carries within it social values, that is, ideology². This has often been analyzed within news research in terms of how certain peoples, behaviors, events, and movements are labeled and defined³. Similarly, Payne et al. are concerned with the labeling of Jesse Jackson as a black candidate, as a civil rights leader (which they imply, though do not directly claim, is a form of racial labeling and therefore detrimental) instead of as a "Democratic candidate." They come to the now generally held conclusion that Jackson was never presented by the news media as a serious candidate because of his race, a conclusion I support.

The study, though, and what it could accomplish, is limited by both their theory of the press and their methodology. They ask the wrong questions. They wonder how a candidate might ensure that campaign coverage focuses on issues rather than the "novelty of race, ethnicity or gender." And as for the reporters, should race be mentioned once and then dropped? Or "is a reference to ethnicity or race throughout the campaign necessary to provide . . . depth. . . ?"

The question should not be "Do the media talk about Jesse Jackson as a black man," or "Should a reporter use race to describe a candidate," but rather "How is race signified in American society?" The first possibility for reporters, that race is simply a descriptive term that can then be dropped from coverage, is based on the absurd ideal of a colorblind society. That concept-that race "shouldn't matter"-not only is unrealistic in a country which always has been and still is racist, but also posits the old melting pot theory that successful racial integration will mean difference disappears (thus, positing, of course, that difference is the problem). Their findings, that the news media covered Jackson as a black man rather than as a presidential candidate, is generally supportable, but Payne et al. missed the most important part of the articles they analyzed: the process by which Jackson's racial identity was "made to mean" that he was not a serious candidate, that he could not possibly win, and that therefore, did not need to be covered as other candidates were.

This problem results from the authors' use of traditional content analysis. In quantitative content analysis, a method of research with a long history in communications research, categories of content relevant to the research hypothesis are defined by the researchers, and then are used by coders who count the frequency with which the categories (in this case, indicators of bias that the authors have not specified in the article) appear in the news stories. Content analysis thus "assumes repetition ... to be the most useful indicator of significance."⁴ But repetition is only one way meaning is created in a text. Even one of the originators of content analysis in the social sciences, Bernard Berelson, noted its limitations: "Strictly speaking, content analysis proceeds in terms of what-is-said, and not in terms of why-the-content-is-like-that." As a number of critics have pointed out, content analysis can only deal with manifest content, with denotative signifiers, and not with connotations, the historical and ideological baggage that words carry with them. That is, quantitative content analysis counts the number of times a word appears, but assumes its meaning and assumes that its meaning is constant.

But words have different meanings in different contexts; meaning is social and historical. Therefore, methodologies that take into account the entire text, and the discourses and frames used to construct that text, are more useful in news analysis. They are especially powerful and illuminating when analyzing racial ideologies in the news. An excellent example is Thomas K. Nakayama's study "'Model Minority' and the Media: Discourse on Asian America." Nakayama, using a method of discourse analysis based on the work of Michel Foucault, is able to determine how Asian-Americans have been represented as a "model" to other minorities and to reveal the contradictions in the discourse and their meanings. In addition, his study shows that the discourse of the "model minority" is "a discursive practice of non-Asian-Americans . . . generated from the outside looking into the Asian American community . . . [and] functions to legitimate status quo institutions."⁵

Similarly, while Michael Omi and Howard Winant's *Racial Formation* in the United States is not about the news, their definition of "racial formation" as "the process by which social, economic and political forces determine the content and importance of racial categories, and by which they are in turn shaped by racial meanings," the process by which "racial categories are formed, transformed, destroyed, and re-formed"⁶ connects, rather than isolates, the discourses of race that are used in our news media to our social institutions. The methods used by Payne et al. could describe but not explain the situation, and it led them to those perturbing final questions in the conclusion. The questions are disturbing because they reduce the issue of the signification of race to a question of individual reportorial technique and campaign design.

Notes

¹Robert A. Hackett. "Decline of a Paradigm?: Bias and Objectivity in News Media Studies." *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*. Vol. 1, No. 3 (September, 1984) 232.

²See especially Gayle Tuchman. Making News: A Study in the Construction of Reality. (New York: The Free Press, 1978); Mark Fishman, Manufacturing the News. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1980); Stanley Cohen and Jock Young, eds. The Manufacture of the News: Deviance, Social Problems, and the Mass Media. (Beverly Hills: Sage Publications, 1972/1981); and Ibid.

³See Cohen and Young; and Stuart Hall, "The Rediscovery of Ideology: The Return of the Repressed in Media Studies," in M. Guerevitch, et. al., eds. Culture and Society and the Media. (London: Methuen, 1982) 56-90. ⁴Stuart Hall. Introduction to A.C.E. Smith. Paper Voices: The Popular Press and Social Change 1935-1965. (Totowa, NJ: Rowman and Littlefield, 1975).

⁵Thomas K. Nakayama. "'Model Minority' and the Media: Discourse on Asian America." Journal of Communication Inquiry. Vol. 12, No.1 (Winter, 1988) 65.

⁶Michael Omi and Howard Winant. *Racial Formation in the United States: From the 1960s to the 1980s.* (New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1986).

-Roberta J. Astroff University of Wisconsin, Madison

Critique

The issue of journalistic tradition in campaign reporting of minority candidates is a serious one. The essence of this research article appears to this reader to be one of gradual accumulation of evidence that 'yes,' being a minority (and/or woman) may affect a campaigner's coverage by the newspaper media. The jury is still out, however, as to what extent such coverage influences voters and other media, as well as what effect, if any, such media coverage has on the final election.

The methodology of this study appears sound, but this reviewer would have felt more comfortable if the authors had given more detail on procedures used to train and insure reliability among graduate student coding teams. Some reliability statistics might have helped enhance this study, but this reviewer will not 'quibble' over such a minor criticism.

It appears that nearly sixty percent (58.5%) of the general reference stories were Jackson-exclusive. Given the overall political campaign, at face value that could be interpreted as a plus for Jackson. Of course, what the authors do not do is clearly differentiate between positive vs. negative exclusives.

The "Confirmation Paradigm" (announcement, definition, debunking, judgment, conversion) has promise. The authors did an excellent job of differentiating the stages and showing how Jackson's 1984 campaign can be analyzed from such a paradigm.

Jackson's early primary successes appeared to negate negative media coverage effects. In addition, as his legitimacy became less a question, so to were there less negative news media coverage, although the "Hymie-Farrakhan-Jewish" issue as reported did have negative ramifications.

One walks a "fine line" between reporting *facts* (i.e., being "black" *and* a "civil rights candidate") or attempting to ignore one's race and occupational orientation (i.e., by reporting him in the generic, so-called 'legitimate' sense as a "Democratic presidential candidate"). Does to be "color blind" now mean to give legitimacy?

This reviewer agrees with the authors: this line of research needs to continue by comparing Jesse Jackson's 1984 campaign to his 1988 campaign. Only in this way can we get a better understanding of the promising confirmation paradigm of press coverage.

> —James Bracy California State University, Northridge

Abstracts from the Seventeenth Annual Conference on Ethnic and Minority Studies "Ethnicity in America: Interdisciplinary

Approaches"

Seattle, Washington March 2-5, 1989

Johnnella Butler, chair of Afro-American Studies at the University of Washington, directed the seventeenth annual Conference on Ethnic and Minority Studies in Seattle. Graduate students and staff from the Department of American Ethnic Studies provided support for the planning and several students from the University of Washington participated either as presenters or observers. Participants from throughout the United States arrived in Seattle during a rare spring snowstorm to hear papers on the conference theme, "Ethnicity in America: Interdisciplinary Approaches." Participants were welcomed by James D. Nason, Associate Dean of Arts and Sciences at the University of Washington, and the General Session featured Leonard Forsman, Director of the Suguamish Museum and Secretary of the Tribal Council of the Suguamish Indians, who addressed issues faced in Seattle and elsewhere. Also in the General Session, Erasmo Gamboa, Director of Chicano Studies at the University of Washington, related the history of Chicanos in the State of Washington and discussd current Hispanic issues. Spencer Shaw delighted the audience at the annual banquet with "Stories from Around the World." He reaffirmed the power of storytelling throughout time and across cultural boundaries. At the banquet the annual Ernest M Pon award was received by Cherry Kinoshita on behalf of the Japanese-American Citizens' League for their efforts on the reparations issue. The Charles C. Irby Service award was given to Gretchen M. Bataille, editor of NAES publications, for her service to the Association and her efforts on behalf of ethnic studies. These abstracts and comments from respondents make clear the variety and vitality of ethnic studies; in addition, the topics clearly demonstrate the research which has been done and the greater needs to continue the exploration of the varied dimensions of ethnic experience.

SESSION I: "Programmatic and Classroom Issues of Ethnic Studies: Targeting Populations and Stereotypes."

Chair: Calvin Harris, University of Oregon.

Ernest B. Johnson II, University of Washington. "A Four Component Teaching Module for use in Teaching Multiethnic Students at All Educational Levels."

The traditional Anglocentric educational system has both structurally and substantively failed to adequately arrest the rapid decline in the educational standards

of multiethnic students. This university-based program is conceived of as being operated by advanced or graduate students who establish contacts with the teachers, administrators, parents, community leaders and other concerned bodies in the student's greater educational environment.

This contact provides the basis for an ethnography of the total pedagogical environment which allows for the implementation of the Multiethnic Teaching Module. This module is an innovative attempt to contribute to the drastic pedagogical reform required to address rising attrition and failure rates among the other many current problems. The specific goal of the module is, as with Banks (1987), to develop essential decision making and social and academic skills in specifically targeted multiethnic students.

The modular curriculum consists of four component levels: (1) grades 0-6, (2) grades 7-9, (3) grades 10-12, and (4) university students. Each component-level consists of seven curricular phases beginning with an assumption of needs, leading to an investigation and ending with an evaluation of the implemented module.

The MTM is thus an alternative curriculum and delivery system with the potential of addressing the needs of multiethnic students at all educational levels. It requires trained and committed implementors and teachers with the support of parents, school administrators and a designated pedagogical network within the community.

Juan Gonzales, Jr., California State University, Hayward. "Presenting Cross Cultural Materials in the University Classroom."

The introduction of this paper provides an investigation of the historical role of Ethnic Studies programs on university campuses as the sole source of information regarding the status of ethnic minorities in American society. Following the Ethnic Studies approach, the multicultural approach to higher education is presented as a contemporary educational philosophy and pedagogical approach. The historical fallacy of the Melting Pot theory is examined and the more applicable cross-cultural approach in the university classroom is demonstrated.

The substance of this paper provides faculty members and university administrators with a succinct presentation of the philosophy of the multicultural perspective in higher education and concludes with some very practical suggestions on how university faculty can introduce cross-cultural materials into their general education courses.

Robert Catlin, Florida Atlantic University. "Creating an Ethnic Studies Program at Florida Atlantic University: New, Different and Innovative... or Reinventing the Wheel."

Florida Atlantic University is a state supported institution of 11,000 students, 5% of whom are black and 4% Hispanic. Up until 1987, there was no attempt to install an Ethnic Studies Program, but with the arrival of a new academic Dean who was formerly chair of Minority Studies at Indiana University, efforts to develop such a program began.

This paper as a case study, traces the evolution of Ethnic Studies at FAU describing the initial strategies, roles of key participants, and successes as of February, 1989. Primary attention will be given to these lessons learned that are transferrable to existing Ethnic Studies programs and entities interested in establishing new ones.

Respondent: Elizabeth V. Spelman, Smith College

The papers remind us of the variety of fronts on which the educational system has to be challenged, and the importance of change taking place everywhere in order for changes anywhere to be significant.

These papers describe some of the damage done — to all of us here as well as to our students and our children — by our educational systems; we are all harmed, albeit in different ways, whether we are the perpetrators or targets of ethnocentrism.

Overwhelming evidence of harm exists to those belonging to what Gonzalez tellingly calls identifiable ethnic groups: being ignored, or being recognized, but in stereotypical, condescending and otherwise ignorant and arrogant ways by Anglo teachers.

There is evidence in Anglo students and teachers of what might be called a severe learning impairment, with symptoms of the kind Gonzalez and Johnson describe: profound ignorance; debilitating fear about facing those of whom one is ignorant; self-deception about not having an ethnic identity; and belief that "ethnic studies" is only for "ethnic peoples."

Following up on Johnson's concern about the relation between learning to establish and take pride in one's identity and, at the same time, being able to think about it critically, we can't assume that increased tolerance and respect, even increased curiousity of the best sort (i.e., not regarding someone as an exotic specimen), will lead to a perfect harmonization of interests among different ethnic groups. There may be times when the expression of what appears to be one's cultural identity could be not just disagreeable to others but even harmful. This raises the very difficult question of how much of a group's identity it would have to give up, or mute, in order to live with respect for others. We should be ready to deal with what people are going to do with the knowledge and awareness that a truly multiethnic education would provide. We don't want to be at war, but then we don't want simply to nod politely in one another's direction — there's no engagement there, and indeed no real respect.

SESSION II: "Cultural Traditions in Ethnic Music and Festivals as Ethnography."

Chair: Harriet Ottenheimer, Kansas State University.

Greg Steinke, University of Arizona. "The Use of Native American Music and Poetic Images in the Compositional Process."

Native American music and poetic images are incorporated into several of Steinke's recent compositions: *Image Music* for flute, oboe, trombone and contrabass, *One by One* for flute and harp, and *Wind River Country* for woodwind quintet plus discussion on some of the problems of utilizing Native American music in an art music context. Some discussion is also included on possible strategies for utilizing Native American musical materials in interdisciplinary courses or with students who might wish to work on projects incorporating these or similar materials. This is a lecture/demonstration format with handouts and short, recorded musical illustrations of original source materials followed by their usage in the context of the above pieces.

Keith D. Miller, Arizona State University. "Kenneth Burke's Five Dogs and the Songs of Freedom."

Kenneth Burke analyzes a term according to five methods (or "dogs")—a scheme that can help us to understand the "freedom" songs of the civil rights movement. "Primal" uses of "freedom" appeared in songs of Edenic innocence and songs about death. The "jingle" rhythm of "freedom" proved adaptable, whereas the monosyllabic "free" appeared much less often. Organizers warred with "lexical" meaning by loading "freedom" with positive associations. "Entelechial" uses of "freedom" equated it with perfection. "Woke up this morning with my mind stayed on Jesus" became "Woke up this morning with my mind stayed on freedom." Here "freedom" substituted for "Jesus" and thus became a term of absolute perfection. "Tautological" uses of "freedom" linked it to other positive associations as song leaders transmuted spirituals, hymns, gospel tunes, union songs, and breezy pop standards into civil rights anthems. By enlisting available cultural resources, composers freighted their anthems with easily recognizable expressions of hope and triumph.

Respondent: Phillips G. Davies, Iowa State University.

Both papers deal interestingly with the use of ethnic music, but in two very different directions. Miller, after connecting black civil rights protest music with Burkean theory, goes on to analyze the major metaphors found in the music. In the songs, the key concept is "freedom," most often used in a religious context as much as in a political one.

Steinke's presentation was primarily a discussion of how the author used Native American music and transformed it into more-or-less traditional classical music form, in the main example presented, a quartet for flute, oboe, trombone, and contra bass. Examples of Native American chants and other music were later seen in the context of the finished composition. In evaluating this presentation, I did have the advantage of a serious interest in classical music, and thus was aware that Steinke is working in a long tradition in which various sorts of folk music—widely conceived—have been used in the composition of original music.

Different as the two presentations were, they both deal with the general subject matter and contribute significantly, to, in one case our appreciation of the civil rights movement, and in the other one, to the idea that examples of American music can be transformed into contemporary music in a manner which both makes use of the old material but that also transcends it to make it "something rich and strange."

SESSION III: "Ethnic Studies and the Canon."

Chair: Johnnella Butler, University of Washington.

Phillipa Kafka, Kean College of New Jersey. "How a Feminist and Afrocentric Interdisciplinary Approach Can Create a Model American Literature Survey I Course."

This paper presents a comprehensive, intellectually stimulating model for an

American Literature Survey I course by first defining "comprehensive," then revealing the opposite by sample Table of Contents from recent anthologies. I justify selections of authors chosen for the new, comprehensive model course—first those from the "traditional canon" who remain on the syllabus, such as Hawthorne and Melville. Following this, I present authors such as Jacobs and Fuller who will be added to the new canon from a far richer and more diverse gender, race, ethnic, and class base of representation and perspective.

SESSION IV: "Dynamics and Teaching in an Interdisciplinary and Ethnic Studies Context."

Chair: Janice Clemmer, Brigham Young University.

Gretchen M. Bataille, Arizona State University, and David M. Gradwohl, Iowa State University. "Potsherds, Poems, and Pow Wows: An Interdisciplinary Approach to American Indian Studies."

Faculty in several disciplines have played significant roles in the development of the American Indian Studies Program at Iowa State University. The introductory course is team-taught by faculty from anthropology, English, history, and art with guest lecturers from American Indian communities and specialists in law, education, politics, and religion. Students, mainly non-Indian, use the course as part of the American Indian Studies minor, for the multi-cultural non-sexist requirement in the College of Education, or as an alternative for the foreign cultures requirement in the College of Sciences and Humanities. This course enhances disciplinary courses in preparing students for teaching or for human service and governmental careers.

Ruth Frankenberg, University of Washington. "Teaching White Women, Racism and Anti-Racism in a Women's Studies Program."

I developed and taught "White Women, Racism and Anti-Racism" for the Women's Studies Program at the University of California, Santa Cruz in 1988. I describe the institutional context which made possible and appropriate a course focused on white women as racially positioned actors, and describe, too, the personal history and research experience that prepared me to teach it. I discuss the course structure, readings and assignments. The course was interdisciplinary; equally crucial was participants' ability to work in a range of registers — historical, sociological, political, experiential, emotional. My discussion of students' and teaching assistants' interaction with the course includes exploration of the difference race and ethnicity made to the meaning of the course for participants. Finally, I speculate on the course's effects on the Women's Studies Program more broadly.

Victoria Ekanger, University of Washington. "On Requiring Fieldwork in Ethnic Studies and Women's Studies: Social Action Epistemology."

Respondent: Stewart Rodnon, Rider College.

One of my favorite remarks in the imperative voice is E.M. Forster's dictum, "Only connect," and this might be the thesis for the experimental teaching approaches delineated in these three papers. I believe fundamentally, as I complete my thirtieth and final year of college teaching, that it's not simply knowing the facts that is significant, but making the crucial connections among them that truly defines the educated person.

Bataille's and Gradwohl's paper mirrors my own experiences in team teaching both a black American culture course in the late sixties and an ethnic-minorities course soon after. Often the insights of the historian, the sociologist, and the psychologist trigged new connections and opened stimulating new paths for me in my own American literature specialties.

Also, I love the pragmatic considerations in all of these papers. They say—let's not be ivory-tower scholars feeding the "academic criticism" industry, but let's get our students to look at the real world with open and alerteyes. And let's look at it directly and unflinchingly, so that we find out the real truths and not the managed, jingoistic distortions of much of our media pap. In Frankenberg's paper I was glad to see some emphasis on the relationship of the importance of race to the feminist movement. Further, I did admire the trenchant attack on the monstrous and morally filthy "White Student Union" comic (!) strip; she analyzed it brilliantly and she thoroughly eviscerated its carcass. She also made mention in an aside of women and sports; I teach a course called "Sports in American Life" and I discovered how the NCAA, a maledominated group, did a hatchet job on the AIAW, a female, idealistic group. It is a perfect paradigm for the way a strong male organization, powered by its enormous income, destroyed a female organization.

Ekanger's suggestions on incorporating fieldwork into Ethnic Studies and Women's

Studies struck me as exemplary. Her ideas about our educational system's encouraging reproduction of the ideas of the dominant society is right on the mark; pushing students into independent thought through becoming activists in areas which reveal the essential corruption of much of our social and economic system is a laudable objective. It has to be a powerful initiation and awakening for most of her students; the practice undoubtedly has a salutary effect and is a truly educational experience, in the deepest meaning of the word "education." I especially liked her ideas of using this as part of an intermediate expository writing course. It is an ingenious approach to involving the students in a worthwhile social endeavor and might create interest by the students in what they are writing about as well as how they write about it.

SESSION V: "Race Relations and Institutions."

Chair: Carlos Ortega, Sonoma State University.

Kate Bolland, Smith College. "Title IX and the Struggle for a Truly Liberated Education."

Title IX of the Education Amendment of 1972 prohibits sex discrimination in education. The statute has unquestionably improved higher educational opportunities for many women. Women now receive over half the bachelor degrees conferred annually. Between 1972 and 1980, the percentage of women students in professional and graduate programs more than doubled.

Title IX has also transformed women's collegiate athletics. It provides legal recourse for women experiencing many forms of sex discrimination including discrimination against pregnant women, biased counseling and admissions policies, and overt sexual harrassment.

Despite these gains, many women continue to experience inequities and persisting sex discrimination in education. Despite their hard-won gains, women of color continue to face particularly resistant barriers to equal and full participation in education. Almost all women (and men) of color remain underrepresented in higher education despite their gradually increasing numbers.

The history of Title IX suggests that only an integrated approach that acknowledges the interrelatedness of different systems of privilege and disprivilege will realize Title IX's (and other progressive legislation's) true potential. Currently, the statute is primarily addressing the needs of white middle class women. Title IX's advocates need to examine the ways in which non-gender related factors affect the opportunities of all women.

Llyn De Danaan, Evergreen State College. "Margin to Center: Dynamics in a Global Classroom."

Bell Hooks, author of Ain't I a Woman: Black Women and Feminism and Feminist Theory from Margin to Center, recently spoke about the real physical sickness white students have experienced in her classes at Oberlin after being thrown "off center" by material from the black experience presented in class. I want to use Bell Hooks's model "margin to center" to explore the phenomenological experience of the older white women in the Tacoma Evergreen program, a degree granting college in western Washington. Our anecdotal collective experience as faculty is that many of these women have difficulties being suddenly on the margin of what they perceive to be a black centered curriculum and campus. I explore the meaning of their response in the context and language of giving up the privilege of being in the center, a position these women do not know they occupy. I explore alternative faculty responses which enable these women and might enable other similarly disoriented students to move from personalized responses of felt marginality to a more generalized and productive understanding of the mechanisms of domination and oppression and their own consent and complicity in them.

Farell J. Webb, New York University. "The Monster in Our House: Racism on College Campuses."

The purpose of this study is to offer some insights into why racism has resurfaced on college campuses despite the social advancements made by all groups in this country. I examine the theoretical postulates of racism and then discuss how this concept imbeds itself into the major institutional fibers. I show how despite a pronounced committment to eliminate racism, institutions of higher learning are in fact sending double messages.

This study is based on content methodology. Such things as the number of ethnic study course offerings (any courses focused on ethnic groups, minorities and women where such courses are listed as being interdisciplinary or in their own department); the number of racial incidents on each campus; as well as data on the minority population (administration, faculty and student bodies) of these institutions is examined. I establish the link between the data and my original theory about competing agendas on college campuses.

It is too early to tell what the results will show, but I am convinced from a preliminary review of data on campus unrest that there is a growing issue of racism. Furthermore, America's colleges and universities are not ready to acknowledge that there is a problem and little is done to educate faculty, students, and administrators about how to address group differences. I conclude by offering some recommendations about what can be done about the problem of racism on our campuses as well as offer some long term proposals on how to have positive learning experience from our recent failures.

Jonathan A. Majak, University of Wisconsin, LaCrosse. "Allan Bloom on Race Relations in Academe: The Closing of an American Mind."

Educational reform has become a popular cause in the 1980s. This need for reform may be indicative of a general uneasiness about the future and a lack of confidence in the so-called Reagan prosperity. Of all the recent books on higher education, none has received so much publicity as Allan Bloom's controversial book, *The Closing of the American Mind.* In this paper, I focus my analysis on two aspects of Bloom's critique of higher education: first, his analysis of race relations, particularly his assertion that black students are now the ones engaged in racial separatism. Second, he claims that black studies have essentially failed.

Respondent: James H. Williams, California State Polytechnic University, Pomona.

SESSION VI: "Traditional Politics."

Chair: Lawrence Estrada, Colorado State University.

Patricia J. Hennessey and Eugene R. Declercq, Merrimack College Urban Institute. Comparative Cultures of the Peoples of Lawrence."

Comparative Cultures of the Peoples of Lawrence is an interdisciplinary project using a variety of media to educate to reduce ethnic division. A team of faculty and administrators have completed an original, professionally produced 45 minute video on the history and development of the city of Lawrence. The video entitled "Dreams and Plans: Newcomers to Lawrence," has been produced in conjunction with a workshop for city leaders. Utilizing hundreds of period pictures, current footage of the city, and in-depth interviews with immigrant residents, the production places current controversies in an historical context.

"Dreams and Plans" will form the basis of a series of workshops held at the Institute for city leaders, teachers, police and other city officals. The goal of the workshops, and a book that will be written by the faculty team that produced the video, will be to help these decision makers place the work they now do in perspective. The sessions will also give them an opportunity to discuss how Lawrence can draw on the myriad lessons from its past to better cope with the challenges of its future.

David L. Hood and Henry V. Muse, Norwich University. "Rival Models of Ethnic Politics: Italian and Polish Voting Behavior of Erie, Pennsylvania."

This study examines three major paradigms which furnish rival explanations for the phenomenon of ethnicity in American politics: assimilation, ethnic mobilization, and coalition-building. Assimilation Theory, articulated by Robert Dahl, predicts that with time and ethnic group upward mobility ethnicity as a factor in American political behavior will decline after a peak and eventually be replaced by socioeconomic interest. Ethnic Mobilization Theory, described by Raymond Wolfinger, suggests that the impact of ethnicity on political behavior would not wane after an initial peak and could continue to play a role in the voting decisions of later generation ethnic Americans. Coalition-building, enunciated by Michael Haas, suggests that ethnic voting behavior has always been an important factor in politics an continues to impact the vote decision as ethnic groups align themselves into voting blocs. This study furnishes a Italian-Americans in Erie, Pennsylvania.

Margaret Duncan, Colorado State University. "Pacific Salmon and Steelhead: Ethnic Politics and Environmentalism."

Respondent: Otis Scott, California State University, Sacramento.

Patricia Hennessey on the subject of the peoples of Lawrence, Massachusetts, provided an instructive video tape. Basically, she offered an ethno-biographic history depicting some of the fifty-four ethnic groups settling in Lawrence, Massachusetts.

This was technically an interesting presentation. Hennessey develops a visual backdrop against which we can assess contemporary ethnic group relations in Lawrence, Massachusetts. She does this by establishing that early on Lawrence was planned as a textile community and that immigrants, largely from western Europe, were encouraged to migrate to Lawrence for the purposes of working in the several textile industries. One of the interesting human aspects of this story is that the social engineers knew that the workers, indeed those residing in and about Lawrence, would be a very heterogeneous group, and that it would be in the best interests of production if steps were taken to minimize inter-ethnic conflict.

Although the video presentation is somewhat silent on how this was accomplished, apparently the owners and operators of the mills and the city leadership of the day were relatively successful in this regard. Inasmuch as Hennessey noted that contemporary inter-ethnic relations in Lawrence are in need of much improvement, the approaches used in an earlier time may need revisiting.

The presentation by Margaret Duncan, "Pacific Salmon and Steelhead: Ethnic Politics and Environmentalism," highlights the continuing struggle between people indigenous to these lands and those who have sought to displace indigenous people. Specifically, Duncan develops the point that social policy has had the effect of disrupting the lives of Native Americans. Drawing on specific examples of the treaty rights Native American people have had to fish for salmon and steelhead in the Northwest, she informs us as to how the interests of Native Americans and the interests of non-Native Americans have clashed over the years.

The substance of Duncan's paper is noteworthy. She points out just how delicate is the ecosystem within which the salmon and steelhead function and how native people, over the long generations, have tended to abide by the natural needs of these two fish. Moreover, she tells us that with the incursion by commercial fishermen and insensitive public policy makers, that the natural balance needed by the fish is being disrupted. Moverover, she indicates the consequences of such a disruption on both native people whose life sustenance depends upon the fish, and for commercial fishermen whose livelihoods similarly depend upon their catches.

This age-old struggle between two groups of people functioning within two distinct and competing cosmological systems portend much of the same kind of conflict into the near future. Duncan intimates that native people will need a more assertive presence by public policy makers, advocates for Native Americans and particularly the federal courts if the treaty rights to the fair share catches by Native Americans are to be observed. Duncan finally suggests that native people in the protection of their treaty rights can be expected to become much more aggressive in pursuing their interests.

David Hood sets out to explore and otherwise account for factors which have contributed to the long-standing coalitions among Euro-ethnic politicos—namely, Italian, Polish, Irish and German Catholic, each group having played an important role in controlling municipal politics in Erie, Pennsylvania.

Of particular concern to Hood is the long-standing alliance between the Italian and Polish Democrats, especially since these two ethnic groups have themselves forged a coalition, one which has been a force in municipal politics since 1951. The alliance is particularly interesting inasmuch as Poles have tended to focus their electoral interests on state-wide offices while Italians have directed their energies towards neighborhood and municipal politics. The focus of Hood's study is on electoral behavior, i.e., the extent to which ethnic group bloc solidarity can be discerned in electoral arenas.

Hood's methodological appraoch to determining the role of ethnicity in shaping ethnic group political behavior is sound and is in keeping with the heuristic concern raised by a number of a recent generation of political scientists. I'm reminded of the fresh study of the role played by race and ethnicity in Chicago politics authored by Diane Pinderhughes, (*Race and Ethnicity in Chicago Politics*, 1987). In this study, Pinderhughes raises similar questions which bear on understanding the forces shaping the political involvement of African Americans, Italians, and Poles in Chicago municipal politics.

It would have been additionally valuable had some attention been given to the role of policy forces in shaping coalition—mobilization and assimilation. That is, to what extent have policy issues shaped behavior-response by Poles and Italians? To what extent have these groups been mobilized by a mutual concern for policy advantages in the political arena? Is patronage or anticipation of patronage sufficient to maintaining

coalitions?

Hood's study demonstrates that the mobilization model is the explanatory tool best representing electoral behavior among Americans of Polish and Italian descent in Erie. His study challenges theory builders to develop analytical and descriptive models which better represent the reality of ethnic based political behavior. Hood's effort is a good step in this direction.

SESSION VII: "Interdisciplinary History in Ethnic Studies." Chair: Ashton Welch, Creighton University

Elizabeth Salas, University of Washington. "African and Afro-Mestiza Soldaderas in Mexican History and Myth."

The presence of women in Mexican revolts and wars as *soldaderas* (fighters and camp followers) is often an overlooked aspect of Mexican history. Further complicating this general topic is the search for the African and Afro-mestiza woman in warfare. Like thousands of other women, Afro-mestizas were well integrated into the ranks of the soldaderas fighting or following troops from the Spanish Conquest and all subsequent wars. But at other times, African and Afro-mestiza soldaderas fought with their gender counterparts against slavery, especially during the Spanish occupation of Mexico from 1519-1821.

W.M. Akalou, Texas Southern University. "Historians and Geographers: A Consumer-Producer Relationship in Ethnic Studies."

Historians are generally concerned with unique events and they regard the uniqueness of particular events as being of prime interest. The historian is fundamentally concerned with providing a rational explanation for a particular event and this involves establishing what was the rationalization behind a particular decision or set of decisions. Explanation does not involve an appeal to any set of laws, but involves showing that a particular person or group of people had a rational reason for acting in a particular time. Once these regional reasons have been discovered, the historian has completed the task. Geographers on the other hand assume, some even believe, that the phenomena they study are subject to universal laws. As a consequence they have been more inclined to deal with their tasks by employing generalizations, principles, and scientific models. Often they cross interdisciplinary boundaries in search of concepts on which to base their theories. Given this experience. the geographer's disposition toward statistical methods and considering his/her traditional tool (maps) for analyzing and displaying empirical data, the collaboration of history and geography can enhance both the disciplines and the goals of research in ethnic study. The potential for this collaborative effort will be explored by utilizing materials from the writer's ongoing research on Ethiopian migrants in the United States.

James L. Gray, Indiana University of Pennsylvania. "Culture, Gender, and the Slave Narrative."

Pairing Harriet A. Jacob's Incidents in the Life of a Slave Girl, Written by Herself with Frederick Douglass's Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass, an American Slave, Written by Himself permits us to examine both their historical and literary value, and the way they criticize some cultural values and challenge the universal validity of other commonly held cultural assumptions. Douglass emphasized broad concerns with such matters as region, education, and politics, and focused on the individual's assertion and development of the self, whereas Jacobs emphasized family, social, and community concerns, focusing on the network of relationships between individuals.

Cary Wintz, Texas Southern University. "Blacks in the Early Twentieth Century: The Application of History to the Study of Black Literary Activity, 1900-1935."

The Harlem Renaissance has been analyzed in great detail by literary scholars, biographers, and cultural historians. As a result, scholars are now well aware of the work of the black novelists and poets of that period and the role that they played in American black literary and intellectual life. Little attention, however, has been focused on the relationship between black writers and the white dominated publishing industry, and the role that this relationship played on the literary movement. This paper suggests that the changing nature of the American book-publishing industry especially the link between several emerging New York publishing houses and the civil rights movements—played a major role in the emergence of the Harlem Renaissance, and explains the relative success that Renaissance writers enjoyed in contrast to the obscurity that befell most of their literary predecessors.

Respondent: Ashton Welch, Creighton University.

Papers for the panel "Interdisciplinary History in Ethnic Studies" underscored advantages of interdisciplinary approaches for ethnic studies. Aspects of history, anthropology, sociology, music, and art intersected in Salas's "African and Afro-Mestiza Soldaderas in Mexican History and Myth." She demonstrated convincingly that race and gender considerations are important criteria for understanding the numerous insurrections against slavery in Mexico and for analyzing Mexican history. As slaves African women in Mexico fought against harsh conditions. In freedom they had to fight against measures designed to give them an identity separate and unique from Indian and Spanish women. The struggles continued into recent times. Mexicans almost routinely ascribed the non-feminine traits of assertiveness and bellicosity to Afro-Mexican women. Some visual artists reinterpret reality to make Afro-Mexican econform with cultural stereotypes. In many spheres Afro-Mexican females continue to incur more gender oppression than racial discrimination.

Wintz's paper also has implications for the humanities and the social sciences. He writes that the connection between the publishing industry and the blossoming of black writers in the early twentieth century is severely overlooked. He posits that the evolving nature of the American publishing industry, especially New York publishers with links to the civil rights movement, played a critical function in the rise of the Black Renaissance and explains the success that major Renaissance writers savored in contrast to the relative anonymity that shrouded most of their literary forerunners.

Before the First World War black literati were frustrated by the herculean task of placing their work with a major publisher who took black literature earnestly enough to publish and promote it. This situation changed dramatically in the period between the two World Wars. White publishers, literary agents, and magazines began to solicit manuscripts by black writers and even competed for the right to print some of them. By the end of the 1930s significant black writers were almost totally dependent on the white agents, promoters, and publishers for the printing, distribution and promotion of their works, though most black writers still depended upon black publishers, promoters, and civil rights agencies to get their works before the public or promoted themselves and their writings. Men such as Charles W. Chestnutt, Countee Cullen, and Paul Lawrence Dunbar who were able to find white backers or sponsors became successful. Those such as James Edwin Campbell and Raymond Dandridge and black women labored in relative obscurity.

Many of the white publishers, agents, and promoters of black writers also had links to the nascent civil rights movement. A number of those well-connected whites were well known as members of the political left as well as advocates of racial justice for blacks and Native Americans. Still, white publishing houses continued to be governed by southern sensitivities. They remained reluctant to publish works by blacks which dealt overtly with racial themes or social issues. In that climate some black writers masked their social criticism and blunted their characterization of racial themes.

Akalou, a geographer, presented a paradigm for closer intersections between history and geography. He asserted that though geographers and historians are concerned with dimensions of human experiences they have not discerned the advantage of working together or appreciated the utility of a symbiotic association. Historical geography is clearly a sphere where both geographers and historians could institute desirable collaboration. The opportunity is lost however because of the manner in which the subject is treated: "the voluntary and involuntary nature of movement in time and space," and "the very training of practitioners of the two disciplines." Among others, this failure limits the use of diffusion theories and models which can enhance our comprehension of integration of ethnic groups into larger communities and, as such, has critical implications for ethnic studies.

SESSION X: "Armenian Women: The Second Word."

Presenters: Margaret Bedrosian, University of California, Davis, and Arlene Avakian, University of Massachusetts.

This panel explores central questions which have yet to be addressed about Armenian American women. The panel deals with this subject from an interdisciplinary perspective and takes up the following range of subjects: Armenian American feminism—what is it? What are the body images which have shaped Armeniam American women and how have these images helped or hindered their social and psychological development? What contributions have the collecting of photographs and oral histories made to our understanding of Armenian women? How can interdisciplinary research contribute to a better understanding of Armenian American women?

SESSION XI: "Ethnic Studies Programs: Establishing Direction and Institutionalization"

Chair: Talmadge Anderson, Washington State University

Barbara L. Hiura, University of California, Berkeley. "Ethnicity in America: Interdisciplinary Approaches in the Ethnic Studies Program at UC Berkeley."

During the 1960s and 1970s on the heels of the civil rights movement, social and political unrest continued at colleges and universities with the cry for relevant education. Third world students at San Francisco State and the University of California struck and boycotted classes in order to establish "third world studies" and ethnic studies programs. Programs were established. However, Charles Irby viewed the first decade in ethnic studies... "as one where there was no real vision; no theory for providing linkages within a framework of strategies for attaining 'the prize' was developed because ethnic and minority studies proponents had no vision of what the prize ought to be." Programs suffered from entrenchment and attrition.

The 1980s brought a new wave of conservatism and with Allan Bloom's new treatise on *The Closing of the American Mind*, we find a return to basic education viewing such extravagances as ethnic studies programs as unimportant when students are not acquiring basic knowledge from the so-called literary "masters." At the same time we are witnessing a rise in campus racism from Yale to Stanford. Ethnic studies, rather than being an extravagance, is a necessity.

The Ethnic Studies Program at the University of California, Berkeley, attempts to utilize an interdisciplinary approach in understanding race and ethnicity in America. This paper addresses how Berkeley's Ethnic Studies Program uses an interdisciplinary method in its courses and why this program expands rather than limits the field of enquiry.

Angeline Jamison-Hall, University of Cincinnati. "Black Studies and the Politics of the Academic Community."

Although several black studies departments and programs are alive and well, they are definitely not without their problems. The debate over academic legitimacy still persists, institutional resources are limited, recommendations for academic collaboration with other departments are usually met with resistance, expectations and demands of faculty in black studies are much greater than those of traditional departments and in many institutions where there are degree-granting departments, students are often reluctant to consider black studies as a possible major. These are some of the problems now confronting black studies, and interestingly, many of them are similar to those existing fifteen to twenty years ago.

What has changed, though, is the academic community, the context in which these departments and programs vie for growth and expansion. This is 1988, not 1968, and the politics of the current academy are not what they were twenty years ago, nor are the motivations which governed such business as budget allocation, quality of life questions, and other administrative concerns during the peak years. Dramatic changes have taken place in the academic environment, and departments and programs must keep abreast of these changes in order to make informed decisions in the planning process.

The purpose of this paper is to delineate and analyze the characteristics of the current academic environment in which black studies departments exist. Such peculiarities as the changing demographics and politics of the student population, attitudes offaculty and administrators, education as big business and the conservative swing of the entire academy will be examined and analyzed in light of its impact on black studies.

It is not enough to discuss the problems confronting black studies departments in this changing academic community. The challenge is to outline directions for the departments in this changing community, with particular emphasis on goals and objectives, and to discuss avenues by which the goals and objectives might be achieved.

Robert L. Perry and Ernest A. Champion, Bowling Green University.

"Institutionalizing Ethnic Studies, As We Approach the 21st Century."

The demographic changes that will take place by the 21st century will impact upon higher education in the United States. Ethnic studies programs and departments that have survived into the 1980s will play a significant role in transforming the undergraduate curriculum, reflecting the diversity that is inherent in American society. An Euro-centric, Anglo-European world view must give way to a more realistic, multidimensional view of the world. In order for this to happen, ethnic studies departments and programs must provide leadership for courses in cultural diversity across the curriculum by institutionalizing ethnic studies through a multi-disciplinary approach.

Jesse M. Vazquez, Queens College, CUNY. "Towards the Multicultural Enrichment of a School of Education Curriculum: A Preliminary Report."

The place where the prospective teacher receives his/her initiation into the ways of the professional educator is in our schools of education, for it is in the pre-professional training sequence that the future educator (teacher, counselor, school psychologist, administrator), either does, or does not sensitize himself/herself to the complexities, subtleties and impact of race, culture, and language on the education process. The task of the education faculty, therefore, is to lay down a solid foundation in this very critical area of preparation. The purpose of this paper is to report on how one school of education, in a large urban university, is beginning to take initial steps which will enable its faculty to broaden and enrich the cultural content of the existing teacher education curriculum. Our objective is to evolve a multicultural curriculum approach which acknowledges the complexities and importance of this issue, and at the same time reflects the increasing diversity in our communities and in our schools. This paper represents one section of a three-part preliminary report on the first steps taken toward realizing that long-range objective.

Respondent: James H. Bracy, California State University, Northridge.

SESSION XII: "International Perspectives Within Ethnic Studies." Chair: Cary Wintz, Texas Southern University

Rosemary Stevenson, University of Illinois, Champagne. "Caribbean Studies: A Proposal for a Three-Course Sequence of Interdisciplinary Readings."

Although the Caribbean region is an area of historical, economic, and political importance to the United States and Canada, most colleges and universities in North America do not have formal Caribbean Studies programs. The responsibility for teaching about this important region sometimes falls between the academic cracks of Latin American Studies and Black Studies. It is for these academic institutions which have no formal Caribbean Studies component that this three course sequence based on interdisciplinary readings is proposed. The readings offered in introductory, intermediate, and advanced courses have been selected from a variety of disciplines and range from fiction and poetry to history and current politics. They cover the entire Caribbean region, including those central and South American countries which are politically and culturally with the region's island nations.

Emmanuel S. Nelson, State University of New York, Cortland. "Reclaiming the Aboriginal Past: Black Voice in Australian Literature."

Literacy, historically, has enabled white Australians to produce texts in which they position themselves centrally and marginalize, denigrate, and dismiss the Aboriginal participation in the Australian experience. Aboriginal orality was unable to counter the colonialist assumptions inscribed in those white-authored discourses. Recently there has been an emergence of an Aboriginal cultural and literary politics. A primary concern of black Australian writers so far has been to reclaim the Aboriginal past and to re-establish meaningful spiritual connections with it in order to give legitimacy and contemporary relevance to individual/collective Aboriginal cultural identity.

Seyed Maulana, University of Washington. "Language Learning: A Cultural Experience."

In this paper, I discuss the importance of cultural experience in the American Ethnic Studies Program especially as it relates to Afro-American experience. Because language is a medium in which culture is expressed, it is undoubtedly the best way for students to experience a culture through thinking and speaking. As a Swahili language instructor, I strongly believe it is very important, especially to the Afro-American students, to be given an opportunity to study this African language if they are to gain a complete African-American cultural experience.

Respondent: Louise Mayo, County College of Morris.

SESSION XIII: "Ethnicity, Women and Education."

Chair: Barbara L. Hiura, University of California, Berkeley.

Jan Clemmer, Brigham Young University. "American Indian Women and Education: Blessing or Curse?"

Is too much education a blessing or a curse for American Indian women? This paper presents an overview of concerns of American Indian women who strive for academic excellence, yet seemingly become estranged from their tribal people.

Shirley Yee, Lewis and Clark State College. "Black Women and Education in the United States, 1830-1860: A Case Study of the Impact of Feminist Methodology on Afro-American Women's History."

This paper demonstrates the way feminist methodology has broadened our understanding of race and ethnicity in American history. The study of black women's education carries implications for both research/methodology and the teaching of race and ethnicity in the classroom. First, it reveals the complexity of race/gender dynamics in the lives of black women in particular, while, at the same time, providing insight into the intersection of gender and race in the experiences of "women of color" in general. Second, this study underscores the challenges facing educators for rewriting history so that it more closely reflects the complexity of the human experience when such factors as gender, race, and class are considered.

Patricia Keith and Carole Simon-Smolinski, Lewis and Clark State College. "An Interdisciplinary Approach to the Study of Ethnic Women in the United States."

The current national debate focusing on the need for college curriculum to take a multicultural, multi-ethnic view is generally conducted in terms of economic or politcal realities and visions. "Women in the Twentieth Century," an interdisciplinary, team taught, upper-division course, shifts the terms of the debate and considers issues facing women in this century through a framework of ethical questioning and reasoning. The course requires reading in fiction, non-fiction, and poetry (Third Woman and This Bridge Called My Back) and in personal narratives and primary historical documents (American Working Women) in order to acquaint students with issues faced by women of diverse ethnic backgrounds in the United States and elsewhere. Major considerations in designing the course were the homogeneous student body (white, middleand working-class) and the absence of a transformed curriculum (that is to say, little or no attention to women and ethnic minorities) in lower-divison courses. Because of the emphasis on ethical questioning and the hope that students will achieve the sort of ethical maturity that will allow them to clarify values on a wide range of value levels—both personal and public—many techniques for involving students actively in their learning are included: large and small group discussions, response papers, a self-evaluation essay, collaborative book reviews and seminar papers.

Catherine Udall, Arizona State University. "Gertrude Bonnin's Feminist Approach to Indian Reform."

Gertrude Simmons Bonnin was an important figure in American Indian activism in the early part of this century. While her goal was opportunity for all American Indians, male and female alike, her most effective reform work was either aimed at or carried out with the assistance of other women. While Bonnin most likely did not see herself as a feminist, she held the idea that women should play an important role in the advancement of American Indians long before she began her work as an activist. This study examines this theme in her early fictional writings and correspondence, discusses her work among the women of the Uintah and Ouray Reservation, her proposals for reforming the federal Indian system, and her important association with the General Federation of Women's Clubs of America.

Respondent: Louise Mayo, County College of Morris.

These four papers are fine examples of the richness in the field of ethnic women's studies. At a time when conservatives have mounted a concerted attack against such "frills," these presenters once again illustrate the multiplicity of approaches possible in this area. Keith and Simon-Smolinski have shown that multiethnic interdisciplinary course in women's studies can successfuly appeal to a largely white, lower-middle class student body. We could all benefit from sharing their reading lists. Clemmer has presented us with an intriguing taste of her larger project dealing with Native American women's autobiographies. Her provocative discussion of the paradox of education for any group which seeks both to preserve its own culture and succeed in the larger society leads to further questions and anticipation of the full study. The two historical papers by Udall and Yee show that similar issues have long existed in the world. Gertrude Bonnin and the black women abolitionists sought to "uplift" their own people. Their struggles pose the further issue of the interrelationship and potential conflict between ideology and reality, an issue which may still be central. All of these papers indicate the outstanding work being done in this field and the potential for further study.

SESSION XIV: "Social Problems in Ethnic Communities"

Joseph W. Scott, University of Washington. "Social, Psychological, and Biological Forces Driving Black Teenage Pregnancy: A Causal Model."

Black teenage pregnancy is a product of unrealized desires, misdirected values, and fortuitous happenings of biology. Teenagers believe in, and strive for, "Love"; they negotiate sex, conjure up hopes and make plans for the future, but because they do not contracept successfully, biological forces interrupt the process which they have in mind and they do not necessarily realize their strivings or their plans.

Ella Phillips Lacey, Southern Illinois University. "Frameworks for Assessing Concerns of Adolescent Pregnancy."

It is perhaps due to a history that has included stereotyping, subjugation, and volatility between selected racial and ethnic groups, that associations involving race and/or ethnicity with health or social service problems are often regarded with bland acceptance rather than assessed critically. Such is the case with adolescent pregnancy. While trends for pregnancy are quite different between black and white adolescent females, our social milieu allows tacit acceptance of invalid pronouncements and generalizations. Despite the presence of data that shows a sustained pattern of decreased pregnancy rates among black adolescent females, there is a persistent notion that black adolescent pregnancies are continually climbing. Refutation of such a fallacy requires interdisciplinary consideration of the problem bases that underlie concerns about adolescent pregnancy including economic, social, moral, and racial perspectives. Consideration of actual trends are supplemented with vignettes in problem framing. The paper provides frameworks for critical assessment of racially and ethnically inflamed issues of adolescent pregnancy.

Glen M. Kraig, California State University, San Bernardino. "Los Angeles Gang Violence: In Context."

This report examines the wave of gang violence that currently plagues Los Angeles County. It is divided into three parts. The first part examines the violence as it is and some of the antecedents of the current situation in order to give some perspective to the situation. The second part views the situation from a sociological perspective, suggesting some factors that cause and contribute to the situation. Finally, suggestions are made that could help to alleviate the problem.

SESSION XVI: "Ethnic Youth and Education."

Chair: James H. Williams, California State Polytechnic University, Pomona. C. Garn Coombs, Brigham Young University. **"Twelve Million Youth at**

Risk: Implications of Multicultural Education."

A million dropouts per year means that today from preschool to high school there are twelve million students who will become dropouts by the year 2000. A disproportionate number of these students are minority youth and children of poverty. Twenty years ago educators developed programs to help these students but the lessons were not learned, so today the nation has rediscovered youth at risk. The dropout problem extends beyond the public schools into higher education and teacher education and represents serious economic, social and political problems for our society. This is a problem that can no longer be ignored.

Silvester J. Brito, University of Wyoming. "Chicano Literature: Monitor of Stability and Change."

The purpose of this presentation is to examine the state and nature of contemporary Chicano literature in light of its past as well as its future in the western literary world. Within this context it can be postulated that Chicano literature is a viable vehicle for measuring stability and change of the ever developing Chicano community within the dominant ranks of Anglo-American society.

Elizabeth Whalley, San Francisco State University. "ESL Student Attitudes Towards Cross-Cultural Marriage."

Within the last forty years in modern societies there have been enormous changes in attitude toward premarital relations. One reason that attitudes in urban industrial societies have changed is that there is greater heterosexual contact on a day-to-day basis: more women are working outside the home, and more women are going to college and graduate school. Even in traditional societies there has been an increase in opportunity for premarital social contacts.

While research has been done on the changing attitudes of students around the world, for example, India and Taiwan, little has been done in the U.S. The research described here investigates the attitudes towards cross-cultural marriage held by ESL (English as a Second Language) college undergraduate students studying in the U.S.

Eighty-two students representing nine countries (Peru, Korea, Philippines, Turkey, Vietnam, Italy, Mexico and Poland) responded to the questionnaire. The participants, most of whom are permanentresidents or immigrants, were asked about their current social practices (e.g. "How often do you eat lunch with someone from another country?"), whether or not they would marry someone from a cultural background which is different from theirs and if their attitudes toward cross-cultural marriage are different from their parents.

Results showed striking differences between males and females. These results will are compared to attitudes held by a similar native English-speaking student population.

Audrey Wright, Seattle Central Community College. "Cultural Thought Patterns and Interdisciplinary Settings."

Respondent: James H. Williams, California State Polytechnic University, Pomona.

Coombs's presentation examines a most timely and critical topic. A sense of urgency and compassion is clearly exemplified in Coombs's presentation. Perhaps, the strongest aspect of this paper is the review of the literature on the subject. Certainly, all of the contemporary research on this issue presents a compelling cause for immediate action. The major weakness in Coombs' paper is his lack of details or specificity relative to creative ideas and/or solutions. The proposed ideas cited in his paper are somewhat superficial. A 1987 report titled "Caught in the Middle: Educational Reform for Young Adolescents in California Public Schools" was mentioned as one way to inpact the problem. The following statement was quoted from this report:

The cost of dropping out of school should become required reading for every

middle grade student. Those who can't read should have the data read to them.

This is a most absurd notion given the current psycho-social dynamics of inner city classrooms(K-12). The largest concentration of "atrisk students" reside in inner cities and large suburban communities. The proliferation of drugs and drug dealing, gang activities, and a very serious lack of self-esteem would render such an approach an exercise in futility.

The root cause of the problems which have placed minority youth at risk is racism. The time for story telling is over. Minority students do not need to have statistics read to them. Rather, those of us who profess to be learned, erudite humans must demand that curricula, K-12, help students acquire the knowledge, values, and skills they need, to participate in social change so that victimized and excluded thic and racial groups can become full participants in this society.

With reference to Brito's paper, H.L. Mencken once said that a great literature is chiefly the product of inquiring minds in revolt against the immovable certainties of the nation. Brito's opening statement validates this point. Brito asserts that "Chicano literature is like all its related genres, a written form attempting to express its peoples' needs, feelings and socio-historical development."

Chicano literature and folklore is dynamic and complex. One of the most exciting and challenging ways to learn about culture is to study the literature and folklore of that culture. One of the most significant points in this paper is that Chicano literature often reflects multicultural experiences which are nurtured in historical contexts.

Whalley's paper focused on a time honored and controversial subject — attitudes toward cross-cultural marriage. The significant contribution is that Whalley's study focused on ESL student attitudes. Historically, the most popular groups studied, in terms of cross-cultural marriage, have been marriage and marital attitudes between blacks and whites. Of equal significance is the possibility that the long term impact of cross-cultural marriages may result in a redefinition of such anthropological and psycho-political terms like race, ethnic groups, ethnicity and "people of color."

SESSION XVII: "Institutional Support for Ethnic Studies" Chair: Miguel Carranza, University of Nebraska.

P. Rudy Mattai, University of Tennessee at Martin. "Cultural Constraints to the Integration of Multicultural Education into the Curricula of Rural Southern Colleges and Universities."

Undoubtedly, the cultural mosaic of the American society is not very evident in the rural South. To a great extent, the cultural diversity that is manifested in the plurality of racial and ethnic groups is somehow unaccentuated and downplayed and is incredibly expressed in oversimplistic terms. The social stratification that follows is built primarily on an interesting duality, rural vs. urban and black vs. white. This duality is buttressed by place of birth, i.e. those who are born in the South are seen as special, if not ideal, inhabitants.

This school of thought is much more prevalent among Southern dwellers in the rural areas and has a tremendous influence on the formal educational institutions. Not only is the misconception that what is Anglo-American is in fact American an entrenched variable in the curriculum, but it is very evident in the thought-patterns of students and faculty alike. To further exacerbate the situation, there seems to be no great need to infuse multicultural components into the curriculum.

This paper examines some of the cultural constraints on the integration of multicultural education in the curricula of small rural Southern colleges and universities. It looks at ways in which these constraints may be dealt with and how continuing education units may be the vanguard in causing changes in thought processes amenable to multicultural aspects.

James A. Chambers, Washington State University. "Maximizing Institutional Support for Ethnic Programs."

Group identification and attitudes have had a significant impact on the public policies of American universities and colleges. However, ethnocentricity has bifurcated resources and policies and fostered ethnic alienation. This paper addresses the need for transition from the parochial course processes which differentiate and segment life experiences of the ethnic students to one which focuses on interest aggregation. The purpose is to more rationally effect university policies concerning ethnic studies.

Respondent: Margaret Duncan, Colorado State University.

Three papers, each concerned with structural and policy issues at various levels, were presented at this session. James Chambers, in "Maximizing Instititional Support for Ethnic Programs," advocates interest aggregation and coalition building among proponents of ethnic studies in order to achieve more rational policy in an era of scarce resources. Rudi Mattai presented a paper entitled "Cultural Constraints to the Integration of Multicultural Education into the Curricula of Rural Southern Colleges and Universities." Drawing extensively upon the literature, he addresses patterns of resistance to multicultural education in the South and recommends broader outreach by universities toward the infusion of multicultural values throughout the community. Sayed Mohammed Maulana, concerned with the transmission of cultural values through language, discusses creative teaching approaches, drawing upon the literature and his experience as an instructor of Ki Swahili at the University of Washington.

The introduction of a required course on American Cultures for all undergraduates of the University of California by 1993 was accompanied by an acknowledgement of demographic changes in the U.S. population. Optimistically, policy changes will result in increased resources and compatible structural arrangements to enusre that the rich cultural diversity and values among ethnic and other minorities will be transmitted in the classroom and beyond. A realistic appraisal of the experience of minority groups and the history of ethnic studies, however, suggests that the challenge is of enormous proportion, and will require serious and continuing work on the part of administrators and faculty nationally.

Chambers reminds us that attitude change must be measured and monitored. In discussing a survey of students at Portland State University, he warns that lapses into "old associations and attitudes" toward ethnic groups can occur among white students

after course completion. He concludes that a restructuring of programs within a policy framework which guards against the "one course is sufficient; our job is done" mentality is necessary. Educators will be interested not only in his argument and data but in his survey instrument as well. Mattai is equally concerned with attitude change. While he focuses on the Southern environment, his deeper exploration into the literature serves to remind us of the persistance of institutional patterns which are inimical to the transmission of multicultural values. Regardless of the region, it behooves us to take note of his investigation of "knowledge managers" who subconsciously or otherwise adhere to selective traditions and hidden curricula which serve narrow, racist values. Nativistic sentiments and support for "English only" legislation are not, after all, confined to the South. Nor is it sufficient to limit ourselves to achieving some degree of attitude change among students. Rather, Mattai suggests that the onus is on faculty and administrators to work through Continuing Education and other outreach programs to effect change among religious and civic groups, business organizations, and other entities. Supplanting one selective tradition with a newer, broader one is a difficult task in any part of the country. Maulana, in reviewing traditional learning methods, urges educators to provide varieties of learning activities, including role playing drama, and interpretation. Videos of students enacting family gatherings, weddings and other activities provide vehicles for students to "feel" a part of a culture at the same time that they are learning about it. The result is inspiring and leads us back to Chambers's and Mattai's concerns about enduring attitude change pursuant to exposure to multicultural values. As involved as we must be in the policy issues confronting us, creative energy within the classroom infuses an enthusiasm for learning. Optimistically, enthusiasm among students will reinforce the movement for structural change at the policy making levels.

Maulana, in reviewing the development of Ki Swahili as a major language of Sub-Saharan Africa, reminds us that it embraces inherited and adopted parts. So it is with the national experience of this country. We have inevitably inherited and adopted parts of our culture from one another — in music, language, laughter, and perception. The challenge, so long after the fact, is that of positive recognition and transmission. The insights and recommendations of each of these papers represent serious contributions to our understanding and strategies.

SESSION XVIII: "American Indians: Religion and Society." Chair: Gretchen M. Bataille, Arizona State University

Richard F. Fleck, State University of New York, Cortland. "Sacredness of Mountains in Native American Cultures."

Walter Yeeling Evans-Wentz' study *Cuchama and Sacred Mountains* (1981) has explored the signifance of Mount Cuchama to the Indians of southern California and northern Mexico and mountains in general to people around the globe. As the Himalayas are sacred to the religions of Asia, the mountains throughout North America hold sacred meaning for tribes from coast to coast. This paper concentrates on four different but representative mountainous regions in America not examined by Evans-Wentz from the Southwest to the Northeast in light of their spiritual significance to the Hopi, Puyallup, Lakota, and Penobscot peoples of Arizona, Washington, South Dakota, and Maine respectively.

Some conjecture is given regarding the nature of mountains around the globe (including Fuji San and Kilimanjaro) and specifically in North America which enhances a strong spiritual bond with humanity. While the Hopi and other tribes fully express that universality engendered by mountains, they lend to this universal spiritualism a rich sense of the specific locale.

Elmer R. Rusco, University of Nevada, Reno. "Self-Determination for Indians: The Case of the Western Shoshone."

United States law uniquely recognizes the semi-sovereign status of Native American societies within the American polity. Yet the United States government reserves to itself the right to determine which governments of Indian societies to recognize. In recent years the Western Shoshone Nation has been organized to speak for the first time for all Western Shoshones. There remains a question of whether the federal government will acknowledge the validity of this new government, but meanwhile the nation has received some recognition in one area. It is now (although possibly only temporarily) regulating the hunting and fishing of members of the Nation within the territory covered by the Ruby Valley Treaty of 1863. How this has come about and what it portends for the sovereignty of Native American societies within the United States are of considerable importance.

Respondent: Donald Tyree, Portland State University.

SESSION XIX: "Consolidating Ethnic Studies Programs." Chair: Joseph W. Scott, University of Washington.

David Mielke, Appalachian State University. "The Appalachian State University Appalachian Studies Master's Degree Program as a Model for Other Ethnic Studies Master's Degree Programs."

The last ten years have witnessed the demise of ethnic studies to an almost "caretaker" level. Appalachian State University has designed and implemented a unique master's degree program in Appalachian studies which the author maintains is applicable to approaches in other ethnic studies. The success of this program lies in its interdisciplinary approach and the uniqueness of the administrative and academic structure of the Appalachian studies faculty and department. This paper examines the program in terms of rationale, structure, resources, and implementation. It then offers some prescriptive solutions for application in other ethnic studies.

Joseph W. Scott, Erasmo Gamboa, Tetsuden Kashima, and Albert Black, University of Washington. "Consolidating at the University of Washington."

SESSION XX: "Stereotypical Images and Marginality in Media." Chair: Helen MacLam, CHOICE Magazine.

Harold Hatt, Phillips Graduate Theological Seminary. "From Marginalization to Participation: Racial and Gender Entrapment in *The Border* and *Ft. Apache, the Bronx.*"

This presentation uses film clips to examine two film characters who attempt to help a victim of racial and gender entrapment: Charlie Smith in *The Border* (Tony Richardson, 1982) and Officer Murphy in *Fort Apache, the Bronx* (Daniel Petrie, 1981). These two characters are studied first in terms of their relation to the system and then in terms of their relation to the individual whom they sought to help. The paper then undertakes a theological reflection on reasons for the failure of their efforts. The conclusion is that help for individuals is not adequate without systematic transformation from marginalization to participation.

Anthony J. Cortese, Illinois State University. "Copy-Cats and Primitives: Images of Ethnic Minorities in Advertising."

It has been ten years since the publication of *Gender Advertisements*, Erving Goffman's revealing analysis of how depictions of masculinity and feminity function socially through advertising. Goffman, in his dramaturgical approach, exposed a symbolic type of sexism and demonstrated how the structure of gender inequality is often subtlely expressed. This research examines the presence of symbolic racism and explores the patterns of ethnic and racial stratification that exist in advertising. Borrowing Goffman's concepts of relative size, function ranking, ritualization of subordination, and licensed withdrawal, the present analysis utilizes a slide presentation presenting advertisements to apply and expand on these concepts.

This critical and dramaturgical approach indicates that ethnic and racial minorities tend to be portrayed as "Copy-Cats" or "Primitives" in advertising. The Copy-Cat image refers to how minorities conform to Anglo standards of beauty or "ideal" femininity or masculinity. Accordingly, the uniqueness of the black, Chicano, and Asian cultures is denied in an attempt to copy Anglo culture. These types of ads are examined from the models of assimilation, acculturation, and integration. The image of the primitive is set in sharp contrast to that of the copy-cat. Here the minority is presented as savage and untamed, with features that set him or her apart from white society. Racial characterstics and ethnic heritages are exploited; there is an attempt to socially distance minorities from Anglo culture. These types of ads are analyzed from the models of pluralism, domination and domestic colonialism. Finally, sex differences within ethnic minorities are studied to examine the extent of gender stratification.

Respondent: S.E. Solberg, University of Washington.

The theological imperative explicit in Harold Hatt's paper demands an ultimate restructuring of society brought about by a radical moral restructuring of the individual. Anthony Cortese's slide presentation of ethnic images drawn from American advertising of the twentieth century provided an implicit call for "consumer action" as evidenced by the immediate question from the floor, "What can we do about

this?"

Both presentations were "value loaded," that is, they implicitly posited the possibilities of a better or ideal world in which the venealities of greed, selfishness and personal weakness would be transcended. The striking difference of course is that the theological imperative requires a total restructuring both social and personal; the implicit call evoked from the advertising images is to immediate effective action. My initial reaction to the two representations was pragmatic, too often when we talk about radical restructurings it is at the loss of immediate, effective action — peoplestarve and die while jurisdictions and responsibilities are being settled. On the other hand, in the face of the gross insensitivity of our consumer society as evidenced in its advertising, the piece by piece pallative does not seem enough. And sure enough, an anticapitalist, Marxist imperative began to inform a part of the discussion. This has all led to some after the fact musings.

We too often speak to each other with implicit understandings that are either unintelligible to outsiders or are seen as hidden agendas. We have shared assumptions, shared understandings, to some extent, shared experiences that inform the camaraderie and facilitate communications within a setting such as a NAES Conference. The question is how do we share those perceptions with a larger audience, student or general?

The difficulty was illustrated in the media images chosen for illustration here, in the quick and easy co-option of valid and important themes by Hollywood, by the playing on unexpressed fears and desires with images that border on the pornographic while maintaining a stance (sometimes quite sophisticated) that is socially and politically proper for the moment. Wealth, a facile sophistication in the manipulation of images, an amoral sense of what willsell and no compunction in cannibalizing and trivializing other people's "treasures," spiritual, phsychological, literary, to their own ends.

There are obviously two needs that have to be met: first, an academic or scholarly agenda to understand how this manipulation of valid themes or ethnic images takes place as well as the power of the bastardized image in the greater society, and second, a moral or ethical agenda that says why this is an evil (the Christian ethic is not the only one outthereafter all) and what needs to be done about it. Too often we take the second as a given while pursuing the first. Both need to be stated in order to sharpen and focus discussions, both within and without a shared community of interests.

Contributors

ROBERTA J. ASTROFF teaches in the School of Journalism and Mass Communication at the University of Wisconsin, Madison.

ROBERT A. BAUKUS is an Assistant Professor of Advertising and Marketing and Social Science Research at Penn State University. He has published extensively in argumentativeness and political communication and is currently working on research in advertising and the mass media.

JAMES BRACY is a professor of Pan African Studies at California State University, Northridge.

HELEN M. CASTILLO teaches in the School of Nursing at Vanderbilt University.

MARGARET A. LAUGHLIN is an Associate Professor of Education at the University of Wisconsin, Green Bay, and is a frequent contributor to *Explorations in Ethnic Studies*.

DAVID MCBRIDE is an Associate Professor in the Departments of History and Afro-American and African Studies at the State University of New York at Binghamton. McBride has authored numerous publications, most recently *Integrating the City of Medicine: Blacks in Philadelphia Health Care, 1910-1965* (1989).

THERESA E. MCCORMICK teaches multicultural education in the Department of Secondary Education, Iowa State University.

J. GREGORY PAYNE is Chair and Associate Professor of the Department of Communication Studies at Emerson College. He is also Director of the News Study Group at Emerson and has written articles and lectured on political communication, docudrama, ethics and public policy. He is the co-author of *Tom Bradley; The Impossible Dream* and the author of *Mayday: Kent State.*

SCOTT C. RATZAN is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Communication and Theatre at Boston College. He is also a consultant and researcher for the Emerson College and New York University News Study Groups, and has lectured and written extensively on ethics, public policy and politics. He is the co-author of *Tom Bradley: The Impossible Dream.*

CELIA J. WINTZ is on the faculty of Houston Community college, and is a doctoral candidate in nursing research at Texas Women's University.

Notes for Contributors

Explorations in Ethnic Studies is a multi-disciplinary, nonspecialized, international journal devoted to the study of ethnicity, ethnic groups, intergroup relations, methodological considerations, theoretical concerns, and the cultural life of ethnic minorities. *Explorations* is a forum for the exchange of ideas.

The editorial staff welcomes manuscripts integrating theory and practice; the staff is equally interested in receiving manuscripts which are exploratory in nature. Contributors should note carefully the following procedures for submissions.

- A. Manuscripts must be typewritten, double-spaced (including notes) and are not to exceed twenty pages (including notes).
- B. *Explorations* publishes neither bibliographies nor reference lists with articles.

C. Notes should conform to the humanities style as found in the *Chicago Manual of Style*, as follows:

Book	¹ Tomás Rivera. <i>Y No Se Lo Tragó La Tierra</i> . (Berkeley: Justa, 1977), 55.
Journal Article	² Orlin Malicher. "A Role for Social Workers in the Con- sumer Movement," <i>Social Work</i> 18 (January, 1973): 65-66.
Newsletter Article	³ James H. Williams. "Ethnicity and Human Rights: Raising the National Consciousness," <i>NAIES Newsletter</i> 5 (October, 1980): 19.
Newspaper Article	⁴ Jack Slater. "Where are all the Blacks in Ballet?" Los Angeles Times, 8 June 1980.
Article in a Book	⁵ Lawrence Kohlberg. "Stage and Sequence: The Cognitive- Developmental Approach to Socialization," in <i>Handbook</i> of Socialization, ed. D. Goslin (New York: Rand McNally, 1969), 347-580.
Thesis/Dissertation	⁶ Michael G. Karni. "'Yhteishyra'—or For the Common Good: Finnish Radicalism in the Western Great Lakes Region 1900-1940" (Ph.D. diss, University of Minnesota, 1975), 115-195.
Multiple Authors	List all Names of up to three authors. Use first author's name and <i>et al.</i> for more than three authors.
Subsequent References	⁷ <i>Ibid.</i> (follows immediately) ⁸ Williams, 20. (otherwise)
Additionally	⁹ Informational notes are acceptable.

- D. Submit four copies of manuscript with author name(s) appearing on a separate page.
- E. Clip proper postage to self-addressed envelope.
- F. Authors must be members of the Association when their works appear in the journal.

All submissions for *Explorations in Ethnic Studies* are referred by two or more persons, and it usually takes two months for the readers' reports.

Submit all materials to: Gretchen M. Bataille, Editor NAES Publications Department of English Arizona State University Tempe, AZ 85287-0302

Patrons of the Association

Afro-American Studies Smith College

College of Liberal Arts and Sciences Arizona State University

Department of Ethnic Studies Bowling Green State University

El Centro Hispanic Student Service Colorado State University

Ethnic and Women's Studies California State Polytechnic University

Ethnic Studies Center California State University, Sacramento

Institute for Ethnic Studies University of Nebraska, Lincoln

Institut za Narodnostna Vprasanja Ljubljana, Yugoslavia