**JSTAE REVIEW FORM**

Please evaluate this submission according to the criteria in the appropriate rubric. ­­­­There are two rubrics here – the first is for traditional submission and the second one is for the shorter submissions, photo essays, multi-media pieces, etc.

If appropriate and useful, your ratings and comments may be sent to the author. Please do not include any identifying information in this review form.   
**Not all criteria listed will apply to every submission**. **Please complete one rubric and the comments section on page 3.**

**Traditional Journal Submissions**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Criteria | Excellent | Good | Fair | Poor | N/A |
| Appropriateness for JSTAE, as a **traditional paper** |  |  |  |  |  |
| Conciseness and brevity |  |  |  |  |  |
| Importance to Art Education |  |  |  |  |  |
| Conceptualization of topic |  |  |  |  |  |
| Strength of argumentation |  |  |  |  |  |
| Provocative, challenging |  |  |  |  |  |
| Coherently organized |  |  |  |  |  |
| Originality |  |  |  |  |  |
| Knowledge and application of literature |  |  |  |  |  |
| Data collection procedures |  |  |  |  |  |
| Data interpretation/analysis procedures |  |  |  |  |  |
| Application of theory |  |  |  |  |  |
| Grammar, structure, mechanics |  |  |  |  |  |
| Quality of illustrations, figures, tables |  |  |  |  |  |
| APA Formatting |  |  |  |  |  |

**Shorter/Creative Submissions**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Criteria | Excellent | Good | Fair | Poor | N/A |
| Appropriateness for JSTAE, as a **creative**  **submission** |  |  |  |  |  |
| Importance to Art Education |  |  |  |  |  |
| Conceptualization of topic |  |  |  |  |  |
| Provocative, challenging |  |  |  |  |  |
| Coherently organized |  |  |  |  |  |
| Originality and creativity |  |  |  |  |  |
| Application of literature or theory |  |  |  |  |  |
| Grammar, structure, mechanics |  |  |  |  |  |
| Quality of images, video, audio, figures,  tables |  |  |  |  |  |
| Relationship of visuals to text |  |  |  |  |  |
| APA Formatting |  |  |  |  |  |

**Comments for the Author:**